



HAL
open science

Camillo Beccari (1849-1928). A "Holiness Specialist" and publisher of sources on Ethiopia in the Early Modern Period

Hervé Pennec

► **To cite this version:**

Hervé Pennec. Camillo Beccari (1849-1928). A "Holiness Specialist" and publisher of sources on Ethiopia in the Early Modern Period. *Quaderni Storici*, 2020. halshs-03091749

HAL Id: halshs-03091749

<https://shs.hal.science/halshs-03091749>

Submitted on 10 Oct 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

CAMILLO BECCARI (1849-1928)

A «HOLINESS SPECIALIST» AND PUBLISHER OF SOURCES ON ETHIOPIA IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD*

At the beginning of the 20th century, in Italy, the Jesuit Camillo Beccari brought to light a collection of unpublished European documents on the history of Ethiopia from the 16th to the beginning of the 19th century and published them in the collection titled *Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales Inediti* (between 1903 and 1917). This has become the essential reference for anyone interested in the missionary phenomenon in Ethiopia, from the Christian kingdom to the modern period. His colossal work of inventory, undertaken in European libraries and archives, reveals almost exhaustively a set of documentation of unpublished European sources for the period from the 16th to the end of the 18th century, thus creating a specific field of Jesuit knowledge on Ethiopia. However, how was this documentation compiled and produced? By following step by step what he was able to do, we have the opportunity to read his work not only in the light of the contents of the documents but also, and especially, in keeping in mind the process that generated them. Approaching it in this way allowed for a shift, and for consideration at the widest possible level, to put the stakes and intentions of his work into perspective. The perspectives highlighted serve to emphasise the fact that the function of «specialist» in holiness, which Beccari occupied in parallel to that of publisher of European sources on Ethiopia, was related and came to shed light on the very contemporary stakes of the Society of Jesus in the face of other orders of the Catholic world. Finally, this work of «descaling» reintegrates this production into a topicality, that of the end of the 19th century, and in particular Italian colonisation and its establishment in the region of the Horn of Africa. This paper is an invitation to read these sources in a different way.

Keywords: Camillo Beccari, Ethiopia, Catholic missions, colonial stakes, missionary knowledge

The end of the 19th century is a period at the heart of the stakes in Luso-Ethiopian relations during the 16th and 17th century, when the Portuguese crown and the Ethiopian Christian regime had shared interests, Jesuit missionaries set foot for nearly 80 years upon the high-

lands of Ethiopia, and other Catholic missions attempted to pursue the adventure following the expulsion of the Jesuits in 1633-1634¹. From 1880 to 1920 there was a significant production of translations and the publication of Ethiopian manuscripts in European languages. A large part of the Ethiopian manuscripts written in Ge'ez (the classical Ethiopian language), brought back by the hundreds by Europeans who had sojourned on the high plateaus of Ethiopia during the 18th and 19th centuries and deposited in various European libraries, were classified, itemised and catalogued². «Ethiopian» collections thus emerged and become objects of study in themselves, taken up by a handful of scholars from the European academic world. These scholars translated, at a steady pace, essentially the manuscripts that they classified under different genres, specifically «historical»³ texts (royal chronicles and lists) and religious texts (lives of saints, liturgical texts, Ge'ez versions of the books of the Bible...). The work done by these academic scholars follows the principles of the methodical school, wrongly called, according to Guy Bourdé, the «positivist school», which was very dynamic in France and Germany⁴. It involved publishing editions of texts by collating the various manuscripts available, providing historical and critical introductions, translating them into European languages (French, Italian, German, Portuguese...) and offering the reader a solid critical apparatus of notes, of considerable erudition, that conferred an indisputable value on each of these documents. The interest and curiosity of this scholarly world extends far beyond the Ethiopian field; for example, the «Journal Asiatique», which, from the founding of the Société Asiatique in 1822, defended the duty to «encourage knowledge of Eastern languages and peoples, from North Africa to the Far East. On the board of directors of the society there figure, among a galaxy of scholars and academicians, the Minister of the Navy and Secretary of State for Colonies, while the Duc d'Orléans has been made honorary president». In subsequent years it became the true annals of Orientalism, mingling philology with the work of cabinet scientists and those in the field, as well as publishing grammars, dictionaries, translations of manuscripts, memoirs, critical reviews and the announcement of various items of news⁵.

The European community of scholars at the end of the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th was remarkably productive, and steadily published a very eclectic set of documents. In France, Jules Perruchon⁶, René Basset⁷ and William Conzelman⁸ published, in the scholarly revues «Journal Asiatique» and «Revue sémitique», Ethiopian royal chronicles and notes from manuscripts held in the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris, among others. They also delivered Ge'ez texts (with

their variants) and their French translations. In Italy, Ignacio Guidi⁹, Francesco Béguinot¹⁰ and Carlo Conti Rossini¹¹ published in their turn other Ge'ez manuscripts according to the same principle. In Germany, August Dillmann¹² and Carl Bezold published the *Kebra Nagast* (The Glory of the Kings) with the Ethiopian text and a translation¹³. Finally, in Portugal, Francisco Maria Esteves Pereira undertook the same type of work: editions of Ethiopian texts with a Portuguese translation¹⁴. This broad impulse contributed, on the one hand, to the diffusion of texts on the history of Ethiopia (especially the Christian kingdom of the highlands), and, on the other hand, to the ordering, to the enrichment, of a «corpus» that the scholarly community henceforth had to consider¹⁵. In this way, a specific field of knowledge was constituted on the Ethiopian Christian kingdom and, to a lesser extent, on Muslim Ethiopia¹⁶.

