



**HAL**  
open science

## **Performing Emotions at the Canonization of Ignatius of Loyola and Francis Xavier in the Southern Low Countries**

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse, Koen Vermeir

► **To cite this version:**

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse, Koen Vermeir. Performing Emotions at the Canonization of Ignatius of Loyola and Francis Xavier in the Southern Low Countries. *Changing Hearts*, Brill, pp.187-210, 2018, <10.1163/9789004385191\_010>. <halshs-02427485>

**HAL Id: halshs-02427485**

**<https://shs.hal.science/halshs-02427485v1>**

Submitted on 13 Dec 2023

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



HAL Authorization

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

## **Performing Emotions at the Canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries**

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse, and Koen Vermeir

Early modern feasts and festivals involved pageantry, ephemeral architecture, sophisticated machinery, fireworks, and often complicated iconography.<sup>1</sup> They drew on the participation of a plethora of actors, ranging from prestigious patrons to specialized technicians, and sometimes on the active contribution of a large audience. Such feast and festivals have therefore proven to be a particularly fertile field of investigation. Much work has been undertaken since the 1960s on the spectacular festivals that marked royal, princely or ambassadorial entries, dynastic births, christenings, betrothals, weddings or funerals, coronations, and other important events in Europe. In Rome especially, new ritual and ceremonial models were developed and spread from that city to the rest of the Catholic world.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> This paper an outcome of a research project funded by the Belgian Science Policy Office (BELSPO) and coordinated by the four authors. The project aims to understand how over the course of the seventeenth century, “spectacle” was an occasion for, and agent of, artistic, religious, and scientific exchange between Italy and the Southern Low Countries. See Ralph Dekoninck, Annick Delfosse, Maarten Delbeke, and Koen Vermeir, “Mise en image du spectacle et spectacularisation de l’image à l’âge baroque,” *Degrés* 40 (2013): 1–14; Ralph Dekoninck, “Images of Spectacles and Spectacularization of Images in the Southern Netherlands (1582-1635),” in *Bauten, Rituale, Aufführung: Medieninnovationen im Nordeuropa des 17. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Johannes Süßmann and Sabine Schmitz (Wolfenbüttel: Herzog August Bibliothek, forthcoming); Annick Delfosse, “From Rome to the Southern Netherlands: Spectacular Sceneries to Celebrate the Canonization of Ignatius of Loyola and Francis Xavier,” in *The Sacralization of Space and Behaviour in the Early Modern World*, ed. Jennifer DeSilva (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), 141–59; Ralph Dekoninck and Caroline Heering, “La Société du spectacle. Jésuites et Jansénistes face aux arts éphémères et spectaculaires,” *Rivista di storia et letteratura religiosa* 50 (2014): 515–30.

<sup>2</sup> Of the abundant recent literature on the subject, we note the following: J. R. Mulryne, Helen Watanabe-

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

If these festivals have received much attention, particularly with regard to their allegorical and symbolic meanings, the place and role of emotions in these events has barely been studied. This is despite the fact that both historical sources and historiography commonly associate festivals with emotional responses such as awe and wonder. This chapter intends to address this lacuna, by analyzing the feasts organized, in 1622 in the Southern Netherlands, to mark the joint canonization of Ignatius de Loyola and Francis Xavier. Compared to civic events, religious festivities in the Southern Netherlands are little studied.<sup>3</sup> Recent archival research has revealed not only that the feasts of 1622 were impressive baroque performances—as they were across the Jesuit constellation—but also that they generated a number of manuscripts and printed sources in which the Jesuit *scriptores* developed a particular strategy for reporting the events that focused on the

O’Kelly, Margaret Shewring, Elizabeth Goldring, and Sarah Knight, eds., *Europa Triumphans: Court and Civic Festivals in Early Modern Europe* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004); Sarah Bonnemaïson and Christine Macy, eds., *Festival Architecture* (London: Routledge, 2008). For Rome, see Renato Diez, *Il trionfo della parola. Studio nelle relazioni di feste nella Roma barocca 1623–1667* (Rome: Bulzoni, 1986); Maurizio Fagiolo Dell’Arco, *Corpus delle feste a Roma*, 2 vols (Rome: De Luca, 1997); Maria Antonietta Visceglia, *La città rituale. Roma e le sue cerimonie in età moderna* (Rome: Viella, 2002); Peter Gillgren and Mörten Snickare, eds., *Performativity and Performance in Baroque Rome* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012); Simonetta Tozzi, ed., *Feste barocche per inciso. Immagini della festa a Roma nelle stampe del Seicento* (Rome: Gangemi, 2015). For Catholic ceremonies in Europe, see Bernard Dompnier, ed., *Les cérémonies extraordinaires du catholicisme baroque* (Clermont-Ferrand: Presses Universitaires Blaise Pascal, 2009).

<sup>3</sup> Wouter Kuyper, *The Triumphant Entry of Renaissance Architecture into the Netherlands: The Joyeuse Entrée of Philip of Spain into Antwerp in 1549, Renaissance and Mannerism Architecture in the Low Countries from 1530 to 1630* (Alphen aan den Rijn: Canaletto, 1994); Margit Thøfner, *A Common Art: Urban Ceremonials in Antwerp and Brussels during and after the Dutch Revolt* (Zwolle: Waanders, 2007); Stijn Bussels, *Spectacle, Rhetoric and Power: The Triumphal Entry of Prince Philip of Spain into Antwerp* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2012); Tamar Cholcman, *Art on Paper: Ephemeral Art in the Low Countries: The Triumphal Entry of the Archdukes Albert and Isabella into Antwerp, 1599* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013); Antien Knaap and Michael Putnam, eds., *Art, Music and Spectacle in the Age of Rubens* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2012).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

effects of festive devices. These sources are the primary object of this chapter. We argue that the accounts are structured according to the transformative effect of emotions.

Emotions are an important theme in the narratives, while at the same time also determining how these sources describe the events in question.

To frame our analysis, we will characterize the accounts that have come down to us. For each of the three accounts focused on here, we will discuss how emotions are related to the described events, and which effect is ascribed to these emotions. In a next step, we will look in more detail at some of the means the accounts identify as particularly important in bringing about the transformative effects of emotions. We will then conclude our reading by elaborating on three key concepts that the accounts associate with the workings and effects of emotion: wonder (brought about by illusionism), sacred horror, and *varietas*.

### **The Canonizations and their Accounts**

On March 12, 1622, Pope Gregory XV declared the canonization of five new saints in St. Peter's Basilica in Rome: Isidore the Laborer, a lowly medieval farmer who became the patron saint of Madrid; the Carmelite, Teresa of Àvila; the Oratorian, Philip Neri; and the Jesuits, Ignatius of Loyola and Francis Xavier. The Society of Jesus marked this momentous event with spectacular celebrations in Rome and across the world.<sup>4</sup> In many

<sup>4</sup> For Italy, see, among others, Bernadette Majorana, "Entre étonnement et dévotion. Les Fêtes universelles pour les canonisations des saints (Italie, XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle et début du XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle)," in *Les cérémonies extraordinaires*, ed. Dompnier, 424–42; for France, in the same volume, see Michel Cassan, "Les fêtes de la canonisation d'Ignace de Loyola et de François Xavier dans les provinces d'Aquitaine (1622)," 459–76; see also Rosa de Marco, "Le langage des fêtes jésuites dans les pays de langue française, de la première édition de la 'Ratio Studiorum' de 1586 jusqu'à la fin du généralat de Muzio Vitelleschi (1645)" (PhD diss.,

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

cities, in Europe and in their missionary territories, the Jesuits organized important, often spectacular festivities to celebrate their two new saints. These festivals were subjected to stringent instructions from the Jesuit General, Muzio Vitelleschi (1615–45).<sup>5</sup> In a letter to all Provincial Fathers of the Order dated March 9, 1622, Muzio demanded that ceremonies be reasonable and not excessive. However, from Milan to Palermo, from Madrid to Girona, from Lisbon to Salvador de Bahia, and in almost all places Jesuits had settled, the festivities far exceeded the moderation the fathers were asked to adopt. A true festive movement occurred, starting in Rome and spreading worldwide, almost like a solemn seismic wave. From the Roman epicenter, a series of secondary tremors traveled to the rest of the world, including the Flandro- and Gallo-Belgian provinces of the Netherlands, our field of interest.

