Proportions vs dimensions: shedding a different light on the analysis of 3D datasets

J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP



Computer Applications in Archaeology 2019 - Kraków



Models and Simulations for Architecture and the Heritage





Survey protocols : acquisition and processing of raw 3D data

Photogrammetry, laser scanning, image-based modelling, etc.

Information visualisation : providing tools for reasoning on historical evidence, spotting trends and exceptions.

J.Y.Blaise, I.Dudek - Concentric Time: Enabling Context + Focus Visual Analysis of Architectural Changes Foundations of Intelligent Systems, M. Kryszkiewicz, H. Rybinski, A. Skowron, W. Raś (Ed.), Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, ISBN 978-3-642-21915-3, ISSN 0302-9743, pp. 632-641





Focuses on depicting one particular item, with exhaustiveness, from the point of view of its geometrical features Focuses on helping analysts to investigate a collection of items, to cross-examine data (beyond geometrical features)

J.Y.Blaise, I.Dudek - *Concentric Time: Enabling Context + Focus Visual Analysis of Architectural Changes* Foundations of Intelligent Systems, M. Kryszkiewicz, H. Rybinski, A. Skowron, W. Raś (Ed.), Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, ISBN 978-3-642-21915-3, ISSN 0302-9743, pp. 632-641





The "observation" side

The "abstraction" side

J.Y.Blaise, I.Dudek - Concentric Time: Enabling Context + Focus Visual Analysis of Architectural Changes Foundations of Intelligent Systems, M. Kryszkiewicz, H. Rybinski, A. Skowron, W. Raś (Ed.), Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, ISBN 978-3-642-21915-3, ISSN 0302-9743, pp. 632-641



Bedrock observations founding this experiment:



> a growing capacity of academics to produce large 3D datasets

> the emergence of low-cost survey techniques

> with that renewed capacity a methodological question is raised : what interpretation lines, what sensemaking opportunities does that move open?





J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP





Bedrock observations founding this experiment:

> a growing capacity of academics to produce large 3D datasets

> the emergence of low-cost survey techniques

> with that renewed capacity a methodological question is raised : what interpretation lines, what sensemaking opportunities does that move open?









Bedrock observations founding this experiment:

> a growing capacity of academics to produce large3D datasets

> the emergence of low-cost survey techniques

> with that renewed capacity a methodological question is raised : what interpretation lines, what sensemaking opportunities does that move open?

This is basically a « proof of worthiness » experiment

investigating the feasibility and added value of using a low-res, low-cost, "amateur" 3D point cloud in order to re-read pieces of architecture through simple **proportions**, **ratios** and **geometric relations**, in other words in order to **extract architectural features for comparisons**.



outline

- Terminological disambiguation
- On proportions (briefly)
 - The use of proportions in architecture over time
 - Proportions as prescriptions vs. proportions as an analytical tool
- The experiment –29 rural, « non-elaborate » chapels
 - Acquisition and data extraction step: building on the MAP unit's Aïoli experimental platform
 - Analysis step: some infovis-inspired solutions
- Future works: the SESAMES research programme



J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP

Terminological disambiguation: proportions (vs.?) ratios

In Vitrivius' ten books of architecture

"The design of a temple depends on **symmetry**, the principles of which must be most carefully observed by the architect. They are **due to proportion**, in Greek ἀναλογία. Proportion is a **correspondence among the measures of the members of an entire work**, and of the whole to a certain part selected as standard.

http://www.hellenicaworld.com/Greece/Literature/Vitruvius/en/Architecture.html#Page_69 [last visited 08/04/2019]



Correspondence of the measures of an entire column, in relation with a « standard » : the module (bottom radius of the shaft)

> E. Barberot Aide mémoire de l'architecte et du constructeur Ch. Béranger 1922



In Vitrivius' ten books of architecture

"The design of a temple depends on **symmetry**, the principles of which must be most carefully observed by the architect. They are **due to proportion**, in Greek $\dot{\alpha}v\alpha\lambda\sigma\gamma\dot{\alpha}$. Proportion is a **correspondence among the measures of the members of an entire work**, and of the whole to a certain part selected as standard.