Thus, at the beginning of the 20th century, in reaction to this vast enterprise of critical editions of Ethiopian manuscripts, Camillo Beccari, in his capacity as a Jesuit, decided to bring to light a collection of unpublished European documents on the history of Ethiopia from the 16th century to the start of the 19th century (conserved in the archives of his order and elsewhere) and to publish them in the collection titled *Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales Inediti* (hereafter *RÆSOI*). Unlike the Orientalist scholars, who formed part of a tradition aiming to bring to light the maximum number of Ethiopian documents and to offer them to an erudite readership, Beccari's position was different. The Jesuit wished to shed additional and complementary light, as he wrote:

Such publications [Ethiopian manuscripts], which, we hope, will follow the others, shed great light on the civil and religious history of Abyssinia; however, regarding the 16th and 17th centuries, when Abyssinia felt the influence of the Portuguese and through them was installed the Catholic mission of the Jesuits, the historic notes of the Abyssinian sources already published, or in publication, need to be completed and in large part corrected depending on Western sources¹⁷.

For him, publishing unpublished European documents from the 16th century to the beginning of the 20th was a matter of providing a counterpoint. This would give historians sources to rebalance the writing of this history¹⁸. The Jesuit was presenting the raw material; it would fall to those in the profession to put it to good use. But the work of collation, of inventory, done by Beccari was, through its ordering, through the choices he made, the object of incrustation or overlay, of a lack of transparency. As is pointed out by Angelo Torre for other places,

this 19th-century production by learned authors calls for an «attitude of critical empiricism»¹⁹ towards them. Far from providing essentially «raw» materials, these collector authors built their documentary sets. I would therefore like to examine more closely the composition of this set of unpublished sources on Ethiopia, and assembled in the *RÆSOI*, starting with the processes involved in the production of the sources, and looking more closely at the way in which they were elaborated. The «indiciary paradigm»²⁰ method, with the follow-up of character, appears to me the most pertinent in order to grasp more finely what Beccari was «doing» at the moment he was doing it. This will provide an opportunity to read his «production» not only on the basis of the content of the documents but also, and above all, keeping in mind the processes that generated them²¹.

The first step is to look closely at the itinerary of the scholar and Jesuit of the late 19th century, who published manuscripts relating to the history of Ethiopia from the 16th to the 18th century. This Italian Jesuit, whose career was spent mainly in the Italian peninsula, was the «prosecutor of the case of the saints» for the Jesuit order, and published original documents relating to the history of the Catholic missions in Ethiopia. While Beccari is presented biographically in many encyclopaedia entries²², these provide at best factual information, with no perspective on his scientific output and the context of his work.

As a second step, this work of overlay leads to the reregistering of this production in a topicality that is the end of the 19th century, in particular the context of Italian colonisation and its settlements in the region of the Horn of Africa. From this point, these works, published in all scientific seriousness, which still remain essential references, should also be read from the angle of the knowledge Beccari produces and in the light of his intentions.

1. *Beccari, postulator general of the case of the saints and publisher of missionary documents on Ethiopia: the intellectual itinerary*

The archives of the Society of Jesus, notably the *Catalogues*, allow the itinerary of each of its members to be pieced together, from their entry into the community. Out of the biographical entries consulted²³, only that of Mario Zanfredini takes account of the *Catalogues* and most closely reconstructs the itinerary of Camillo Beccari²⁴. However, apart from place and date of birth, the *Catalogues* are silent – as are the entries – on the period before he entered the order. It is by starting from another document that one is in a position to enlarge his biography

and learn more about his family. While Beccari occupied the position of «postulator general» within the order, he published, in 1910, an 18-page booklet devoted to the exemplary life of his mother²⁵. This singular, hagiographic work draws a sociological portrait of Beccari's parents and family. He was born in Rome on 14 July 1849, out of the union (in October 1848) of Maria Polverosi and Giovanni Beccari, both from wealthy Roman landowning families. Camillo was the eldest of three boys and three girls, all of whom died as adults, the last at 40 while married. From 1862, his mother took a vow of chastity, with the agreement of her husband, and devoted herself to charitable works for the next 45 years of her life, that is, until 20 February 1907. The Jesuits were part of the entourage of the Beccari family; his mother's confessor, even as a young girl, was a Jesuit, Father Geminiano Mislei, in whom she confided while hesitating between devoting her life to God or taking a husband²⁶.

Having turned 15, the young Beccari entered the Society of Jesus in Rome on 31 October 1864. He studied philosophy for two years (1868-1870) at the Roman college, but, with Rome in the hands of Italian troops, completed his studies at Maria Laach Abbey in Germany. He continued his theology studies in France, at Laval (1874-1878), where he taught theology for two years (1878-1880). Having graduated in philosophy and letters in 1884 from the University of Naples, he then taught philosophy at Frascati (1884-1887) and at Strada (1890-1897)²⁷. Beccari thus had a career as a teacher mainly in the Italian peninsula.