We can gather an idea of the festivities and take the pulse of the festive movement thanks to the descriptions of them the Jesuits sent to their Curia in Rome. The Society of Jesus required each of its local houses to account for its activities and organization to the General of the Order, who was based in Rome.<sup>6</sup> To this end, Belgian colleges and houses

Université de Bourgogne, 2014); for Spain, see Trinidad de Antonio Saenz, “Las canonizaciones de 1622 en Madrid: artistas y organización de los festejos,” *Anales de historia del arte* 4 (1993–94): 701–09; Catalina Buezo, “Festejos y máscaras en honor de san Ignacio de Loyola en el siglo XVII,” *Boletín de la real academia de la historia* 190 (1993): 315–23; and for Brazil, see Charlotte de Castelnau-L’Estoile, *Les Ouvriers d’une vigne stérile. Les Jésuites et la conversion des Indiens au Brésil, 1580–1620* (Lisbon and Paris: Centre Culturel Calouste Gulbenkian, 2000).

<sup>5</sup> Rome, Archivium Romanum Societatis Iesu [hereafter ARSI], *Instit.* 122, fol. 89<sup>v</sup> (Muzio Vitelleschi to all the provincials, March 9, 1622).

<sup>6</sup> Annick Delfosse, “La Correspondance jésuite: communication, union et mémoire. Les enjeux de la *Formula scribendi*,” *Revue d’histoire ecclésiastique* 104 (2009): 71–114; Markus Friedrich, “Communication and Bureaucracy in the Early Modern Society of Jesus,” *Revue suisse d’histoire religieuse et culturelle* 101 (2007): 49–75; and Markus Friedrich, “Circulating and Compiling the *Litterae Annuae*: Towards a History of

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

sent accurate descriptions of the ceremonies they organized to the General House.

Unfortunately, few of these documents—only those issued from the colleges of Kortrijk, Dunkirk, and Leuven—have been preserved.<sup>7</sup> The *Litterae annuae* of 1622 and the triennial supplements of the *Historiae Domus* also record the events, but the interest of these descriptions varies according to a range of factors.<sup>8</sup> The supplements of *Historiae Domus*—carefully kept in the Roman archives—were intended to serve one day to write a general history of the Order. As a consequence, their authors tended to smoothen out events, so as to build a triumphant record of Jesuit zeal and cleverness. As for the *Litterae annuae*, these were intended to report from the various local ministries to the authorities in Rome. Their authors had to demonstrate how the feasts fitted the Order's global pastoral mission, and in so doing, they chose either to erase those spectacular manifestations the General had forbidden or, conversely, to abound in details.<sup>9</sup> Their focus on the utility or effect of the festivals in performing the Jesuit mission is also why these documents pay relatively little attention to the programs or the devices that were used, describing them

the Jesuit System of Communication,” *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 77 (2008): 3–40.

<sup>7</sup> Kortrijk: *Relatio canonizationis BB. PP. Ignatii ac Francisci Xaverii Cortraci celebratae* (Antwerp, Rijksarchief [hereafter RA], *Flandro-Belg.* 1701); Dunkirk: *Relatio celebritatis in festo SS. PP. NN. Ignatii et Xaverii a Residentia Dunckerana* (ARSI, *Flandro-Belg.* 60, fols 45–48) [hereafter Dunkirk]; Leuven: *Commentarius rerum gestarum a Societate Iesu Lovanii ad Apotheosim SS. Ignatii et Xaverii* (ARSI, *Flandro-Belg.* 52, fols 17–22) [hereafter Leuven].

<sup>8</sup> See ARSI, *Flandro-Belg.* 50II, 52, 56; ARSI, *Gallo-Belg.* 32–34, 40; and RA, *Flandro-Belg.* 3.

<sup>9</sup> See, for instance, the conclusion of the Dunkirk account: Dunkirk, fol. 48<sup>f</sup>: “Finally, we took advantage of this solemn celebration: we saw the increasing devotion of citizens towards the new saints and their growing zeal for the Society. The ever more abundant daily crowd in our chapel, the frequent offerings of candles, the great quantity of expenses to adorn the procession reflected it very well” (“Ex hac solemnī festivitate illud denique utilitatis consecuti sumus quod civium erga novos Sanctos devotio et in Societatem studium plurimum incrementi accepisse cernantur. Id quotidiani ad sacellum nostrum concursus frequentiores, cerei frequentes oblatis, sumptus in exornanda supplicatione suppeditati luculenter testantur”).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

only in a cursory (and often confusing) way. Devices and programs carried no interest in their own right, but their *efficiency* in supporting the Jesuit pastoral project did. This point of view helps to explain why these sources mostly lack accurate descriptions of scenes and theatres.

Fortunately, the situation is different for printed accounts. While these are still quite rare for the Belgian Provinces, there are three published accounts of the celebrations relevant for our purposes here: one account of the urban festivities held in Antwerp (*Honor*); one of the court festivities in Brussels (*Triumphus*); and another of the festivities held on behalf of the university (or academy) in Douai (*Narratio*).<sup>10</sup> These texts were written hurriedly and approved within two months of the festivities. Like their handwritten counterparts, they are not faithful accounts. Yet, unlike the manuscript sources, which were intended only for internal use within the Society, the printed accounts were intended for a much larger audience, at least some of whom would have been familiar with the events. As a consequence, their function changed. The success of each event was also framed with regard to the outside world of, for instance, patrons, the popular audience, and other religious orders). The printed accounts were also meant to keep memories of the event alive, and as a consequence, the printed booklets included more extensive and accurate descriptions of the events and their material surroundings.

Taken together, the corpus of manuscript and written sources illustrates the

<sup>10</sup> For Antwerp: Michel de Ghryze, *Honor S. Ignatio de Loiola Societatis Iesu Fundatori et S. Francisco Xaverio Indiarum Apostolo per Gregorium XV inter Divos relatis habitus a Patribus Domus Professae et Collegii Societatis Iesu Antuerpiae 24 Iulii 1622* (Antwerp, 1622) [hereafter Antwerp]; for Brussels: *Sanctorum Ignati et Xaveri in divos relatorum triumphus Bruxellae ab Aula et Urbe celebrates* (Brussels, [1622]) [hereafter Brussels]; and for Douai: *Narratio eorum quae Duaci pro celebranda sanctorum Ignatii et Francisci canonizatione gesta sunt* (Douai, 1622) [hereafter Douai].

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

defining features of what could be termed a Jesuit “psychology.” Rooted in the rhetoric and spirituality of the Order, this psychology proposes that each emotion leads to a motion. Eloquence, regardless of its medium, was aimed at awakening emotions and channeling them towards moral and religious edification. This is apparent in our sources: they do not only tell us about the means employed to arouse an emotion, but also of its intended effect on the viewers. More than offering testimony of a lived experience, the texts delineate a horizon of ideal expectations. They construct the reception of the festival by pouring it into a rhetorical mold cast from commonplaces. Precisely thanks to the repetition of these *topoi* across a considerable number of sources it is possible to reconstruct the expectations supporting Jesuit festival culture, and to understand how emotions, the transformation of emotions, and their transformative effects were meant to structure these events.

In this chapter, we will analyze in detail the text of the *Triumphus*, a printed account of the courtly festivities in Brussels, and we will compare it with the manuscript account of the festivities in Louvain (the *Commentarius*) preserved in the Roman archives of the Jesuits and with the *Relatio celebritatis* in Dunkirk, another manuscript presently kept in Rome. Additional material will be adduced from two published accounts: the *Narratio*, relating the academic festivities in Douai, and the *Honor*, describing the Antwerp canonization feasts. The different portrayals of the celebrations each have their own style, pace, and performativity. The polished character of the published *Triumphus* stands in clear contrast with the manuscript descriptions, for instance, but there are also striking variations between the manuscript sources. This becomes particularly clear in the way emotions are described and evoked.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

## Emotions in the Three Accounts

### *Louvain: Restraint*

The *Commentarius* on the festivities in Louvain is one of the most detailed among the known manuscript accounts, and also the most honest and uncensored. Tellingly, it starts not with the feast but with an examination of conscience and with the rector announcing in the local refectory that the blessed Ignatius and Xavier will be canonized. This intimate beginning illustrates the straightforward and unspectacular style of the account.<sup>11</sup> In accordance with the general characteristics of the genre outlined above, the manuscript notes that political turmoil and war hampered the preparation and execution of the festivities; that heavy rains disturbed the procession;<sup>12</sup> and—with apparent irritation—that a monk died at exactly this inopportune moment, so the clergy was also busy with the preparations for his funeral. Tensions with rival orders are addressed without inhibition. There is even room for a frivolous anecdote: when one of the orators spoke with a heavy *liégeois* accent, the listeners were amazed and some even started to laugh.<sup>13</sup>

In the Louvain account, as in most handwritten records, the approach is intimate and down-to-earth, and emotions remain restrained. In this case, most of the attention goes to the curiosity of the public, the stress involved for the organizers, and the agreeable effect

<sup>11</sup> In this text, religious modesty is also emphasized and contrasted with secular vanity. This may partly explain the text's moderate attitude towards the emotional effect of the feast. However, the marvelous installations are described with gusto.