http://www.hellenicaworld.com/Greece/Literature/Vitruvius/en/Architecture.html#Page_69 [last visited 08/04/2019]



intercolumniation in relation with a certain part, a « standard » : dimension D (module)

C.R Harris , Illustrated dictionary of historic architecture Dover Publications 1983



In Vitrivius' ten books of architecture

"The design of a temple depends on **symmetry**, the principles of which must be most carefully observed by the architect. They are **due to proportion**, in Greek $\dot{\alpha}\nu\alpha\lambda\sigma\gamma\dot{\alpha}$. Proportion is a **correspondence among the measures of the members of an entire work**, and of the whole to a certain part selected as standard.

http://www.hellenicaworld.com/Greece/Literature/Vitruvius/en/Architecture.html#Page_69 [last visited 08/04/2019]

In Two Kinds of Proportion by Matthew A Cohen

Introduction to "Objects of Belief: Proportional Systems in the History of Architecture" Special collection of Architectural Histories, the EAHN (European Architectural History Network) international, blind peer-reviewed scholarly journal. https://journal.eahn.org/articles/10.5334/ah.bv/ [last visited 08/04/2019]

Proportion can refer to **ratios**, or it can refer to **architectural beauty**. In this introduction to the papers that follow, Matthew A. Cohen proposes a simple clarification of this ambiguity as a framework for continued discussion of this subject: that whenever scholars use the word proportion, they specify whether they intend **'proportion-as-ratio'** or **'proportion-as-beauty'**.



Terminological disambiguation: proportions vs. ratios

What will be intended in what follows intend is 'proportion-as-ratio'



Summary of the San Lorenzo [Basilica San Lorenzo in Florence, 1424 > Filippo Brunelleschi] nave arcade bay proportional system (spread between two drawings for clarity).

Cohen, M.A., 2014. Introduction: Two Kinds of Proportion. Architectural Histories, 2(1), p.Art. 21. DOI: http://doi.org/10.5334/ah.bv



J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP

On proportions : use over time



A (very) quick overview of when they mattered

Rome : Vitruvius







4/3

4/5

Romanesque period: simple ratios

L'église cistercienne " ad quadratum ", dessinée par Villard de Honnecourt (XIII" siècle), est régie par des proportions musicales. Son plan est contenu dans un rectangle qui est un triple double carré (3/2), correspondant à la quinte. Son chœur (4/3) représente la quarte ; chaque bras de transept (4/2) est associé à l'octave, ainsi que le transept entier (8/4). Le croisement de la nef et du transept est un carré (4/4), symbole de l'unité. La nef enfin évoque la tierce (5/4).

T. Hatot Bâtisseurs au Moyen-Age. L'instant Durable 1999





Renaissance period: Brunellechi's Cappella dei Pazzi

G.Fanelli Brunelleschi





Up to modernist architecture

Le Corbusier's Villa Stein

Le Corbusier et la méditerranée Editions Parenthèses / Musées de Marseille 1987





Proportions as quantitative relations to be applied by builders ,

Proportions as a *prescription*

Le Corbusier's Modulor

Fondation Le Corbusier http://www.fondationlecorbusier.fr Le Modulor, sans lieu © FLC/ADAGP Retrieved 17-04-2019



Re-reading, analysing choices made by builders,

Proportions as an *analytical tool*

Ratios are here used in retrospect, as a tool in analysing Brunelleschi's design

G.Fanelli Brunelleschi





Re-reading, analysing choices made by builders,

Proportions as an *analytical tool*

These 3 triangular figures are used by Viollet Le Duc to back up his theory, or observations, on one specific edifice.

> E. Viollet Le Duc *Entretiens sur l'Architecture* Éditions Pierre Mardaga 1977 (ed.orig 1863)





COUPE DE LA CATHEDRALE D'AMIENS

51

Re-reading, analysing choices made by builders,

Proportions as an *analytical tool*

But such triangular figures can also be used to question the homogeneity (or heterogeneity) of a set of comparable edifices.