In 1897, his base became resolutely Roman: he was first named vice postulator (1897-1901) of the cases of beatification and canonisation of the Society, and then postulator general (1901-1923). His work consisted in assembling the evidence for the beatification and canonisation processes presented to the Congregation of Rites, in the Roman Curia. To do this, he would spend time in the archives of the Society of Jesus, located in Rome, building up dossiers from documents in the archives, collating them and putting them in order so as to provide the evidence for the beatification and canonisation of certain figures from his order. It was in the exercise of this activity, as indicated by the writer of this biography, that he investigated the case of the missionaries martyred in Ethiopia between 1635 and 1640 (Bishop Apolinar de Almeida and his companions, Jacinto Francisco and Francisco Rodríguez²⁸). His regular visits to the Roman archives allowed him to uncover an unpublished, varied and considerable documentation on the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia, which had until then «slept» in the boxes of the Society of Jesus, and to «amplify» (*ampliando*) his research by publishing the 15 volumes of the *RÆSOI* from 1903 to 1917. Having occupied the

position of postulator general until 1923, he spent the last five years of his life as archivist and librarian at the residence of the Gesù in Rome²⁹.

The biography by Zanfredini, apparently dry and linear, has the merit of establishing a link between the position occupied by Beccari for more than 25 years, that of postulator general, and his role as a historian and publisher of sources on the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia. But this dual, concurrent activity is very important, first by making it possible to highlight the stakes and dynamics of the development of the collection: the *RÆSOI*.

Leonardo Cohen Shabot and Andreu Martínez d'Alòs-Moner have proposed an analytical bibliography of the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia, insisting, rightly, on the relationship between the European colonial context of the late 19th century and the revival of interest in studies of this period (in citing Beccari) on the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia of the 16th to 17th century³⁰. Apart from them, few authors have drawn attention to the articulation between publishing and colonisation.

By taking an interest in the author's textual production, and not only in that relating to Ethiopia, new elements of analysis can appear and reveal Beccari's *opus* in all its diversity and complexity. The most suitable location for a systematic analysis of the author's bibliography is the archives of the Society of Jesus in Rome (ARSI). If this lacks an exhaustive bibliography of Beccari, it nevertheless offers a set of documents that provide a panoramic view of the author's publications. A careful examination of this available bibliography leads to certain significant conclusions that allow the rethinking of the context of the publication of the *RÆSOI*.

2. *A prolific author of varied interests*

The bibliography of the author can be grouped into two categories, depending on the type of content. The first concerns the publication of documents for the processes of beatification and canonisation, and the second the publication of European documents on Ethiopia (16th to 19th century).

For historians of the mission and of Ethiopia, it is the second set that shaped Beccari's reputation, becoming an essential reference in the field of European documentation on East Africa for the Early Modern period. However, the first set of texts, an equally significant part of the author's work, have not attracted interest, which can be explained by the fact that the publication of documentation aiming to defend the cases of beatification and canonisation of certain members of the

Society of Jesus was of a very different nature to the documents relating to Ethiopia. Nevertheless, to consider this aspect, and the main function Beccari occupied for more than 25 years, is to consider the situation in which the author found himself, and to try to grasp the stakes that led him to embark on a venture that would cover many thousands of pages.

In 1909, he published a booklet titled *Stato presente delle Cause di Beatificazione dei servi di Dio appartenenti alla C. di Gesù* (I-3), in which he listed the various cases of martyrs of the Society pleaded in Rome over the preceding ten years (from 1897). The question of the Ethiopian martyrs³¹ figured in this report, and Beccari signalled an aspect that deserves to be emphasised: «Venerable Martyrs of Ethiopia. After overcoming many difficulties the Congregation for the introduction of the case was held in 1902 and produced a decree; the writings of the Venerables were examined and they were approved. A book was then printed to reject the accusations and slanders thrown at the martyrs and the Ethiopian mission of the Society of Jesus, the consequence of which was that the Holy Congregation withdrew from the proposal to hold a special session to examine the supposed accusation against the Society. Now the apostolic process is taking place at the Curia of Naples, a saving of time and money»³².

The matter, or the file on the Ethiopian martyrs, was presented before the Congregation of Rites in 1902, according to the author, under the following title: *Sacra Rituum Congregatione. Emo ac Rmo Domino Card. Cajetano Aloisi-Masella (relatore), Abissinen. Beatificationis seu Declarationi Martirii servorum dei Apollinaris de Almeida Episcopi Nicaeni. Hyacinthi Franceschi, Francisci Ruiz Abraham de Georgiis Gasparis Paez, Joannis Pereira Ludovici Cardeira et Brunonis Bruni sacerdotum Societatis Iesu in odium Catholicae Fidei Interfectorum. Positio Super introductione Causae*³³. Beccari mentions the tensions around the presentation of the file «martyrs of Ethiopia» before the Congregation of Rites and the need to publish the above-mentioned book in order to reject the accusations against the Ethiopian mission. It seems that the slanders and accusations mentioned by Beccari are not contemporary with the author but much older, and date back to the 17th century when the missionaries were expelled from Ethiopia by King Fäsilädäs (1632-1667). In this period, the reason for the «failure» of the mission was imputed to the Jesuits and to their hierarchical superior, the patriarch Afonso Mendes. Mendes arrived in Ethiopia in 1625, and in 1626 received from the hands of the Ethiopian sovereign Susneyos (1607-1632) the latter's submission to the papacy, He henceforth pursued the Latinisation of the Ethiopian Church, which had begun following the king's conversion to Catholicism in 1621³⁴.