<sup>12</sup> Leuven, fol. 17<sup>r</sup>: “Tempestas, ad noctem exorta, festivos ignes in alteram diem et tenebras distulit, nec inopportune, vel ut amicis tempus superesset testandae benevolentiae, vel ut triumphus planius enotesceret, ex solis nostris vasa sexaginta in tribus malis arserunt.”

<sup>13</sup> Leuven, fol. 19<sup>r</sup>: “Reliqui ut placuerint rerum gravitate ac dicendi facundia superavit tamen Leodicus sermo usque ad risum mirificus; cum pro gentis more litiganti propius lepidus orator verba magis frangeret, quam loqueretur.”

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

of the music and processions. According to this account, the strongest emotions and effects were not created by the performances, the extravagant machines, or the big explosions, but by a sermon, read by the Archbishop of Mechelen. Rather than the spectacle, it was this discourse that made the Jesuit listeners blush and brought tears to their eyes, and it struck the other spectators as well, because of its eloquence and the important role it reserved for the Jesuits and the Louvain College in particular.<sup>14</sup>

#### *Dunkirk: Types of Wonder*

By contrast, the Dunkirk *Relatio* is much more polished and plays on a variety of emotions and effects. First of all, the manuscript starts *in medias res* with the marvelous celebrations; it concludes by stressing that the proceedings went by “without any incident.”<sup>15</sup> Contrary to the intimate account of the Louvain celebration, the narrator here adopts the role of the amazed spectator, whose gaze wanders between objects and events,<sup>16</sup> and is attracted by the most extraordinary sights. The author singles out the gifts and patronage that the celebration accrued, carefully describing the precious objects, referring to their donors and estimating their value (or sometimes just evoking “an extraordinary

<sup>14</sup> Leuven, fol. 17<sup>v</sup>: “Interea dum moratur Pontifex, iam tota Academia totaque civitas sese collegerat, illa in cancellario ac doctoribus omnibus, haec in nobilitate praecipuo ac senatu universo, iam pro concione, vir antiqui retinens et solers scriptis ingenioque clarus, Divi Petri plebanus sacrae theologiae doctor, de Societate eiusque sanctis fortiter iuxta ac facunde dissererat ut nostris verecundiam iniiceret, lachrymas exprimeret, reliquos stupore impleret.”

<sup>15</sup> Dunkirk, fol. 48<sup>r</sup>: “Sicque feliciter Deo laus magna civium congratulatione; festum peregrimus nullo suborto (ut in similibus solet) infortunio.”

<sup>16</sup> Among many references to the *oculos* (gaze): Dunkirk, fol. 45<sup>r</sup>: “ex utroque summi altaris latere omnium in se oculos convertebant”; Dunkirk, fol. 45<sup>v</sup>: “spectantium oculis subducebantur”; Dunkirk, fol. 46<sup>r</sup>: “ut gratius nihil spectantium oculis accidisse credatur.”

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

price”<sup>17</sup>). These extensive references to outside patrons might indicate that the text was meant to be published, or at least circulated beyond the confines of College and Curia.

Although the Dunkirk *Relatio*, like the *Commentarius*, refers to “agreeable” music and performance, it also makes special reference to learned emotions. More specifically, it evokes the two types of “wonder” distinguished in the classical tradition.<sup>18</sup> The first of these is wonder provoked by ignorance, the kind of wonder Aristotle described in his *Metaphysics*.<sup>19</sup> For example, the *Relatio* emphasizes that not only ordinary men but even specialists were impressed by the complexity of certain *apparati*. The third part of the pageant, for instance, consisted of a large “Ship of the Church,” in which personifications of the Church, St. Augustine, the Pope, and the founders of different religious orders were seated. The ship looked like a real three-master but was reduced to the size of a fishing boat. Every detail of a large galleon was present in miniature, up to the last screw and thread. Observing every little detail attentively, even specialists in navigation could not fathom how it was done, and they were stupefied by wonder, the *Relatio* notes. The second kind of wonder is provoked by illusionism. Representations of the new saints turned out so well that spectators (almost) believed they were living.<sup>20</sup> Appreciating the artificiality of the phenomenon changed the spectators’ emotion from terror into admiration. Focusing on these kinds of wonder illustrates a reflexivity and intellectualization that is largely lacking

<sup>17</sup> Dunkirk, fol. 45<sup>f</sup>: “quibus si diademata, in quae Matronae primariae immensi splendoris ac pretii monilia gemmasque contulerant, annumeraveris, non facile an ars pretio, an pretium arti praeferendum constitutes.”

<sup>18</sup> For a typology of secular wonder, see Maarten Van Dyck and Koen Vermeir, “Varieties of Wonder: John Wilkins’ Mathematical Magic and the Perpetuity of Invention,” *Historia Mathematica* 41 (2014): 463–89.

<sup>19</sup> Aristotle, *Metaphysics*, in *The Complete Works of Aristotle*, ed. Jonathan Barnes, 2 vols (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984), 2: A.2 [982b].

<sup>20</sup> Dunkirk, fol. 45<sup>f</sup>: “Maxime tamen ambae sanctorum nostrorum statuae umbilico tenus tam affabre sculptae, ut vivere quodammodo ac spirare viderentur.” On illusionism, see below.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

in the *Commentarius*: the description in the *Relatio* assumes a group of spectators who react according to the intentions of the architects of the spectacle.

The most elaborate and spectacular machines provoked the strongest reactions, such as a bleeding Christ and a machine built around the image of the triumphant Christ amid a choir of saints. The believers were so moved by the first effigy that they drenched their handkerchiefs in the blood that spouted violently out of the crucified Christ and applied it to their eyes. The second machine, a large and complex construction of statues of saints and angels, rainbows, and circles, agitated the spirits of the spectators to such an extent that they experienced a sacred tremor, a notion to which we will return. The narrative of the Dunkirk festivities was a carefully crafted crescendo of emotive effects, from agreeable music and admiration for *ad vivum* representations to machines so marvelous that they provoked a sacred shiver.<sup>21</sup>

#### *The Triumphus: A Magnificent Theater in Brussels*

The most elaborate account of the canonization celebrations in the Belgian provinces was the published *Triumphus* about the events in Brussels. The narrator's point of view is that of an attentive and sensitive spectator. The narrator also occasionally records the reactions of prominent and authoritative viewers. When the Infanta Isabella smiled during a recitation, the narrator stresses the pleasure and approbation the smile signified.<sup>22</sup> When she looked on in admiration at a marvelous automaton, he notes that she experienced something far more powerful than just gratification and benevolence; she stood perfectly

<sup>21</sup> For the bleeding Christ, see Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>r</sup>; for the second machine and the sacred shiver, see fol. 47<sup>v</sup>.

<sup>22</sup> See Brussels, 19–20.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

still during the performance, as if pinned to the ground.<sup>23</sup> As in the *Dunkirk Relatio*, the direction of the gaze of the narrator/spectator structures the dynamics of this published account. More than the other accounts, the descriptions in the *Triumphus* are replete with various emotions and effects provoked by the stunning views and spectacles, ranging from pious voluptuousness, pleasure, desire, amazement, joy, and passionate piety, to applause, sobs, and tears.<sup>24</sup> This is undoubtedly because the *Triumphus*, as a published account, was intended for a wider readership that should acknowledge the success of the event. Moreover, the *Triumphus* is about the celebrations in Brussels, the city where the different religious orders vied for the attentions of the Spanish court, particularly those of the Archduchess Isabella. As a consequence, the description takes great care to indicate the important network of patrons involved in bringing about the opulent environment.

