



HAL
open science

Phortia. Le tonnage des navires de commerce en Méditerranée du VIII^e siècle av. l'è. chr. au VII^e siècle de l'è. chr. Emmanuel Nantet

Giulia Boetto

► **To cite this version:**

Giulia Boetto. Phortia. Le tonnage des navires de commerce en Méditerranée du VIII^e siècle av. l'è. chr. au VII^e siècle de l'è. chr. Emmanuel Nantet. *International Journal of Nautical Archaeology*, 2020, 49 (2), pp.212-213. halshs-02560711

HAL Id: halshs-02560711

<https://shs.hal.science/halshs-02560711v1>

Submitted on 2 May 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

been the subject of so many contradictory comments because of the difficulties of interpretation posed by the text. Then, not only was Herodotus right, but he accurately describes an original tradition of boatbuilding with no real known parallel. Given the context of the wreck and its late dating, we could be in the presence of an ancient Nilotic tradition as testified by some aspects of the construction, but which could have evolved greatly as indicated by many new and original features. But there are still many questions. Are these peculiarities related to a general evolution of Egyptian boatbuilding in the Late Period or are they specific to this type of *baris*? What role might have been played by any external and possible foreign influences in this evolution?

It is therefore a new orientation of study and research on ancient boatbuilding that Ship 17 from Thonis-Heracleion opens, and that is proposed to us by Alexander Belov. Let us hope that the rich reservoir of wrecks at the Thonis-Heracleion site can provide new data to answer these questions. Very accessible and easy to read despite the technicality of the subject, the book testifies to a careful and quality edition. It is very richly illustrated with drawings and photographs—we regret, however, that some of the photos are a little dark—and many tables support the text. A glossary of technical terms, a bibliography and an index are useful additions to the whole. Alexander Belov's *Ship 17* thus establishes itself as a fundamental work that every library, any specialist in naval archaeology and anyone interested in Egyptology must possess.

PATRICE POMEY

Aix Marseille University, CNRS, France

Phortia. Le tonnage des navires de commerce en Méditerranée du VIII^e siècle av. l'è. chr. au VII^e siècle de l'è. chr

EMMANUEL NANTET

656pp., 126 line drawings & b/w photos, 6 graphs, 24 colour photos, Presses Universitaires de Rennes, 2016, €34, ISBN 978-2753534148

This volume is the result of a PhD dissertation defended in 2010 at the University Paris 1 and, as the title suggests, focuses on the thorny question of the tonnage of ancient commercial ships. Despite the discovery of an increasing number of ancient wrecks in the Mediterranean, their contribution to the study of the ancient economy remains problematic due to the lack of quantitative and representative data and difficulties relating to the correct interpretation of the available data. This volume delivers its part and contributes to the enquiry. Written in French with a six-page abstract in English, the volume is divided into two equal parts: a synthesis and a catalogue of 102 wrecks

covering 15 centuries from the 8th century BC to the 7th century AD. Four useful appendices close the volume, presenting the modern tonnage formula and the literary, epigraphic, and papyrological sources.

Just as in modern times empirical tonnage formulas were used to evaluate the volume of a ship and thus its transport capacity, and then to calculate taxes and customs duties, so ancient seafarers, merchants and public authorities probably had similar empirical 'recipes' that unfortunately have not survived. Historians and archaeologists interested in this topic have at their disposal a limited number of written sources mentioning the tonnage of ships in different measurement units that could refer to load capacities in volume (*medimnus*, *artaba*, *modius*, or *amphora*) or in weight (*talent*).

This is one of the interesting contributions of the volume, which highlights the diversity in the ancient units of measurements, their variation by region and period, and the difficulty in converting from units of volume—the most attested—to units of weight. This conversion depends upon the type of cargo: if liquid it implies the measurement of the capacity of the containers, if dry it implies the measurement of the density of cargo as well as related factors such as the mode of stowage in the hold. Shipwreck data is also available to scholars, in particular estimation of loading capacity calculated by archaeologists on the basis of the cargo conserved on the seabed, reconstruction of the shape and structure of the original ship or, sometimes, application of the modern tonnage formula. Given the available data, the author presents a catalogue necessarily limited to a small number of shipwrecks (102) that he considers sufficiently well conserved or well studied to merit inclusion. However, the catalogue must be considered with caution, as the data presented in it is sometimes incomplete or incorrect.

As an example, the Bou Ferrer shipwreck (cat. no. 54), discovered off the beach of Villajoyosa near Alicante (Spain) and dated between 65 and 75 AD, is considered to be a large sailing ship transporting wine and metals from Baetica, while it is clear that its Dr 7–11 amphoras contained salted fish and fish sauces. This misinterpretation has a direct consequence in that the author, in his conclusion, limits the size of cargoes of fish products to 60 tons on the basis of the reconstructed dimensions of the Titan ship (France, 1st century BC), while the tonnage of the Bou Ferrer vessel can be estimated at between 310 and 375 tons, putting it in the category of high-tonnage ships. The catalogue is also dotted with small factual errors that do not impact directly on interpretations, such as the image (Fig. 75) of the Herculaneum boat (cat. no. 58) that does not correspond to the shipwreck examined by R. J. Steffy and preliminarily published (*AJA* 89, 1985: 519–521) but instead to a second shipwreck found in the 1990s and never fully studied (see the notice by Ronald Bockius for the Navis I project <https://www2.rgzm.de/navis/home/frames.htm#/Navis/Ships/Ship199/Ship199.htm>).