From the end of the 1620s, through a series of measures, the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith (founded in 1622) intervened in the debates around the practice of rites to be enforced in Christian Ethiopia³⁵.

While the file on the «martyrs of Ethiopia» was rejected in 1902, the coincidence of the publication, in 1903, of the first volume of the *RÆSOI*, titled *Notizie e saggi di opere i documenti inediti riguardanti la Storie d’Etiopia durante i secoli XVI, XVII e XVIII*, is worthy of interest and suggests a link to Beccari’s position within the Society as postulator, as evidenced by what he writes in the volume *Notizie*:

Finally, I inform you that, in 1890, the case of beatification of two Capuchin Fathers and, in 1902, that of eight Jesuit Fathers, killed, if both for the faith in Ethiopia, were published in the *Posizioni*, documents to which the note refers. And though to the point, the publication of said documents cannot be considered as a true publication, because all that which is published by the Congregation of Rites concerning the cases of servants of God is not public, however I thought to mention it, because such documents, in Rome and elsewhere, are already known by various persons³⁶.

This first volume (of 519 pages), in addition to announcing what the whole collection would cover, by means of an inventory duly listed in the first part (1. The *Histories* and the *Historic Treatises*; 2. the *Relations* and the *letters* from the Jesuits from 1560 to 1713; 3. the *Relations* and the *letters* from persons outside the Society of Jesus from 1630 to 1800), also delivers a very detailed analysis of the historical works that figure in the collection, as well as a summary of the contents of each text in Italian. Also, in the second part, after choosing from the inventory of the *Relations* listed in the first part, he offers a summary in Italian of certain of these. Finally, and thirdly, he chose certain documents (chapters of historic works, letters from Jesuits and persons outside the Society of Jesus), publishing them in full in their original language (Portuguese, Spanish, Latin and Ge’ez³⁷) with an Italian translation opposite. We will come back to these choices. Each set of documents is accompanied by an introduction in which the author presents information on the dating of the manuscripts, the reasons for his choices and contextual elements of the documents and the period of their publication – the beginning of the 20th century. This first volume is the only one in the collection in which Italian is used in the introductions; Latin is used for the critical introductions of subsequent volumes.

From the publication of this first volume, in 1903, Beccari knew precisely what would figure in the announced collection. He also writes,

in the introduction, that he is in possession of a set of photographic copies of the manuscripts³⁸, and that he has spent a certain time in the archives of Lisbon and received the assistance and advice of Francisco Maria Esteves Pereira, as well as four years in the archives of the Propaganda Fide in Rome (and the support of one of the archivists, the Reverend D. Pietro Semadini)³⁹. Beccari's prior work, carried out largely personally⁴⁰, was immense, and there is reason to believe that he began it when he assumed his position as vice postulator of the cases of beatification and canonisation of the Society of Jesus, from 1897.

Putting the concurrent nature of these two projects into perspective invites us to rethink the stakes and the intentions of the publication of the *RÆSOI* and to re-evaluate the demands that were at work within the Society of Jesus in the late 19th and early 20th century. The defence of the file on the «martyrs of Ethiopia» at the end of the 19th century was squarely linked to their actions taken in the 17th century. Pierre-Antoine Fabre has reflected on the «mobility» between «sources» (of the missionary orders, and particularly the Jesuits), «historiography» and «history», and suggests that we see these «like a surprising system of communicating vessels». Otherwise, he continues,

how to isolate the «sources» from a historiography already at work in their conservation – and especially for everything that relates to the administration of the missionary enterprise – and therefore how not to make this historiography into the historical instrument of a permanent *reorganisation* of the institution, to the point, for example, of questioning the place of the publication of modern sources on the history of the Society of Jesus in a long-term perspective on a progressive restoration of the order throughout the course of the 19th century?⁴¹.

It seems to me that this framework of analysis is particularly pertinent in the case of the *RÆSOI* and that it must be considered in the light of this perspective. Because the collection is not only a body of unpublished documents; it is also the manifestation of issues and claims that must be restored, certainly within the institution itself, but also outside.

From an internal point of view, the project of the *RÆSOI* was in line with the decision of the Jesuits at the end of the 19th century, under the generalship of Luis Martín García (1846-1906), to work in a manner consistent with the «modern criticism» that had emerged in Germany and generally in Protestant circles⁴². In 1894 the long work of publication of the *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu* began⁴³, the objective of which was to return to the origins of the order and to fix the past of the «first» Society in order to participate, through writing, in

the refounding of the order. In the spirit of the general, the *Monumenta* was «an excellent means to further inject into the Society the giant spirit of the founder».⁴⁴ The collection began with the publication of the letters of Ignatius of Loyola, and in 1932 turned to the history of the missions. Thus the editorial enterprise of the *RÆSOI* was welcomed as «a real and own series of *Monumenta aethiopica*» by the revue «Civiltà Cattolica» (one of the media organs of the Society of Jesus) from 1903⁴⁵, and in this way participated, through writing, in the refounding of the order and the ordering of an account that would update the actions of the earliest Jesuits in one of the order's first missions⁴⁶. The *Monumenta aethiopica* offered countless documentary resources and «reservoirs» of knowledge. It was welcomed enthusiastically in the circles of learned Orientalist societies, as shown by the account of Abbé Jean-Baptiste Chabot, a great Syrianist (published in 1918, a year after the appearance of the last volume of the *RÆSOI*), in these terms:

The colonial policy of the Western nations was no stranger to the movement, which nowadays has pushed some scholars towards Ethiopian studies. The work relative to languages, to ethnography, to geography, to the history of Abyssinia has grown constantly for 50 years. Among these many publications, none have attained by their range, nor surpassed by their importance, the vast collection of unpublished documents that Father Camillo Beccari has just completed with great erudition, scrupulous care and tireless patience⁴⁷.