### **The Instruments of Emotion**

#### *Splendor, Immersion, and Illusionism*

Splendor, immersion, and illusionism were three ways to provoke emotions in the spectators of the celebrations and, later, the readers of the accounts. The splendor of the festivities was evoked and reproduced by means of close description of the details of the scenery and the **events**, and the overwhelming detail created in turn an immersion effect. This is most clearly the case in the *Triumphus*, if only because of the more elaborate nature of the printed accounts. The *Triumphus* opens with an enumeration of the imperial ornaments in the church: the “brocades” made from the nuptial cloak of Charles v that

<sup>23</sup> See Brussels, 30–31.

<sup>24</sup> On the oxymoronic pious voluptuousness, cf. Brussels, 7: “In his prima spectatorum statio ad aram maximam pia voluptatis aequae ac supplicabundae admirationis plena fuit.”

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

decorated the altars; the omnipresent columnar device of the Habsburgs; the anagrams linking the name of the newly elected emperor Matthias with that of Jesus.<sup>25</sup> By stressing the presence of these features the *Triumphus* emphasizes how embedded in the local political and religious arena the Society was. Yet these imperial motives form part of a far more extensive environment appealing to the emotions of the beholder.

The narrator of the *Triumphus* describes how the two chapels flanking the main altar, dedicated to Mary and St. Ignatius, are decked out with tapestries gifted by ladies “of the first rank.”<sup>26</sup> The brocades serve as a magnificent backdrop for silver effigies of Mary and the new saint. The main altar itself, situated between these chapels, is an elaborate triumphal arch where equally resplendent effigies of the two celebrated saints venerate a cross dominated by a giant bronze St. Michael.<sup>27</sup> The description of the main altar and the two chapels frames the description of the church interior. The narrator’s gaze first moves down from the dome of the apse along the longitudinal axis of the main altar, to shift towards the middle of the church, where stands a second, crown-shaped altar, then again forward along the walls of the aisle, decorated with flowers and cornucopia, and back to the apse of the church from where it descends from the giant images of Aloysius and Kostka suspended high above down to the chapels of Ignatius and Mary. The slow and circular movement through the church interior emphasizes the seemingly endless abundance of ornament, provided by a hoard of elite patrons. The sustained admiration of the narrator parallels the veneration and the heightened sacred emotions that these ornaments conveyed to spectators: every precious gift is both a token of the veneration of

<sup>25</sup> See Brussels, 5.

<sup>26</sup> See Brussels, 16.

<sup>27</sup> See Brussels, 7.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

the donor and the visual transformation of earthly riches into pure spiritual gold, an incitement to the beholder to emulate the generous patrons.<sup>28</sup> Or, as the opening line of the *Triumphus* has it: “the generosity of the very pious Infante towards the holy fathers has astonished the eyes of all: without there being a real winner, elegance rivaled with richness to honor Ignatius and Xavier.”<sup>29</sup> The detailed description of the precious gifts that contributed to the decoration of the church thus illustrates the close relation between admiration and veneration. The careful mention of the value and material of the objects and decorations, the contributions by donors and patrons, heightens the effect of spectacular opulence.<sup>30</sup> The myriad gifts conspire with the temporary constructions to create the illusion of a total environment.

Like the *Triumphus*, the other accounts, too, convey the impression that the viewer was entirely surrounded by a festive environment. At the same time, it was made clear that this ephemeral and exceptional scenography was solidly grafted onto the existing, permanent environment. The author of the *Triumphus* reminds the reader that he is in the “Vitruvian basilica of the sacred church,” and, as we have seen, the layout of the church

<sup>28</sup> See, for instance, Brussels, 10: “Hos arcus una cum columnis holosericeo murice vestitos decem lectae principes matronae non nobilitate minus quam erga sanctos patres pietate illustres, sancta conspiratione aemulo ad posteritatem exemplo collatis in commune gemmis omnique mundo muliebri, tanta vel elegantia vel opulentia exornarunt, ut nullus scribendo calamus par esse possit, quando nullus videndo oculus capere tantam maiestatem potuit.”

<sup>29</sup> “In vitruviana sacrae aedis basilica oculos omnium ad se rapuit addicta sanctis patribus pientissimae Infantis liberalitas: in qua dubia victoria, elegantia cum opulentia pro honorando Ignatio Xaverioque certavit” (Brussels, 5).

<sup>30</sup> The same is true for the *Honor*, where, for instance, the gems in the necklace adorning the statue of Ignatius have an estimated value of 100,000 florins, and the lamps are said to cost more than 2,000 florins. See Antwerp, 15–16.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

provides a framework for his description.<sup>31</sup> In the account of the festivities at Dunkirk, it is pointed out that the “large and numerous” windows were covered with transparent images representing the deeds of the Jesuit saints, lit by candles, night and day, again reminding readers that they are witnessing a *transformed* environment.<sup>32</sup> The spectacular is defined by the means producing the event, by the extraordinary elements that disrupt normal space and time. It is the metamorphosis of the environment, brought about by effects of light and sound that help to provoke wonder and astonishment.

As a magnificent transformation of the existing architecture, the ephemeral decoration also operates to fragment and dislocate that same architecture. Sometimes it is not entirely clear whether the author writes about the interior of a building or an exterior space. This confusion supports the sense of self-contained continuity, which in turn heightens the emotive response of the reader. The ability to achieve such an otherworldly immersion is of itself cause for amazement, not in the least because it required a collective investment of effort, shaped by outstanding individuals. Indeed, in Dunkirk,

[...] altars were erected in different places, thanks to the fact that several neighborhoods apparently agreed to decorate the facades of houses, to the extent that the streets appeared to form a continuous altar.<sup>33</sup>

The author of the Douai account writes that before launching himself into a description of the festivities that took place for eight days, he should describe “briefly the whole of the

<sup>31</sup> For the reference to the basilica, see n. 29.

<sup>32</sup> Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>v</sup>: “Singulae enim fenestras, quae frequentes sunt et magnas, singulas habebant imagines transparentes, quae praeclariora Sanctorum facinora, tam in luce quam in tenebris adiectis luminaribus, repraesentabant, nec vana fuerunt huiusmodi spectacula, multi enim minus bene de Sanctorum illorum meritis sentientes, hic picturis melius edocti, illos magni facere laudibusque extollere coeperunt.”

<sup>33</sup> “Nam altaria variis in locis erecta, quid quod viciniae complures ita in exornandis aedium frontispiciis visae sint conspirasse, ut integrae plateae continuum altare viderentur” (Dunkirk, fol. 46<sup>v</sup>).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

apparatus that one saw in the church and the streets [...] an exceptional and more or less continuous one; it started at the seminary of the Scots.”<sup>34</sup> This snippet evokes another important feature of the environments: they might challenge the distinctions between interior, building, street, or square, but they have a distinct order, determined by a direction, markers of entrances and frontiers, and a succession of objects of a different scale.

The most prominent element employed to order the space of the not festival was the triumphal arch. These arches, too, were part of a spatial choreography. They existed neither in isolation nor as the frame of a *tableau vivant*, but as the monumental building blocks of an urban ensemble. In Dunkirk, the Jesuits decided to erect a triumphal arch at one end of the street where they were housed, after the Confraternity of St. Sebastian had one built at the other, overtly intending to match the gesture initiated by the first intervention.<sup>35</sup> In Brussels, four arches framed the streets that crossed in front of the church. Conveniently oriented, one each, towards the North, South, East, and West, these arches were cast as the new center of the topography of Brussels, arranged around the façade of the new church.<sup>36</sup> This topography extended outward to the nearby Grand Place,

<sup>34</sup> “Antequam earum rerum, quae per octo sequentes dies gestae sunt, narrationem ingredior, operae pretium est, totum eum, qui in templo et plateis visebatur, apparatus, cuique ea demum nocte et quidem adulta ultima manus est imposita, paucis describere. Is a seminario Scotorum unicus et perpetuus propemodum fuit” (Douai, 3).

<sup>35</sup> See Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>r</sup>.

