

“To be in or out, that is not the question” – Confucian eyes in Daoist body in Late Chosŏn period

KIM Daeyeol 金大烈

INALCO (Paris)

Asia Research Team (ASIEs)

Contents

- Confucian concerns
- Inclusivism
- Ideal being and society
- B. & T. Scriptures as open text
- Conclusion

Confucian concerns

- Humanism

- Value and action of human beings

- 逍遙 (unworldliness, 至人) → 自適

(free and quiet life, 大人) (南華經註解
刪補, 逍遙遊)

Confucian concerns

- Moralism

- Primacy of moral values on other values

- 仁義之端, 是非之途, 樊然散亂, 吾惡能知其辯. → 至於善惡, 奚獨無辨, 好善惡惡, 人之性也. (南華經註解刪補, 齊物論)

Confucian concerns

- Traditionalism

- Commitment to the values of the past handed down by tradition

- “陳大猷以為佛老之學凝神坐忘亦幾於‘德修罔覺’，惟不知‘監先王成憲’。夫以凝神坐忘為幾於德修，是正所謂欲治其心而外天下國家者。其身已半入佛老中矣又安得以非之哉。”（尚書思辨錄，說命（下），6章）。

Confucian concerns

- Pragmatism

- search for practicality, application to reality
- “任是非” (detachment / contemplation) → “天理之公” (impartiality of Principle) (南華經註解刪補, 齊物論)

Inclusivism

- « Other sets of beliefs are partially true »
- Rational choice of ideas from other traditions
 - “如老莊之說，雖舛聖人大法，又不至都無可採。”（西溪集，書，答尹子仁書）。

Inclusivism

- Search for Confucian truth in B or T texts
 - 道, 無 = 體, 理 ; 名, 有 = 用, 象 (新註
道德經, 1章註)

Inclusivism

- Search for an alternative to *Noron's* rigid dogmatism
 - 道, 樸, 質 = 體 ; 名, 禮, 文 = 用 → 文質彬彬.
 - “夫禮者忠信之薄而亂之首, 前識者道之華而愚之始” → “文勝質衰而刑辟多. ... 多識前古以爲禮, 而不知非道之實, 既以自愚, 又愚後人, 故曰愚之始.” (新註道德經, 38章註)

Inclusivism

- 修己治人
 - “老子 ... 其道誰不合聖人之法, 其意亦欲修身治人” (新註道德經, 序)
- 內聖外王
 - “內篇七, ... 第六, 第七篇言有是德有是道而後可以爲君師也” (南華經註解刪補, 內篇總論)

Ideal being and society

- Common respect for ideal being or highly virtuous person : 達者, 通人, 上人, ...

Ideal being and society

- Common truth in highest level :
 - 按言“魚各造乎水而已, 無問流之大小; 人各造乎道而已, 無問方之內外. ... 遊道術者, 忘彼此.” (南華經註解刪補, 大宗師)
 - “道之樞要在乎是矣. 樞者, 環中之物. 得道之樞以環中而應是非之無窮, 則是非誰無窮而其所以應之者沛乎, 其有餘矣.” (南華經註解刪補, 齊物論)

Ideal being and society

- Common good

– “天下之善己不獨有，必與人而共之，所謂公而不私者是也。盖天下事一致同歸而殊道百慮。... 天下之人將無不各自以其善而來爭進之於我，助我爲善。” (孟子思辨錄，公孫牟(上)).

– “聖人待人之厚，而與人爲善之意，本自如此，何嘗如今人迫隘偏狹，視若怨敵之爲也” (西溪集，書，答申監司翼相書)

Ideal being and society

- Model for government : “Great Center” 皇極 or “Perfect equilibrium” 中正
 - “... 而有善其顏色, 自言好德者, 則君亦錫之以福, 開其向善之路, 此又與人爲善之一事, 如此則是人者 ... 盖王者寬廣樂善, 納人於中正之則者如此, 使民日遷善而不自知者, 此之謂也.” (尚書思辨錄, 洪範).

In Catalogs :

B. & T. Scriptures as open text

- Descriptions in detail on books informations such as strong points and weak points
- Details on compilation
- Contents
- Printed books in circulation
- Commentaries

Government compilations

- 海東文獻總錄 (金然, 1638)
- 圭章總目 (徐浩修, 1781)
- 午板考 (徐有子, 1796)
- In general : Review faithful to contents rather than critical attitude
- On Taoist books : impartial and objective attitude
- On Buddhist books : introduce excellence of Korean Buddhist books. Objective attitude.

Private compilations

- 洪氏讀書錄 (洪奭周, 1810)
- On Taoist books : expresses his usual opinion without any kind of filter.
- On Buddhist books : considerable praise, objective description ; critical against not Buddha's teaching but its degeneration.

Conclusion

- Commentaries out of a comprehensive thinking common with Confucianism. Confucian thought had already an inherent possibility to share some viewpoints with Buddhism and Taoism.
- Buddhist or Taoist scriptures provided themselves as “open text”.