While the issues linked to the defence and the existence of the Jesuit order may have appeared through the example of the publication of the *RÆSOI*, others would also be addressed, such as that of Italy's colonial interests in the Horn of Africa.

3. The «*Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales Inediti*» and the European colonial context

The years 1880 to 1920, a moment of intensive translation and critical editing of unpublished documents on Ethiopia, are also the moment when European states divided up Africa, appropriating their conquests by colonisation. To speak only of the Horn of Africa, with the opening of the Suez Canal, in 1869, the Red Sea became a highly strategic zone and of commercial importance. The colonial powers sought to seize possessions along the coast. In the case of the Italians, they installed themselves at Assab in 1882, at Massawa and Beilul in 1885, at Asmara and Keren in 1889. Eritrea became an Italian colony in 1890⁴⁸. More generally, in this global context of the era of imperialism, concerns arose

about the relationship between national interests, Christian universalism and the role of the missions. The chancelleries of the states involved in the wave of colonialism called for a nationalisation of the missionaries, which posed new difficulties for the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, called upon to adapt. As Massimo De Giuseppe points out, the Lombard Seminary for Foreign Missions (the future Pontificio istituto missioni estere, PIME) was conceived on the model of the Foreign Missions Society of Paris. Unlike France, which, since the 1820s, had benefited from an atmosphere of missionary awakening associated with the colonial spirit, the revival of the missionary spirit of the Italian Church came later, and was based on the missionary experiences of the mid-19th century. These began to reverse the decline of the historic congregations and numbers of missionaries, and the demands of a «new missionary» were linked more to assistance and education, and committed to reflect on a direct confrontation with such categories as the nation, the international community, the civilising mission and modernity. Each congregation contributed to redefining (in response to a request from the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith) the spiritual, moral and cultural training of the missionaries. The situation in the colony of Eritrea, due to tensions between the Italian government and the Propagation of the Faith (its goods were sequestered following a decision of the Court of Cassation in 1885), did not incline the Vatican to support the proclamation, in 1890, of the new Italian colony. The situation did not favour Italian colonial ambitions, as was understood perfectly by Francesco Crispi, who, upon returning to government, sought to re-establish good relations with the Roman congregation. In 1894 the apostolic prefecture of Eritrea was established, and was entrusted to the Roman Capuchin Michele Carbonara. After the Battle of Adwa and the crisis of the end of the century, in 1904 the missions in Italian Somalia were rather entrusted to the Trinitarians. The next year Asmara (capital of Eritrea) welcomed the Italian Colonial Congress. The territorial powers given to Italian missionary groups provoked tensions, for example with the French Lazarists, and created tensions within even the Combonians.

The presence of Italian missionaries, from different orders and congregations, made it possible to confront the crisis of different institutional models in the colonies, while living the internal contradictions of the «civilising mission». This helped to test their own missionary method, their own networks with local political institutions, but also to rethink their idea of nation, empire and Christian universalism⁴⁹.

It was in this context of divergent interests that the enterprise of exhuming sources conducted by Beccari sought to assert the anteriority of

the presence of the Jesuits in this zone, even if at the time no members of the order were locally present. The existence of an unpublished documentation, and the power of witness through the texts, argued in favour of their publication, as seen by the financing granted by the colonial authorities (the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the colonial government of Eritrea) for the whole collection published between 1903 and 1917⁵⁰.

The link between the European colonial context and the implementation of the *RÆSOI* project has already been tackled by Martínez d'Alòs-Moner. He insists on the link between the time of colonial expansion, from the middle of the 19th century to the beginning of the 20th, and the interest generated at this time in colonial academic circles in missionary activity in Ethiopia during the 16th and 17th centuries. This colonial historiography «(re)discovers» the documents of the Early Modern period as useful witnesses to the ideology of European expansion⁵¹. The synthetic tableau presented by the author, embellished with a chronological bibliography, gives a measure of the debates that animated the European academic world in this era. As Martínez d'Alòs-Moner concludes: «The collection edited by Beccari itself, an indispensable tool for research today, would have been unthinkable were it not for the great interest that colonial Italy had in looking for friendly memories in lands it wanted to dominate. At the same time, a few points made by colonial or missionary historiography have been assumed into modern historiography without having endured much revision or criticism»⁵².