<sup>36</sup> See Brussels, 32: “Ad Societatis Iesu nouam aedem, in meditullio urbis, quatuor plateae regiae viam sacram sacro capitolio sternunt. Ad harum platearum quatuor, quae crucis in formam decussatae mediam aedem complectuntur, in frequentissimis vicis ingressum, Senatus Bruxellensis quatuor triumphales portas, quales Serenissimis olim Belgicae Principibus Alberto et Isabellae Austriaco-Hispanis, laetissimorum hymenaeorum et auspiciatae inaugurationis publico gaudio erexerat, tales nunc ex integro aere publico

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

described as the “capitol” of Brussels, to Notre Dame du Sablon, the church of the Spanish court, and also incorporated the Notre Dame de Laeken, situated several kilometers away to the West, an important focal point of Isabella’s devotional practices.<sup>37</sup>

This imaginary topography, which transformed the urban space into a coherent theatre of veneration, was not confined to the locality where the celebration took place.<sup>38</sup> The *res gestae* of Francis Xavier especially invoke the global scale of the celebrations. At the same time, every city is cast as another Rome. The association with “the triumph,” made explicit in the title of the Brussels account and embodied in the motif of the triumphal arch, obviously calls to mind the ancient type of the ritual, along with its more recent revival in Counter-Reformation Rome, the rite of the triumphal translation of the constructas consecratasque suae in Sanctos Coeli Principes Ignatium et Xaverium novos Bruxellae Indigetes inauguratos, pietatis et obsequentiae voluit esse monumentum.” For the detailed description of the arches, see *ibid.*, 32–41.

<sup>37</sup> For the reference to the Grand Place as the capitol, see Brussels, 98; for the incorporation of the Marian churches, see *ibid.*, 42. For the works initiated by Isabella to connect Laeken to the city, see Alexander Henne and Alphonse Wouters, *Histoire de la ville de Bruxelles, Vol. 4* (Brussels: Éditions Culture et Civilisation, 1975), 250–52; and Krista De Jonge and Annemie De Vos, “Architectuur ten tijde van de aartshertogen: het hof achterna,” in *Bellissimi Ingegneri, Grandissimo Splendore. Studies over de Religieuze Architectuur in de Zuidelijke Nederlanden tijdens de 17de eeuw*, ed. Krista De Jonge, Annemie De Vos, and Joris Snaet (Leuven: Universitaire Pers Leuven, 2000), 11–42, here 36–37.

<sup>38</sup> The authors of the Dunkirk and Brussels accounts stress the theatrical nature of the proceedings. The churches themselves are filled with “theatres”: Brussels, 11: “Ornatus theatri templi medii”; or Brussels, 13: “Ab isto divinorum honorum apotheoseosque teatro nemo satiat, nemo fatigatus spectator abscessit. Avocant nos interim alia atque alia totam per aedem spectacular.” This theatricality is extended to the city, which in any case is conceptualized as one great altar. See Dunkirk, fol. 46<sup>v</sup>: “Nam altaria variis in locis erecta, quid quod viciniae complures ita in exornandis aedium frontispiciis visae sint conspirasse, ut integrae plateae continuum altare viderentur.” Furthermore, actual scenes or “theatres” are positioned all over the city: cf. Dunkirk, fol. 46<sup>v</sup>: “[...] ante cuius introitum Hispano milite sumptus subministrante theatrum triplici contignatione erectum”; and Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>r</sup>: “Hic accedebant theatra duo ante domum nostrum.” Note also that *spectaculum* is mentioned at least as frequently as *theatrum*. As we will show below, the texts themselves also follow a rhetorical model that is explicitly theatrical.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

relics of martyrs.<sup>39</sup> But the “Romanization” of the different cities celebrating the Jesuit saints under the aegis of the Order was also made explicit by the vocabulary of the descriptions. The architecture is represented by means of a terminology that leaves little doubt about its ancient pedigree. In Douai, when the author of the manuscript evokes the columns of a triumphal arch, he points out that they were dressed with the *usual* bases and ornaments, implying that the idiom of architecture *all’antica* was generally known and accepted at a time when this idiom was still being established.<sup>40</sup> The architectural idiom and its description thus act as normative devices evocative of the imaginary sphere within which the beholder is asked to circulate. This strategy is compounded by explicit references to Roman buildings. In Dunkirk, there was a pyramid of six storeys that went so high that “one could recognize a reproduction of the mausoleum of Augustus.”<sup>41</sup> The façade of the Jesuit church in Brussels is described as the center of the four roads, “very elegant and superbly decorated with all the ornaments of architecture and all the elegance of proportion.”<sup>42</sup> Conversely, the qualification of the Town Hall’s architectural style as “gothic or modern” illustrates the same acute awareness of architectural idioms and their

<sup>39</sup> See Richard Krautheimer, “A Christian Triumph in 1597,” in *Essays Presented to Rudolf Wittkower on his Sixty-fifth birthday. Volume 2: Essays in the History of Art*, ed. Douglas Fraser and Howard Hibbard (London: Phaidon, 1967), 174–78. See especially Brussels, 103, where a hypothetical triumphal entry of the actual saints is evoked.

<sup>40</sup> See Douai, 3: “Anteriores illius faciem sustinebant quatuor columnae, quarum diameter sesquipedalis, altitudo cum basibus et solitis ornamentis pedum viginti.” On this issue, see, among others, Krista De Jonge and Koen Ottenheim, eds., *Unity and Discontinuity: Architectural Relations between the Southern and the Northern Low Countries 1530–1700* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007).

<sup>41</sup> “Addita insuper pyramis sex contignationibus distincta, quae ita sese in altum erigebat, ut ad imitationem mausolei Augusti veteris Romae constructam dignosceres” (Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>r</sup>).

<sup>42</sup> “Inter arcus illos quos hactenus delineabam, in ipsissima commissura quatuor platearum media est elegantissima et omnibus architecturae calamistris ad omnem proportionum elegantiam superbissime concinnata templi facies” (Brussels, 43).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

connotations.<sup>43</sup> Through the choice of vocabulary, the architecture is made part of a virtual environment composed of both Roman and Christian elements, in which the reader should become immersed.

The immersion in a visibly transformed, or perhaps better still, “altered” environment created another world, where the viewer was thrust into the affective experience of wonder, pleasure, desire, amazement, joy, and piety. This total experience was not homogeneous, however. It was punctuated by special effects at specific localities. The authors of the accounts noted that the machines and moving spectacles provoked the highest emotional investment and impact. We have mentioned the “Ship of the Church” and the spectacular bleeding Christ of Dunkirk. In Brussels, effigies of Ignatius and Francis Xavier were perched on artificial mountains, the Parnassus for Ignatius and rocky Caucasus for Francis. All kinds of animals could be seen crawling from under the rocks of Francis’s mountain, and when a fight broke out between an elephant and a rhinoceros, Orpheus’s lyre calmed the beasts, whose places were then taken by a dragon and a crocodile. Finally, all of the animals sung the names of the new saints. This spectacle so moved the hearts of the spectators that they desired to see the automata over and again.<sup>44</sup>

The automata, the second type of wonder we identified in the Dunkirk account, illustrate the pervasiveness of illusion as a modality to trigger emotions. Challenging the divisions between artifice and nature, the ephemeral and the permanent, between animation and inertia, illusion helps to transform the environment into an artwork. The effigies of the two newly canonized saints were primary foci of illusionism. All of the accounts list

<sup>43</sup> “In eodem exsurgit e Capitolio Urbis architectura quam gothicam sive modernam vocant” (Brussels, 98).

<sup>44</sup> See Brussels, 31–32.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

remarkably similar statues of Ignatius and Xavier as focal points of the installation: more than life-size, wearing the dress of the Order, decorated with stars and silver, and with heads made of wax or other materials that seemed utterly lifelike. In Dunkirk, for instance, it was written that “what attracted the eyes of all, were two statues of our saints, each on one side of the main altar, sculpted as busts with such art that they seemed to live and breathe.”<sup>45</sup> The effigies thus contributed much to making the saints present, yet this “presence” was not confined to these monumental statues. Their names, deeds, and virtues were rehearsed by means of all manner of effigies, *affixiones*, and allegorical representations, throughout the entire celebration. The illusion of their pervasive presence was enhanced by the effect of saturation. One moved in a truly Ignatian and Xaverian environment, imbued with their stories and virtues. The mention of movement from the beholder and the narrator, as well as the reader is, in turn, a key device to enlist and activate emotion in those texts.

### *Text and (E)motion*

What is especially striking about the *Triumphus* is the way emotions are inscribed in the text to give the narration a performative dimension. Indeed, the text itself is conceived of as a spectacle designed to move the hearts of its readers. It combines detailed descriptions of the events, along with descriptions of the emotions—both real and ideal—spectators were presumed to have felt, thus intending to generate, through *hypotyposis* and mimesis, the desired emotions in the reader.