E. Viollet Le Duc Coupe de la nef de la cathédrale d'Alby. Issue du Dictionnaire raisonné de l'architecture française du XIe au XVIe siècle, par Eugène Viollet-Le-Duc, 1856.







Senlis 1145



Amiens- 1220





J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP



Reims 1211

Chartres 1194

Strasbourg 1190 Paris 1163 Soissons 1176

• • •

width



reading a whole collection.





Correlation with period of construction

On this subset, a tendency to build higher naves, but that does NOT sum up what can be observed: the « lowest » nave is a « recent » one.

Analysing, through visual means, ratios, proportions, figures, does not necessarily mean coming to an assertive conclusion, but rather working on comparisons, providing food for thinking.



Computer Applications in Archaeology 2019 - Kraków



Santa Maria Novella (Alberti, Florence 1458 >) Analysis by R.Wittkower « Architectural principles in the age of Humanism » Academy Editions 1998 (first ed. 1949) > proportions can be an effective, rewarding lecture grid when observing « elaborate » pieces of architecture.

But can they be of any benefit when observing small-scale vernacular architecture? What exactly is there to uncover in that particular context?



> proportions can be an effective, rewarding lecture grid when observing « elaborate » pieces of architecture.

But can it be of any benefit when observing small-scale vernacular architecture? What exactly is there to uncover in that particular context?

That is precisely an issue that the emergence of lightweight, low-cost survey techniques allows us to address.

No claim that this experiment did help uncover signifiant trends in terms of « ways of building », but a confirmation that there is a line of research within reach.











The experiment – 29 rural, « non-elaborate » chapels

Context: a short-term research programme called « Territographie » questionning the applicability and scientific added-value of the *citizen science* paradigm in the documentation and analysis of minor heritage items.

< territographie.map.cnrs.fr >



A concern for different collections

As part of the initiative, the idea that a low cost protocol for the acquisition of raw 3D data, including through citizen contributions, could be tried out.



The experiment – 29 rural, « non-elaborate » chapels

Context: a short-term research programme called « Territographie » questionning the applicability and scientific added-value of the *citizen science* paradigm in the documentation and analysis of minor heritage items.

< territographie.map.cnrs.fr >



A concern for different collections

As part of the initiative, the idea that a low cost protocol for the acquisition of raw 3D data, including through citizen contributions, could be tried out.

> A baseline choice : photographic captors,





Acquisition and data extraction step : builds on the Aïoli collaborative platform

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui

www.aioli.cloud

A reality-based 3D "annotation" platform (collaborative annotation of 3D regions in point clouds).

The application generates a 3D point cloud from photographs, which can then be annotated.

Based on two technological developments: > photogrammetry techniques, (computing of a 3D model by correlation of images) > massive processing and sharing gathered data through the cloud.



> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui

3D "regions" (subsets of the point cloud) can be isolated and annotated in the 3D space

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui

And the result reprojected on each photograph used to compute the point cloud3D

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui

In this experiment we make use of another feature : retrieving "relative dimensions", i.e. quantities that will be saved as ratios (and not as metric information)

The ratios selected

> Proportions of Facade

H1/W1 H2/W1

J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP

The ratios selected

> Proportions of Facade

H1/W1 H2/W1

> Facade vs. bell tower

BW/W1 (widths)

BH/H2 (heights)

The ratios selected

> Proportions of Facade

H1/W1

H2/W1

> Facade vs. bell tower

BW/W1 (widths)

BH/H2 (heights)

> Surface of openings vs. of Facade

S1/S2

S3/S2

	۲	(augu	۲		D		D		D	net)	D		D		D		D	0		Chaudol)		(esse)	D		
	Chapelle Saint Pierre	barres chapelle du Saint-Esprit (Baum	Saint-Julien-en-Beauchêne	Chapelle Saint Blaise	Beaujeu	chapelle Saint Sebastien	Brignoles	prieuré Notre-Dame	Brue-Auria c	chapelle Saint Jean (vieux Can	Le Cannet-des-Maures	chapelle Saint-Antoine	Ceillac	Chapelle Saint Sébastien	Digne les bains	Chapelle Notre-Dame-de-Santé	Entrevennes	Chapelle Saint Jean	Le Brusquet	Chapelle Saint Raphael (Haut (La Javie	Chapelle Saint Joseph (Mande	Le Lauzet-Ubaye		
0	_									1		1							>	Pro	por	tion	s of	Faca	de
																		/	> F	aca	de v	s. be	ell to	wer	•
0			<u> </u>																						
																		/	>	Sur	face	of c	pen	ings	
0																									