Attaching himself to the programme outlined in the first volume of the collection, the Jesuit first occupied himself with two manuscripts written in Portuguese preserved in the Roman archives of the Society of Jesus, the first being that of Pedro Páez, *Historia da Ethiopia* (completed around 1622), (538 fol.)⁵³, and the second that of Manuel Barradas, *Tratado primeiro. Do estado da Santa Fé romana em Ethiopia quando se lançou o pregão contra ella; Tratado segundo. Do reino de Tygrê e seus mandos em Ethiopia; Tratado terceiro. Da cidade e fortaleza de Adem* (1634), (204 fol.)⁵⁴. The first two books of Páez's *Historia da Ethiopia* were published in 1905 (in the second volume of the *RÆSOI*), and his last two books (Volume III of the *RÆSOI*) and the *Treatises* of Barradas appeared in 1906 (Volume IV of the *RÆSOI*). In the following years (1907-1908), it was the turn of Manuel de Almeida's manuscript (divided into ten books), the *Historia de Ethiopia a alta ou Abassia, imperio do Abexim, cujo Rey vulgarmente he chamado Preste Joam* (1646) (620 fol.)⁵⁵, preserved in the British Museum (Ms., add. MS 9861) and for which Beccari obtained a photographic copy. In 1907, Volumes V and VI appeared (the first eight books of the *Historia*), and in 1908 came Volume VII (the last two books). The year 1909 was devoted to

the Latin manuscript of the patriarch Afonso Mendes, *Expeditionis Aethiopiae patriarchae Alphonsi Mendesii* (around 1650) (416 fol.), held in boxes at the Society of Jesus in Rome⁵⁶ and figuring in Volumes VIII and IX of the *RÆSOI*. Over the following five years, Beccari devoted himself to the publication of Volumes X to XIV in the collection, which contained the correspondence (from the mid-16th to early 17th century) from Jesuits and individuals outside the Society of Jesus: Iberian kings, viceroys of India, cardinal prefects of the Propaganda Fide, etc.

Finally, Volume XV was published in 1917, consisting of an analytical index covering the entire collection (each volume has its own index). It is a working tool that he proposed by facilitating access to the entire collection. Besides making it easier to navigate through this set of 7000 pages, Volume XV also contributes to the crushing of the collection, thus placing the histories, the treatises and the correspondence on the same level.

While the volumes of the *RÆSOI* appeared at intervals of one or two each year, following the publication (in Portuguese) of Barradas's *Tratados* (Vol. IV, 1906), Beccari offered to translate the second treatise into Italian.

Manuel Barradas entered the Society in 1587 and was sent as a missionary to India, where he served for more than thirty years. After the announcement of the conversion to Catholicism of the Ethiopian king Susneyos, in late 1621, the first contingent of missionaries was sent to Ethiopia. He was part of the group (together with Manuel de Almeida, Luís Cardeira and Francisco Carvalho) that arrived at Massawa in 1624. He left Ethiopia in 1633. It was during his detention by the Turks at Aden that he wrote three geographical treatises of paramount importance, which drew Beccari's attention⁵⁷.

In a reshuffled and simplified Italian version, the most important of the three treatises, focusing on the Tigre region (northern Ethiopia), was published in an Italian colonial revue in 1909 under the title *Il Tigre descritto da un missionario gesuita del secolo XVII*⁵⁸. Three years later, in 1912, a new edition appeared in a deluxe form, augmented with illustrations and ethnographic photographs typical of the period (landscapes, wildlife, plants, portraits, villages, indigenous monasteries...) ⁵⁹. This is a publishing project that differs from the *RÆSOI*, even if it represents a link, in that Barradas's text serves as the matrix for the simplified Italian translation, as Beccari thus informed the reader:

This second edition, made possible by the generous monetary contribution of the Central Directorate of Colonial Affairs and the Government of the colony of Eritrea, is significantly improved and more elegant, with the

addition of new notes and some zinc plates, of photographs kindly and graciously supplied by certain officials of the Colony⁶⁰.

Modern historiography has accorded little importance to the publication of this reshuffled and simplified Italian text, preferring to make use of Barradas's complete text (in Portuguese)⁶¹.

However, to reflect on these successive editions of *Il Tigré descritto da un missionario gesuita del secolo XVII*, and on the paratext (introduction, notes, illustrations...), is to give the full measure of this editorial project and to illuminate its genesis. In his introduction, Beccari presented the different stages of the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia according to a Jesuit-centric perspective and the biography of the author on which he would rely; he then developed all the interest there would be for Italian-language speakers to learn what one of their coreligionists had written three centuries earlier. Let us allow him to explain:

I thought I was doing an agreeable thing for readers who did not know old Portuguese, to present to them an Italian version of the Portuguese *Treatise*, from which we will see what opinion we had of the Portuguese missionaries from the whole Ethiopian region, which extends between the River Tacassè and the sea, and like them believed the opportunity to establish a European colony, which through the prosperity of commerce would one day become flourishing. And I believe that for we Italians, who today possess a colony in the same region, it could be useful to understand the importance (the missionaries) gave to the climate and to the products of this same (region), where for long years they lived and carefully noted down each thing. If party-political interests had not for so long thrown discredit upon the colony of Eritrea, going so far as to say it was nothing but a heap of sand⁶² famous for nothing but malign fevers, and that we had not thus created almost a climate of antipathy for everything that happens to our colony, perhaps it would have reached the same degree of prosperity that Barradas foresaw for the Portuguese colony, which he planned to establish from Massawa to the Marèb⁶³.