<sup>45</sup> “Maxime tamen ambae sanctorum nostrorum statuae umbilico tenus tam affabre sculptae, ut vivere quodammodo ac spirare viderentur, ex utroque summi altaris latere omnium in se oculos convertebant” (Dunkirk, fol. 45<sup>r</sup>).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

If we analyze the structure of the text of the *Triumphus* in detail, we see that emotions are always evoked at the start or end of a new description, when the presumed spectator moves from one marvelous sight to another. Thus statements such as the following often feature at the beginning of a new section (indicated also by a marginal title): “In the middle of these things, the first stop of the spectators in front of the principal altar fills them with a pious voluptuousness as much as with a respectful admiration”,<sup>46</sup> “For those who exit the gate into the daylight, a column in the middle of the courtyard presents itself to their astonished and admiring gaze.”<sup>47</sup> Emotions feature at the end of a descriptive segment in order to connect it to the next depiction of a marvel entering the spectator’s focus. The narrator even mentions the missing negative emotions of boredom and tiredness, which might lead people out of the spectacular space: “It is neither by tiredness nor languor that any spectator has withdrawn himself from this theatre of sacred honors and of the apotheosis. Nevertheless, diverse spectacles divert us through the whole church.”<sup>48</sup> This narrative technique gives dynamism to the text, which corresponds to the virtual motion of the reader/spectator through the space.

Emotion sets the virtual spectator in motion, while structuring the text and setting the pace for the reader. Despite numerous detailed descriptions of ornaments, jewels, images, and materials, it is always the global apprehension of an overwhelming new scene which the spectator must take in that provokes emotion. This is why accounts of emotion

<sup>46</sup> “In his prima spectatorum statio ad aram maximam piae voluptatis aequae ac supplicabundae admirationis plena fuit” (Brussels, 7).

<sup>47</sup> “Prodeuntibus ex porticu sub divum attonitis et suspicientibus oculis obiicit se columna in areae centro ad pedes solo scapo quadragenos alta” (Brussels, 25).

<sup>48</sup> “Ab isto divinorum honorum apotheoseosque theatro nemo satiatus, nemo fatigatus spectator abscessit. Avocant nos interim alia atque alia totam per aedem spectacula” (Brussels, 13).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

serve as bridging points between the descriptions of the different stages of the visit in the text: they mark the different stages of the virtual visit and “frame” the sacred spaces described for the reader, while mirroring the emotive reactions of the actual historical spectators who attended the festivities and responded to their own spatial organization and framing. For the author of the *Triumphus*, motion and emotion were closely intertwined.

There is, however, one exception to the presence of accounts of emotional responses as connectors between different static scenes of the feast that allow motion between them. This exception is the description of the strong emotive impact of extraordinary, dynamic scenes, such as marvelous automata and fireworks. Here, the continuous movement of the machine or the fireworks is reflected in the dynamism of emotions experienced by the spectators during the spectacle. Additionally, the agitation of the children, who are hidden in the machine and animate it from the inside, seems to be contagious, directly influencing the spirits of the viewers. Motion and emotion converge again. The relationship between repetition, desire, and dynamism is especially interesting in these passages which make these sacred motions and emotions perennial. When the Infante Isabella applauds the spectacular mountain with the animated animals and then leaves the festival, it seems that the show is over. It would seem to be a fitting official end, but it is not, because the spectators so strongly desire to see the show again that it is repeated for a whole week.<sup>49</sup> The King of France’s ambassador seems himself to be stuck in repetition, for he cannot stop expressing his admiration for the performance.

<sup>49</sup> “Illam vero tantam dominae suae in spectando voluptatem postquam familiaris Palatarum faeminarum turba ex iucunda multorum narratione accepisset, nullum fecit orandi Serenissimam Infantem et obsecrandi finem, dum impetrasset, ut in ipsarum gratiam denuo a meridie eadem spectacula darentur” (Brussels, 31).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

Furthermore, he wants a pictorial representation of the show to be sent to his king.<sup>50</sup> The narration comes to resemble a *perpetuum mobile* of desire, performance, and admiration.

At this point, the narrator of the *Triumphus* also makes clear that the text itself is a carefully crafted performance. He directly addresses the reader as the Infante is leaving, enlivening and performing the text for us, drawing the reader in: “Let our best wishes accompany her.” He continues with his direct address to the reader: “And you in the school, you applaud: the feast is over. No. It is not.”<sup>51</sup> Through this narrative technique, we—the readers—have become directly involved in the Brussels canonization celebrations. The narrator then explains that the feast was not over, because the spectators wanted to see the automata in motion again, and the celebrations continued in the following days. The feast is also not finished, furthermore, because it is reenacted in the text. Indeed, the text was clearly conceived by its author as a performance in itself. This is especially clear in the concluding passage of the *Triumphus*, which marks the end of the textual reenactment of the spectacle: “while I fold the screen and close the curtain, I pray and appeal to the Saints Ignatius and Xavier for these saintly celebrations.”<sup>52</sup> The curtain has fallen, but the reader can easily open it again by turning the pages and starting to read

<sup>50</sup> See Brussels, 31: “Nec de nihilo est, quod Christianissimi Galliarum Regis Orator cum admirandi laudandique finem nullum faceret, voluerit scenam utramque cum personatis beluis eleganter depictam, ad Regem suum deferri.”

<sup>51</sup> “Ilicet, ad omnia plausum dans, abit Serenissima Princeps, nos votis comitemur abeuntem, ‘Vivat et valeat Isabella diu pia’. Et vos in gymnasio plaudite, actum est. Non actum: nam per omnes hebdomadae feriatae dies undae spectatorum magno vomitorio ad aream scholarum effusae sunt spectandi aviditate ideoque per dies singulos non semel, quia semper scena cum belvatis personis poscebatur, spectari debuit et spectata reponi” (Brussels, 31–32).

<sup>52</sup> “Ad extremum dum vela contraho cortinamque reduco, oro atque obsecro Sanctos Patres Ignatium atque Xaverium per sacra gaudia” (Brussels, 104).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

afresh.

### **The Transformative Effect of Emotions at the Canonizations**

The accounts discussed in this chapter reveal several interlocking levels at which the spectacles intended to change the hearts of the beholder, and also of the reader. The Dunkirk narrator states his belief in the transformative power of the spectacle, as a moment of instruction:

Spectacles of this kind are not vain, because many who did not share good sentiments towards the merits of our Saints started—once the spectacle had instructed them better—to appreciate them very much and to exalt them in their praise.<sup>53</sup>

When we learn who the saints really are, the narrator suggests, we will inevitably be induced to praise them, a first step towards a change of heart.

An important enticement in this process of instruction is wonder. Aristotle deemed wonder to be at the origin of philosophy; for the Jesuits, it was also at the core of religion.<sup>54</sup> Wonder, as we have seen, is provoked by the acknowledgement of one's own ignorance, an experience prompted by illusionism. The question of the nature of illusion was widely discussed in Jesuit circles over the course of the seventeenth century, especially in regard to the emotional impact of the theatrical representations written by Jesuit authors like Bernardino Stefonio.<sup>55</sup> Understanding how exactly the process initiated

<sup>53</sup> See Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>v</sup>.

<sup>54</sup> Our sources are full of references to *admiratio*, a religious species of wonder, including Brussels, 7: “a humble pious admiration”; admiration combined with veneration at Brussels, 16; and also a terror transformed into admiration at Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>r</sup>. Other kinds of wonder are also referred to: cf. Brussels, 25: “ut quodam quasi architecturae monstro ac portento.” For Aristotle on wonder, see n. 19.

<sup>55</sup> See Anthony Blunt, “Gianlorenzo Bernini: Illusionism and Mysticism,” *Art History* 1 (1978): 67–89;

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

by illusion affected the beholder in both epistemological and emotional terms was central in these considerations. Illusionistic effects were thought to arouse emotions of surprise and then, once the illusion was unmasked, wonder about the maker's ability to mislead their audience.<sup>56</sup> Yet it was also recognized that if the illusion and wonder remained confined to this process, it might not only be naïve but also ineffective. After all, in this view, illusionism is a mechanism, a machine that can be switched on or off, and might or might not work. If an illusion turns out to have been a deception, will the “content” the illusion represents lose its legitimacy as well? Once it is understood that the Bleeding Christ of Dunkirk is not real, will the significance of the Crucifixion be questioned?<sup>57</sup>

Rather than as some kind of make believe appealing to the gullibility of the audience, Jesuit theatre operated on the premise that the “untrue” nature of the illusion is never forgotten. Precisely because no one believes that Christ is actually crucified in Dunkirk, it becomes possible to act *as if* the automaton were the real event. As we have seen, the account about Dunkirk mentions ritual behavior that accrued around the machine,

Maarten Delbeke, *The Art of Religion: Sforza Pallavicino and Art Theory in Bernini's Rome* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), 29–75.