Globally we can question the coherence of this catalogue: some well-reconstructed and well-studied wrecks are included among the 102 examples, while other shipwrecks are inexplicably absent despite their exceptional state of preservation, such as the Pisa C wreck. Similarly deep-sea wrecks, whose tonnage is often calculated by estimating the weight of the cargo visible on the seabed, are sometimes integrated, sometimes not. More questionable is the relevance of comparing, without discussion, and assigning equal weight to different functional types of ships, such as small fishing boats, harbour craft, fluvio-maritime vessels and big merchant ships.

These various flaws bring into question the validity of the interpretations presented in the chapters discussing the evolution of ship-tonnage in terms of volume, and dealing with tonnage constraints in relation to the type of commerce, type of cargo, and harbour infrastructure. The author is well aware of the fact that the representativeness of the shipwrecks is one of the principal problems to solve. Some goods, such as grain and Baetican olive oil, two of the most transported products during Antiquity throughout the Mediterranean, are indeed almost invisible in shipwrecks. The author addresses the question by opportunely introducing data available from written sources in his parameters.

Finally, the ambition of the author to perceive the mechanisms leading to the development of big ships, due to some combination of the expansion of commerce and the development of technical skill, remains inconclusive and somehow marked by the author's over-systematic spirit. However, despite some digressions complicating an already difficult subject, this volume does not lack interest and offers a compilation of data useful for further development.

GIULIA BOETTO
CNRS, Aix-en-Provence, France

Links to Late Antiquity: ceramic exchange and contacts on the Atlantic seaboard in the 5th to 7th centuries AD

British Archaeological Reports B639

MARIA DUGGAN

236pp., 76 figures (some colour), 17 tables, BAR Publishing, 2018, £52, ISBN 978-1407316390.

The recognition of post-Roman imported Mediterranean and Continental pottery on sites in the west and north of Britain and in Ireland was one of the most important discoveries for our understanding of the 'Celtic West' in the mid and later 20th century. Wheel-made, kiln-fired ceramics which could be dated by coin-associations in the origin-areas

could then be used to date and identify sites whose material poverty characterized the settlement evidence. The initial identifications at sites such as Tintagel in Cornwall and Garranes in Ireland were built on by a series of scholars who gradually refined the identifications allowing more precise origin-areas and chronologies to be developed and more sophisticated interpretations to be posited. This material remains a key group for our understanding and discovery of settlement sites of the 5th to 7th century in the relevant areas of western and northern Britain and Ireland and still provides a sharp contrast with the much richer Anglo-Saxon-dominated material of much of England.

Maria Duggan's 2018 monograph, based on her 2016 PhD thesis, reviews the evidence for ceramic exchange and contacts on the 'Atlantic Seaboard' in the 5th to 7th centuries AD. In seven chapters and a series of appendices it presents the history of research and updates previous accounts, focusing particularly on the Mediterranean imports and the discoveries along the Spanish, Portuguese, and western French coasts, and challenges aspects of the current importation model which envisages direct sailings from the Eastern Mediterranean and North Africa to western Britain. The first three chapters outline the history of research, fully acknowledging earlier work by scholars and building on Ewan Campbell's 2007 monograph *Continental and Mediterranean imports to Atlantic Britain and Ireland, AD 400–800* (CBA Research Report 157) and subsequent database publications. Chapter 3 explains the developing ceramic terminologies from the early British alphabetic A ware, B ware, D ware, E ware to the current, largely Mediterranean-based terms—Late Roman amphoras, in particular LRA1 and LRA2; fine colour-coated wares, African Red Slip Ware (ARS), and Late Roman C or Phocaeen Red Slip Ware (A ware); the fairly rare D ware ('dérivées sigillées paléochrétiennes atlantique' (DSPA)); and finally E ware, with an unknown kiln-source (hence its continued British alphabetic naming). This chapter briefly notes the presence of imported glass as an additional traded item from both the Mediterranean and the continent, and in particular Campbell's recognition of significant quantities of white-trailed glass of probable Bordeaux production, largely post-dating the Mediterranean phase of importation. Chapter 4 focuses on newer discoveries of Mediterranean imports in Devon, at Bantham, Mothecombe, and High Peak, and considers contradictory interpretations at Tintagel. This raises questions about whether separate importation routes might be reaching south Devon and north Cornwall, and about the nature of some so-called 'beach markets'.

Chapters 5 and 6 review the pottery evidence from the Atlantic seaboard of France, Spain, and Portugal, perhaps the material least known to British specialists. This shows some Mediterranean imports reaching western France and in particular Bordeaux, and quantities of pottery analogous to E ware