Barradas's 17th-century project to establish a colony in northern Ethiopia represents the argument legitimising the Italian presence in Eritrea. Beccari's fascination with Barradas's account is obvious. His «colleague» of three centuries earlier had given a precise geographic and ethnographic description that would provide all the «light», and would serve «we Italians, who possess a colony». Beccari concludes:

These wise considerations [were] written three centuries ago by Father Barradas, great connoisseur as he was of Abyssinian people and things. Tigray is still as it was described by Barradas, and the inhabitants are unchanged

both in nature and in custom. I wish in consequence that Italy, which has become the patron of this vast Ethiopian territory, running from the Mareb to the Red Sea, profits from the experience of the old missionary and attempts seriously once and for all to derive from this colony the advantages that until now [Italy] has not wanted nor been able to win⁶⁴.

To the vision of a static time is added Beccari's admiration for the writing style, «the integrity, the naive simplicity and the personal experience of the authors (Barradas, Páez and de Almeida), which gives an incalculable historical value to these writings»⁶⁵.

His work of recovering texts, and the abridged edition in Italian, would enlighten and convince the doubters, the opponents of the Italian occupation of Eritrea (and of Libya), and lead them to recognise the sound footing of such an enterprise. As Martínez d'Alòs-Moner rightly emphasises, «The peoples engaged in European colonial expansion looked with admiration upon the inquiries of Portuguese missionaries and agents of the modern period. As a result, the Portuguese were seen as the “pioneers” of the explored areas that colonial nations coveted»⁶⁶.

This digression through the literature produced by Beccari, what we would today call «popularisation», provides insight into the production of the *RÆSOI* in all its facets. It is no longer simply a collection marking out a new scientific field but rather a space of claims, whose stakes must be measured, along with the processes that generated these different projects. It is starting from this reflection that I engage in a rereading of the *RÆSOI*, which for objective reasons has become an essential reference.

4. *The «Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales Inediti»: the essential reference*⁶⁷

From a methodological perspective, no criticism can be levelled at the collection of manuscripts: their origin, their presentation – systematically preceded by a critical introduction – and the highly erudite notes confer an undeniable value. Beccari conducted a patient work of collation and transcription, scrupulous of the criteria of scientific analysis of the time, as advanced by the methodical school. Beccari's methods align with those at work within the Jesuit order, and stimulated under the generalship of Luis Martín García (1846-1906), with this main objective: «It is proposed that the historiography of the Society be resumed, but more in conformity with modern criticism» in

recommending a history in which «real facts are firm like numbers, and mathematical and physical laws, and are incontestable. History, then, is neither Protestant nor Catholic, nor is it a matter of sects or parties, but has a scientific, immutable and binding objectivity»⁶⁸. He called on those responsible for the *Monumenta* to be «only editors, not commentators on the documents», and, as Martin Morales emphasises, «It was believed that the truth, which could always be discussed within the narrative, would be laid bare under the “pitiless light” of the critical edition»⁶⁹.

The work of Beccari is in line with what is practised within the Jesuit order and by those charged with contributing to historiography through the use of archives. This collection, published at the start of the 20th century, became an essential reference to the extent that most contemporary historians interested either in the missionary phenomenon in Ethiopia or in the history of the Ethiopian Christian kingdom in the «modern» period will, at one time or another, cite one or more volumes of the collection. This inescapable nature was linked to the fact that only the *RÆSOI* permitted access to certain of the published texts (Almeida in its entirety, Mendes and, even more so, the collection of letters that take up Volumes X to XIV). The fact remains that we are witnessing the categorisation of «sources», the analytical index (Volume XV) providing, for its part, entry into the universe of the collection, almost to avoid getting lost in its more than 7.000 pages. Through this colossal labour of ordering, Beccari was persuaded that the whole collection would be able to fill in the «lacunae» in the Ethiopian sources and to do «justice» to the action of his co-religionists during the 16th and 17th centuries, and, in a more general way, to «write a true and impartial history of Ethiopia and the various Catholic missions in this region from the 16th to the 17th century»⁷⁰. In this way he created a specific field of Jesuit knowledge on Ethiopia, and, as Jean-Claude Laborie emphasises with respect to the work of the Jesuit Serafim Leite on Brazil, participates in a much vaster project: «the affirmation of the unity, and thus the specificity, of the Order [the Society of Jesus]»⁷¹.

The other argument presented by Beccari to justify the publication of unpublished documents consists in his being at odds with conceptions that prevailed in the 17th century, in Rome as in Portugal, where, according to him, the possibility that a text would be published was primarily a matter of the elegance of the style. It was thus that Baltasar Teles, the provincial of the Portuguese province, «in an elegant Portuguese, and with a style that conformed to the taste of the period» published, in 1660, his *Historia geral de Ethiopia*⁷². Having no experi-

ence of this missionary field, he wrote it from the manuscript of Manuel de Almeida, who had spent almost ten years in Ethiopia. The point of view supported by Beccari, at the beginning of the 20th century, is the opposite of that of his predecessor, Teles. He defends the idea of a return to the original sources, because it is in their simplicity of style, their experience of the terrain and the quality of the eyewitness testimony of the writers that the «truth» could emerge. He himself addresses the reader in the preface to Volume II of the *RÆSOI*: «With the help of his writing and these documents, all the fables that have long slipped into the history of Ethiopia and have been spread by ignorant writers right up to our time, will be easily dissipated»⁷³. The recurring idea of «fables being easily dissipated» echoes one of the motivations of Pedro Páez, who wrote nearly three centuries earlier in order to overturn those of the Dominican Luis de Urreta.