<sup>56</sup> Knowledge of the phenomenon is important in recognizing it as an artificial construct. The audience had to understand that the saints were not magically brought back to life, but that their representations were so well executed that they seemed to be alive or lifelike. See, for instance, Dunkirk, fol. 47<sup>r</sup>: “when they came closer, they *understood* that there was no danger at all, and their terror transformed itself in admiration” (“[...] ita ut nonnulli nobis metuerent quod loco adeo praecipiti videremur consistere cumque propius accedentes omne periculum abesse intelligerent, formido in admirationem conversa est, ita ut nonnulli nobis metuerent quod loco adeo praecipiti videremur consistere cumque propius accedentes omne periculum abesse intelligerent, formido in admirationem conversa est” [emphasis added]); or Antwerp, 33: “Those who believed that the images were alive could not see this spectacle without pain. Those who knew that they were merely statues seemed incapable of being satiated by this great miracle of art” (“Qui vivam putabant, non sine dolore spectaculum videre poterant; qui statuam scirent, tanto artis miraculo satiati non posse videbantur”).

<sup>57</sup> See Delbeke, *The Art of Religion*, 72–75.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

with people daubing their handkerchiefs in the artificial blood. The illusion thus facilitates the kind of dispersed agency associated with relics or copies of miracle-working statues, while appealing at the same time to the transformative emotions of surprise and wonder.

This mixture of authentic sanctity and ephemeral experience opens a window onto divine majesty, a process enhanced by the intense physical experience the festivals generated: materials, lights, sounds, perfumes, special effects, the monumentality of the “machines,” everything immersed the participants in an ultra-sensory space. This majesty is exempt from the workings of illusionism and brings about a far more profound experience, described by the Jesuits as *sacer horror* (pious horror).<sup>58</sup> The Latin word *horror* refers to the physical symptoms of fear, such as shivering, cold sweat, a dry mouth, and knots in the stomach. The ancients used the word to describe the experience of the deity. *Sacer horror* seems to be what Rudolf Otto has called the “numinous dread” or awe of awfulness, the terrible fear caused by the inaccessibility and power of the “holy,” manifest in the *mysterium tremendum* (the terrifying mystery).<sup>59</sup> In early modern times, the expression *sacer horror* occurs in relation to liturgy and in particular with regard to the Tridentine conception of the Sacrifice of the Mass: it is the consequence of the unveiling of the divine majesty and the contemplation of God, brought about by “mystical benedictions, lights, incense, vestments, and many other things of this kind.” That is, according to the Tridentine decree, the “visible signs of religion and piety” used “to excite the minds of the

<sup>58</sup> See Ralph Dekoninck and Annick Delfosse, “*Sacer horror*: The Construction and the Experience of the Sublime in the Religious Festivities of the 17th Century Southern Netherlands,” in *The Sublime in Seventeenth-Century Dutch Art, Architecture and Theater*, ed. Stijn Bussels and Bram van Oostveldt (special issue of the *Journal of Historians of Netherlandish Art*, forthcoming).

<sup>59</sup> Rudolf Otto, *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-Rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and its Relation to the Rational*, trans. John W. Harvey (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

faithful to the contemplation of those most sublime things which are hidden in this sacrifice.<sup>60</sup> Obviously, as generators of spiritual transformation, the Jesuit processions we have discussed here are of a different order from the Sacrifice of the Mass, but, as we hope to have shown, the immersive, illusionistic environment of these spectacles operated according to a comparable logic of discovery, unveiling, and manifestation of a presence. Accounts of Roman papal pageantry contemporary to our sources similarly describe the manifestation of the festive apparatus in that city in terms of majesty.<sup>61</sup> Elsewhere, spectacular, illusionistic painted domes were described in terms of beholders standing face-to-face with Heaven itself.<sup>62</sup> The Jesuits themselves used the expression *sacer horror* to describe how audiences reacted to their spectacular celebrations.<sup>63</sup> This suggests that these processions, too, were intended to bring the audience, if not actually face-to-face with God, at least to a state where divine majesty was experienced. The abundance of sensory stimuli characteristic of the processional apparatus was meant to instigate—well

<sup>60</sup> Council of Trent, Session 22, *Doctrina de Sacrificio Missae*, cap. 5 (De missae caeremoniis et ritibus), in James Waterworth, trans., *The Canons and Decrees of the Sacred and Oecumenical Council of Trent* (London: Burns and Oates, 1848).

<sup>61</sup> See Lelio Guidiccioni, *Latin Poems: Rome, 1633 and 1639*, trans. and ed. John Kevin Newman and Frances Stickney Newman (Hildesheim: Weidmann, 1992).

<sup>62</sup> See Fabio Barry, “*Lux and lumen: The Symbolism of Real and Represented Light in the Baroque Dome*,” *Kritische berichte* 30.4 (2002): 22–37.

<sup>63</sup> Cf. *Historia Domus* of Cambrai (i.e., ARSI, *Gallo-Belg.* 34), fol. 114<sup>r</sup>: “Never had our church appeared with more august brilliance: two kinds of chapels were erected on each side of the main altar, and each one had a throne of saints of such height that it towered over the first floor of the church. Candles shone on every conceivable part of a structure filled with tiers of seating; above, there were three triumphal arches and ingenious shadows filling the souls of those who were praying with a *holy horror* and a religious feeling” (“Nunquam augustiori specie conspecta aedes nostra, erectis circa principem aram utrimque duobus veluti sacellis, suo cuique Sanctorum throno ea altitudine, quae templi tabulato minaret. Collucebant longe lateque per multam graduum substructionem cerei; superne vero tres arcus triumphales, artificiosis tenebris sanctum horrorem praecantium animis religionemque conciliantibus”).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

beyond simple stimulation of the senses *per se*—an emotional turmoil conducive to a state where a deep religious experience might become possible.

It is also this process that confers meaning to the *copia*, the saturation, that we have identified as a significant feature in the incitement of transformative emotions. Such abundance is meant to give the impression of a universe that is visually saturated by the richest, most pleasing materials and objects. Quantity is of equal importance as quality, we have seen, and the accounts often have recourse to elaborate enumerations of the precious components of the festive apparatus. Such enumerations aim, not at a grasp of detail but rather a sense of a modulated totality, where moments of homogeneous opulence alternate with spectacular eruptions. As such, the festivals participated in an aesthetic of *varietas* (measured variety) that was intended to harness man's innate curiosity for novelty and new experiences, to thereby convey a coherent argument or idea.<sup>64</sup> The seemingly closed yet endlessly variegated universe of the festival, marked by dense moments of spectacular displays, altars, automata, and processions, served to stimulate spectators' craving for instruction, wonder, and marvel, and then transformed this craving into a sustained change of heart.

<sup>64</sup> See Henry V. S. Ogden, "The Principles of Variety and Contrast in Seventeenth Century Aesthetics and Milton's Poetry," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 10.2 (1949): 159–82; Maarten Delbeke, "The Beauty of Architecture at the End of the 17th Century, between Paris, Greece and Rome," in *The Insistence of Art: Aesthetic Philosophy after Early Modernity*, ed. Paul A. Kottman (New York: Fordham University Press, 2017).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

## Bibliography

### *Archival sources*

Archivium Romanum Societatis Iesu, Rome

*Flandro-Belg.* 50II, 52, 56, 60

*Gallo-Belg.* 32–34, 40

*Instit.* 122

Rijksarchief, Antwerp

*Flandro-Belg.* 3, 1701

### *Published sources*

Antonio Saenz, Trinidad de, “Las canonizaciones de 1622 en Madrid: artistas y organización de los festejos,” *Anales de historia del arte* 4 (1993–94): 701–09.

Barry, Fabio, “*Lux* and *lumen*: The Symbolism of Real and Represented Light in the Baroque Dome,” *Kritische berichte* 30.4 (2002): 22–37.

Blunt, Anthony, “Gianlorenzo Bernini: Illusionism and Mysticism,” *Art History* 1 (1978): 67–89.

Bonnemaison, Sarah, and Christine Macy, eds., *Festival Architecture* (London: Routledge, 2008).

Buezo, Catalina, “Festejos y máscaras en honor de san Ignacio de Loyola en el siglo XVII,” *Boletín de la real academia de la historia* 190 (1993): 315–23.

