

Proportions vs dimensions: shedding a different light on the analysis of 3D datasets
J.Y Blaise, I.Dudek, G.Saygi UMR CNRS/MC 3495 MAP



Survey protocols : acquisition and processing of raw 3D data
Photogrammetry, laser scanning, image-based modelling, etc.


Information visualisation : providing tools for reasoning on historical evidence, spotting trends and exceptions.


Focuses on depicting one particular item, with exhaustiveness, from the point of view of its geometrical features


Focuses on helping analysts to investigate a collection of items, to cross-examine data (beyond geometrical features)


The "observation" side

## Bedrock observations founding this experiment:



Bedrock observations founding this experiment:




> a growing capacity of academics to produce large 3D datasets
$>$ the emergence of low-cost survey techniques
> with that renewed capacity a methodological question is raised: what interpretation lines, what sensemaking opportunities does that move open?


Bedrock observations founding this experiment:
> a growing capacity of academics to produce large 3D datasets
> the emergence of low-cost survey techniques
> with that renewed capacity a methodological question is raised : what interpretation lines, what sensemaking opportunities does that move open?

This is basically a « proof of worthiness » experiment
investigating the feasibility and added value of using a low-res, low-cost, "amateur" 3D point cloud in order to re-read pieces of architecture through simple proportions, ratios and geometric relations, in other words in order to extract architectural features for comparisons.


- Terminological disambiguation
- On proportions (briefly)
- The use of proportions in architecture over time
- Proportions as prescriptions vs. proportions as an analytical tool
- The experiment -29 rural, « non-elaborate » chapels
- Acquisition and data extraction step: building on the MAP unit's Aïoli experimental platform
- Analysis step: some infovis-inspired solutions
- Future works: the SESAMES research programme


## Terminological disambiguation: proportions (vs.?) ratios

In Vitrivius' ten books of architecture
"The design of a temple depends on symmetry, the principles of which must be most carefully observed by the architect. They are due to proportion, in Greek $\dot{\alpha} v a \lambda o p i \alpha$. Proportion is a correspondence among the measures of the members of an entire work, and of the whole to a certain part selected as standard.
http://www.hellenicaworld.com/Greece/Literature/Vitruvius/en/Architecture.html\#Page_69 [last visited 08/04/2019]


Correspondence of the measures of an entire column, in relation with a «standard» : the module (bottom radius of the shaft)

In Vitrivius' ten books of architecture
"The design of a temple depends on symmetry, the principles of which must be most carefully observed by the architect. They are due to proportion, in Greek $\dot{\alpha} v \alpha \lambda o p i \alpha$. Proportion is a correspondence among the measures of the members of an entire work, and of the whole to a certain part selected as standard.
http://www.hellenicaworld.com/Greece/Literature/Vitruvius/en/Architecture.html\#Page_69 [last visited 08/04/2019]

intercolumniation in relation with a certain part, a « standard » : dimension D (module)
C. R Harris

Illustrated dictionary of historic architecture, Dover Publications 1983

## In Vitrivius' ten books of architecture

"The design of a temple depends on symmetry, the principles of which must be most carefully observed by the architect. They are due to proportion, in Greek $\dot{\alpha} v \alpha \lambda o p i \alpha$. Proportion is a correspondence among the measures of the members of an entire work, and of the whole to a certain part selected as standard.
http://www.hellenicaworld.com/Greece/Literature/Vitruvius/en/Architecture.html\#Page_69 [last visited 08/04/2019]

## In Two Kinds of Proportion by Matthew A Cohen

Introduction to "Objects of Belief: Proportional Systems in the History of Architecture"
Special collection of Architectural Histories, the EAHN (European Architectural History Network ) international, blind peer-reviewed scholarly journal.
https://journal.eahn.org/articles/10.5334/ah.bv/ [last visited 08/04/2019]
Proportion can refer to ratios, or it can refer to architectural beauty. In this introduction to the papers that follow, Matthew A. Cohen proposes a simple clarification of this ambiguity as a framework for continued discussion of this subject: that whenever scholars use the word proportion, they specify whether they intend 'proportion-as-ratio' or 'proportion-as-beauty'.

Terminological disambiguation: proportions vs. ratios
What will be intended in what follows intend is 'proportion-as-ratio'


Summary of the San Lorenzo [Basilica San Lorenzo in Florence, 1424 > Filippo Brunelleschi ] nave arcade bay proportional system (spread between two drawings for clarity).

Cohen, M.A., 2014.
Introduction: Two Kinds of Proportion.
Architectural Histories, 2(1), p.Art. 21.
DOI: http://doi.org/10.5334/ah.bv

On proportions : use over time
A (very) quick overview of when they mattered



Romanesque period: simple ratios

L'église cistercienne " ad quadratum", dessinée par Villard de Honnecourt ( (XIII' siècle), est régie par des proportions musicales. Son plan est contenu dans un rectangle qui est un triple double carré (3/2),
correspondantà la quinte. Son choeur (4/3) représente la quarte ; chaque bras de transept (4/2) est associé al'octave, ainsi que le transept entier (8/4). Le croisement de la nef et du transept estun carré (4/4), symbole del'unité. La nefenfin évoque la tierce (5/4).
T. Hatot


Renaissance period: Brunellechi's Cappella dei

Pazzi


Up to modernist architecture
Le Corbusier's Villa Stein

Le Corbusier et la méditerranée
Editions Parenthèses / Musées de Marseille 1987

On proportions : prescriptions vs. analytical tool


Proportions as quantitative relations to be applied by builders,

Proportions as a prescription

Le Corbusier's Modulor

Fondation Le Corbusier http://www.fondationlecorbusier.fr Le Modulor, sans lieu

On proportions : prescriptions vs. analytical tool


Re-reading, analysing choices made by builders,

Proportions as an analytical tool

Ratios are here used in retrospect, as a tool in analysing Brunelleschi's design


## On proportions : prescriptions vs. analytical tool

Re-reading, analysing choices made by builders,

Proportions as an analytical tool

These 3 triangular figures are used by Viollet Le Duc to back up his theory, or observations, on one specific edifice .