> Proportions of Facade

Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice

exception

elle du Saint-Esprit (B pelle Saint Roch (Her nt-Julien-en-Beauché elle Saint Christol Chapelle Saint Pierre apelle Saint Joseph elle Saint-Honora apelle Saint Jaume re-Dame de Cathe Notre Dame de napelle Saint Blaise - Les Amands pelle Saint-Cyriad apelle Saint Miche oelle Saint Pierre elle Saint-Dona belle Notre-Dar hapelle Saint Ra pelle Saint-An Saint Sé Chapelle Notre-Da Chapelle Saint Je Lauzet Ubaye pelle N.D des gne les bains elle Saint . Cannet-dese Dam saugr trends, similarities

Visual solutions designed on purpose.

lays the information down, helps identifying exceptions and trends, similarities.

Patterns corresponding to the collection as a whole require other visual solutions.

		Gnwn						anne	Canne urt Ch de ys																						
	Chapelle Saint Pierre	Barles chapelle du Saint-Esprit (Ba	Saint-Julien-en-Beauchêne	Chapelle Saint Blaise Beauleu	chapelle Saint Sebastien	Brignoles	prieuré Notre-Dam e Brue-Auriac	chapelle Saint Jean (vieux C Le Cannet-des-Maures	chapelle Sairt-Antoine Ceillac	Chapelle Saint Sébastien Digne les bains	Chapelle Notre-Dame-de-S. Entrevennes	Chapelle Saint Jean Le Brusquet	Chapelle Saint Raphael (Ha La Javie	Chapelle Saint Joseph (Mar Le Lauzet-Ubaye	chapelle Saint-Cyriaque Le Val	chapelle Sairt-Honorat Lorgues	Chapelle Saint Jaume Lorgues	Chapelle Saint Michel Lurs	Notre-D ame de Cathelières Mallemoisson	Chapelle Notre-Dame de Lli Mézel	Chapelle Saint Christol Mirabeau	Eglise Notre Dame de la Ba Mison - Les Armands	Chapelle Saint-Donat Montfort	Chapelle Saint Pierre Pierrerue	Saint Patrice Pierrevert	Chapelle Saint Roch (Heyre Prads-Haute-Bléone	Notre Dam e des Cham ps Selonnet	Chapelle N.D. des roses Valserres			
0					1			•																	-						
0									•	•																					
0																															

i 🕐 🕐 🔇

Reading of clusters

Computer Applications in Archaeology 2019 - Kraków

Visualisation of ratios, collection reading

A distribution plot on bell tower proportions in comparison to façade proportions

Visualisation of ratios, collection reading

A distribution plot on bell tower proportions in comparison to façade proportions

This diagonal: homothetic relations (A most unusual situation)

Summary and perspectives

What we have done up has more to do with **delineating a playground** than with actually uncovering signifiant trends in terms of « ways of building »,

The experiment acts as a confirmation that there is a challenge now within reach: experimenting low-cost, lightweight survey techniques that can help analysts rethink the way they get hold of, and cross examine, 3D data seen as hints about ways of building.

Of course the whole approach does NOT require the computing of a 3D point cloud – only, having it is a mean to go back to the source, and somehow make of the 3D point cloud a repurposable content.

J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP

Summary and perspectives

 Persective 30*

 Interpretation 20*

 Interpretation 20*

Next step: the SESAMES research programme

A multimodal, low-cost survey protocol designed for the extraction of significant architectural features

Photogrammetric protocol from Panoramic images feature detection Calibration and orientation Dense matching

Point to point direct measurement (DXF)

Summary and perspectives

> Testing the approach on interiors

Thank you

www.map.cnrs.fr

territographie.map.cnrs.fr