Bussels, Stijn, *Spectacle, Rhetoric and Power: The Triumphal Entry of Prince Philip of Spain into Antwerp* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2012).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

Cassan, Michel, “Les fêtes de la canonisation d’Ignace de Loyola et de François Xavier dans les provinces d’Aquitaine (1622),” in *Les cérémonies extraordinaires du catholicisme baroque*, ed. Bernard Dompnier (Clermont-Ferrand: Presses Universitaires Blaise Pascal, 2009), 459–76.

Castelnau-L’Estoile, Charlotte, de *Les Ouvriers d’une vigne stérile. Les Jésuites et la conversion des Indiens au Brésil, 1580–1620* (Lisbon and Paris: Centre Culturel Calouste Gulbenkian, 2000).

Cholcman, Tamar, *Art on Paper: Ephemeral Art in the Low Countries: The Triumphal Entry of the Archdukes Albert and Isabella into Antwerp, 1599* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013).

De Jonge, Krista, and Annemie De Vos, “Architectuur ten tijde van de aartshertogen: het hof achterna,” in *Bellissimi Ingegneri, Grandissimo Splendore. Studies over de Religieuze Architectuur in de Zuidelijke Nederlanden tijdens de 17de eeuw*, ed. Krista De Jonge, Annemie De Vos, and Joris Snaet (Leuven: Universitaire Pers Leuven, 2000), 11–42.

De Jonge, Krista, and Koen Ottenheym, eds., *Unity and Discontinuity: Architectural Relations between the Southern and the Northern Low Countries 1530–1700* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007).

Dekoninck, Ralph, “Images of Spectacles and Spectacularization of Images in the Southern Netherlands (1582-1635),” in *Bauten, Rituale, Aufführung: Medieninnovationen im Nordeuropa des 17. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Johannes Süßmann and Sabine Schmitz (Wolfenbüttel: Herzog August Bibliothek, forthcoming).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

Dekoninck, Ralph, Annick Delfosse, Maarten Delbeke, and Koen Vermeir, “Mise en image du spectacle et spectacularisation de l’image à l’âge baroque,” *Degrés* 40 (2013): 1–14.

Dekoninck, Ralph, and Caroline Heering, “La société du spectacle. Jésuites et Jansénistes face aux arts éphémères et spectaculaires,” *Rivista di storia et letteratura religiosa* 50 (2014): 515–30.

Dekoninck, Ralph, and Annick Delfosse, “*Sacer horror*: The Construction and the Experience of the Sublime in the Religious Festivities of the 17th Century Southern Netherlands,” *Journal of Historians of Netherlandish Art* (special issue, *The Sublime in Seventeenth-Century Dutch Art, Architecture and Theater*, ed. Stijn Bussels and Bram van Oostveldt) 8.2 (2016).

Delbeke, Maarten, *The Art of Religion: Sforza Pallavicino and Art Theory in Bernini’s Rome* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012).

Delbeke, Maarten, “The Beauty of Architecture at the End of the 17th Century, between Paris, Greece and Rome,” in *The Insistence of Art: Aesthetic Philosophy after Early Modernity*, ed. Paul A. Kottman (New York: Fordham University Press, 2017).

Delfosse, Annick, “La Correspondance jésuite: communication, union et mémoire. Les enjeux de la *Formula scribendi*,” *Revue d’histoire ecclésiastique* 104 (2009): 71–114.

Delfosse, Annick, “From Rome to the Southern Netherlands: Spectacular Sceneries to Celebrate the Canonization of Ignatius of Loyola and Francis Xavier,” in *The Sacralization of Space and Behaviour in the Early Modern World*, ed. Jennifer DeSilva (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), 141–59.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

Diez, Renato, *Il trionfo della parola. Studio nelle relazioni di feste nella Roma barocca 1623–1667* (Rome: Bulzoni, 1986).

Fagiolo Dell’Arco, Maurizio, *Corpus delle feste a Roma*, 2 vols (Rome: De Luca, 1997).

Friedrich, Markus, “Communication and Bureaucracy in the Early Modern Society of Jesus,” *Revue suisse d’histoire religieuse et culturelle* 101 (2007): 49–75.

Friedrich, Markus, “Circulating and Compiling the *Litterae Annuae*: Towards a History of the Jesuit System of Communication,” *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 77 (2008): 3–40.

Ghryze, Michel de, *Honor S. Ignatio de Loiola Societatis Iesu Fundatori et S. Francisco Xaverio Indiarum Apostolo per Gregorium XV inter Divos relatis habitus a Patribus Domus Professae et Collegii Societatis Iesu Antuerpiae 24 Iulii 1622* (Antwerp, 1622).

Gillgren, Peter, and Mörten Snickare, eds., *Performativity and Performance in Baroque Rome* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012).

Guidiccioni, Lelio, *Latin Poems: Rome, 1633 and 1639*, trans. and ed. John Kevin Newman and Frances Stickney Newman (Hildesheim: Weidmann, 1992).

Henne, Alexander, and Alphonse Wouters, *Histoire de la ville de Bruxelles, Vol. 4* (Brussels: Éditions Culture et Civilisation, 1975).

Knaap, Antien, and Michael Putnam, eds., *Art, Music and Spectacle in the Age of Rubens* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2012).

Krautheimer, Richard, “A Christian Triumph in 1597,” in *Essays Presented to Rudolf Wittkower on his Sixty-Fifth Birthday. Volume 2: Essays in the History of Art*, ed. Douglas Fraser and Howard Hibbard (London: Phaidon, 1967), 174–78.

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

Kuyper, Wouter, *The Triumphant Entry of Renaissance Architecture into the Netherlands: The Joyeuse Entrée of Philip of Spain into Antwerp in 1549, Renaissance and Mannerism Architecture in the Low Countries from 1530 to 1630* (Alphen aan den Rijn: Canaletto, 1994).

Majorana, Bernadette, “Entre étonnement et dévotion. Les Fêtes universelles pour les canonisations des saints (Italie, XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle et début du XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle),” in *Les cérémonies extraordinaires du catholicisme baroque*, ed. Bernard Dompnier (Clermont-Ferrand: Presses Universitaires Blaise Pascal, 2009), 424–42.

Marco, Rosa de, “Le langage des fêtes jésuites dans les pays de langue française, de la première édition de la ‘Ratio Studiorum’ de 1586 jusqu’à la fin du généralat de Muzio Vitelleschi (1645)” (PhD diss., Université de Bourgogne, 2014).

Mulryne, J. R., Helen Watanabe-O’Kelly, Margaret Shewring, Elizabeth Goldring, and Sarah Knight, eds., *Europa Triumphans: Court and Civic Festivals in Early Modern Europe* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004).

*Narratio eorum quae Duaci pro celebranda sanctorum Ignatii et Francisci canonizatione gesta sunt* (Douai, 1622).

Ogden, Henry V. S., “The Principles of Variety and Contrast in Seventeenth Century Aesthetics and Milton’s Poetry,” *Journal of the History of Ideas* 10.2 (1949): 159–82.

Otto, Rudolf, *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-Rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and its Relation to the Rational*, trans. John W. Harvey (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980).

Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse et Koen Vermeir, « Performing emotions at the canonization of St. Ignatius and St. Xavier in the Southern Low Countries », dans Raphaële Garrod et Yasmin Haskell (dir.), *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia and The Americas*, Jesuit Studies, Brill, 2019, p. 187-210.

*Sanctorum Ignati et Xaveri in divos relatorum triumphus Bruxellae ab Aula et Urbe celebrates* (Brussels, [1622]).

*The Complete Works of Aristotle*, ed. Jonathan Barnes, 2 vols (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984).

Thøfner, Margit, *A Common Art: Urban Ceremonials in Antwerp and Brussels during and after the Dutch Revolt* (Zwolle: Waanders, 2007).

Tozzi, Simonetta, ed., *Feste barocche per inciso. Immagini della festa a Roma nelle stampe del Seicento* (Rome: Gangemi, 2015).

Van Dyck, Maarten, and Koen Vermeir, “Varieties of Wonder: John Wilkins’ Mathematical Magic and the Perpetuity of Invention,” *Historia Mathematica* 41 (2014): 463–89.

Visceglia, Maria Antonietta, *La città rituale. Roma e le sue cerimonie in età moderna* (Rome: Viella, 2002).

Waterworth, James, trans., *The Canons and Decrees of the Sacred and Oecumenical Council of Trent* (London: Burns and Oates, 1848).