E. Viollet Le Duc

Entretiens sur l'Architecture Éditions Pierre Mardaga 1977 (ed.orig 1863)

## On proportions : prescriptions vs. analytical tool

## 51



Re-reading, analysing choices made by builders,

Proportions as an analytical tool

But such triangular figures can also be used to question the homogeneity (or heterogeneity) of a set of comparable edifices.


Senlis 1145


Amiens- 1220


Gains in height, relative stability in width

Regularly distributed thresholds in height (on this specific subset)

- after 1200
- 1180-1200
- $1160-1180$
- before 1150

> Correlation with period of construction

On this subset, a tendency to build higher naves, but that does NOT sum up what can be observed: the « lowest » nave is a « recent » one.

Analysing, through visual means, ratios, proportions, figures, does not necessarily mean coming to an assertive conclusion, but rather working on comparisons, providing food for thinking.


Santa Maria Novella (Alberti, Florence 1458 >)
Analysis by R.Wittkower
«Architectural principles in the age of Humanism »
Academy Editions 1998 (first ed. 1949)
> proportions can be an effective, rewarding lecture grid when observing « elaborate » pieces of architecture.

But can they be of any benefit when observing small-scale vernacular architecture? What exactly is there to uncover in that particular context?

> proportions can be an effective, rewarding lecture grid when observing « elaborate » pieces of architecture.

But can it be of any benefit when observing small-scale vernacular architecture? What exactly is there to uncover in that particular context?

That is precisely an issue that the emergence of lightweight, low-cost survey techniques allows us to address.


The experiment - 29 rural, « non-elaborate » chapels

< territographie.map.cnrs.fr >


A concern for different collections


As part of the initiative, the idea that a low cost protocol for the acquisition of raw 3D data, including
through citizen contributions, could be tried out.

The experiment -29 rural, « non-elaborate » chapels

Context: a short-term research programme called «Territographie » questionning the applicability and scientific added-value of the citizen science paradigm in the documentation and analysis of minor heritage items.
< territographie.map.cnrs.fr >

## Mucem <br> IT <br> Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur

A concern for different collections

As part of the initiative, the idea that a low cost protocol for the acquisition of raw 3D data, including
through citizen contributions, could be tried out.
> A baseline choice : photographic captors,

Acquisition and data extraction step : builds on the Aïoli collaborative platform

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui


www.aioli.cloud
A reality-based 3D "annotation" platform (collaborative annotation of $3 D$ regions in point clouds).

The application generates a 3D point cloud from photographs, which can then be annotated.

Based on two technological developments:
> photogrammetry techniques, (computing of a 3D model by correlation of images)
> massive processing and sharing gathered data through the cloud.

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui



3D "regions" (subsets of the point cloud) can be isolated and annotated in the 3D space

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui



And the result reprojected on each photograph used to compute the point cloud3D

> L.De Luca, A.Manuel, A.Alaoui



In this experiment we make use of another feature : retrieving "relative dimensions", i.e. quantities that will be saved as ratios (and not as metric information)



The ratios selected
> Proportions of Facade
H1/W1
H2/W1


The ratios selected
> Proportions of Facade
H1/W1
H2/W1
> Facade vs. bell tower

BW/W1 (widths)
$\mathrm{BH} / \mathrm{H} 2$ (heights)


The ratios selected
> Proportions of Facade
H1/W1
H2/W1
> Facade vs. bell tower

BW/W1 (widths)
$\mathrm{BH} / \mathrm{H} 2$ (heights)
> Surface of openings vs. of Facade

S1/S2
S3/S2

Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice


Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice


Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice



# Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice 

> Proportions of Facade
exception


Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice
> Facade vs. bell tower


Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice
> Facade vs. bell tower


Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice
> Facade vs. bell tower




Visualisation of ratios，edifice per edifice


Surface of the ＂windows»

$\square$
用雨雨雨
ouvertures： $0.5 \%$


Porte： 8 \％

Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice


Porte: $8 \%$

Visualisation of ratios, edifice per edifice

Visual solutions designed on purpose.
lays the information down, helps identifying exceptions and trends, similarities.

Patterns corresponding to the collection as a whole require other visual solutions.


Reading of clusters

Visualisation of ratios, collection reading


A distribution plot on bell tower proportions in comparison to façade proportions

Visualisation of ratios, collection reading


A distribution plot on bell tower proportions in comparison to façade proportions

This diagonal: homothetic relations (A most unusual situation)

## Summary and perspectives



What we have done up has more to do with delineating a playground than with actually uncovering signifiant trends in terms of « ways of building »,

The experiment acts as a confirmation that there is a challenge now within reach: experimenting low-cost, lightweight survey techniques that can help analysts rethink the way they get hold of, and cross examine, 3D data seen as hints about ways of building.

Of course the whole approach does NOT require the computing of a 3D point cloud - only, having it is a mean to go back to the source, and somehow make of the 3D point cloud a repurposable content.


Summary and perspectives

Next step: the SESAMES research programme

A multimodal, low-cost survey protocol designed for the extraction of significant architectural features

Photogrammetric protocol from Panoramic images feature detection
Calibration and orientation Dense matching

Point to point direct measurement (DXF)


## Summary and perspectives

> Testing the approach on interiors

Thank you

www.map.cnrs.fr
territographie.map.cnrs.fr