What does Beccari deliver in publishing the *RÆSOI*? He takes up all the composite documentation of the 17th-century missionaries and articulates it around two sets. On the one hand, there are the texts written by the missionaries from Ethiopia (histories, treatises...), and, on the other, there are all the letters and missionary relations written from and on the sites of mission, missives in response to or dealing with questions relating to the situation of the Ethiopian mission. The material gathered, through the good offices of Beccari, gave the impression of a collection that was as broad as possible, the correspondence completing and filling in what the histories and treatises could not have addressed.

Let us quickly summarise the aims and content of these histories and treatises. The first two authors, Pedro Páez and Manuel de Almeida, titled their manuscripts *Historia de Ethiopia*. For them, it was not about writing a history of the mission but rather about integrating this into a much larger account going back to the first centuries of our era, when Ethiopia became Christian. The thesis they defend is of a Christianity that implanted itself in Ethiopia but was distorted because of the ecclesiastical ties maintained with the Patriarchate of Alexandria. Thus the gathering of local texts and their partial use (extracts from theological treatises, hagiographic narratives, royal chronicles and lists, etc.) serve as arguments to support their demonstration and highlight how time and isolation have led to the «straying» of Christian Ethiopia. In consequence, the narrative of their presence fits into this long-term process and describes in great detail the actions of the Jesuits to reform this Christianity. Páez's text ends at a significant point, the conversion of King Susneyos to Catholicism, in 1621, the year the author died as a result of severe fevers. However, the three other accounts, those of

Almeida, Barradas and Mendes, who experienced the expulsion of the missionaries from Ethiopia in 1633, give their narratives an additional dimension and interpretation. The return to the «true faith» had failed due to the obstinacy of the clergy and the deeply rooted nature of the Alexandrine faith. While the texts of these authors historicised the mission to a much wider Ethiopian religious history, the unpublished correspondence of the *RÆSOI* (Volumes X to XIII) was only interested in the period of their presence and following their expulsion, that is, from the mid-16th to the late 17th century.

While the first set of documents published by Beccari (Volumes II to IX) made visible the manuscripts of the Ethiopian missionaries in their entirety, with the most complete critical apparatus, the second group (Volumes X to XIII) of the *RÆSOI*, supposed to present the writings of the missionaries in a different light, returned to the ordering of a Jesuit narrative by essentially publishing documents related to the mission. The chronologically organised historical compendium devoted to the correspondence constrains reading and gives credibility to the published correspondence, the latter fully responding in a kind of echo. For example, an extract from a letter of the Portuguese sovereign, in answer to a letter from a father in Ethiopia, corresponds to the latter and helps to give unity and coherence to the actions or claims of the Jesuits in Ethiopia. «Internal» correspondence (members of the Society) and «external» correspondence (Iberian monarchs, viceroys of India, popes, cardinal prefects of Propaganda Fide...) are mixed. The requirement to publish any unpublished document having a link to or evoking the Ethiopian mission, in a movement that starts from the mission (generally with a complete edition of the manuscripts) and goes on to more distant locations (Goa, Rome, Lisbon), for which exclusively extracts on Ethiopia are published, organises the historical narrative in a linear fashion but breaks the generic relationship of the texts and forces a directed reading.

Thus, the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia is presented by Beccari in the following order: Book one, *Patriarcha Andreas Oviedo* (1534-1592) *RÆSOI*, 10, 1910; Book two, *Pater Petrus Páez* (1589-1623), *RÆSOI*, 11, 1911; Book three, *Patriarcha Alfonsus Mendez* (1622-1635), *RÆSOI*, 12, 1912; Book four, *Missionis Eversio (expulsion)* (1633-1672), *RÆSOI*, 13, 1913.

Each book is associated with a tutelary figure (apart from the fourth) representing, in the Beccarian vision, the period covered by the documents he publishes, but the chronology offered does not correspond to any personal history of the three Jesuits. He naturalises a chronology, sets the periods of the mission and places individuals in

the foreground, in particular Father Pedro Páez, who until now had remained on the edge of this history and who, in the early 20th century, according to Beccari, must be rehabilitated.

5. *Volume I of the «Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales Inediti»: the intentions and stakes of the collection*

But let us return one last time to the first volume of the *RÆSOI*, published in 1903 and until now considered by historiography as an inventory, or summary, of what the reader would find in the rest of the collection. Looking into the details, it would appear that it is much more than an inventory and a presentation of what Beccari intends to publish in the collection. And, in particular, the third book of this first volume reveals and captures the intentions and the stakes of the collection. From its appearance in 1903, reports appeared in various European learned journals⁷⁴. One of these, written by Lucien Bouvat in the *Journal Asiatique* in 1904, described as a «most curious choice» the decision made by Beccari about the documents he decided to publish in this third part⁷⁵. Unlike this author, the secretary of a learned society bringing together the greatest names in Orientalism of the period, it seems to me, on the contrary, that Beccari's choice, far from being curious (even in the sense of curiosity), gives the full measure of what the Jesuit sought to do in publishing this first series of unpublished documents. Beccari published in chronological order 32 documents from the middle of the 16th century to the end of the 17th century⁷⁶. We can see at least three series of arguments here. The first concerns the question of the file on the Jesuit martyrs of the 17th century. Documents XI to XIII are signed letters from Apolinar de Almeida, bishop and auxiliary of the patriarch, and Bruno Bruni that describe the circumstances of the persecution that began in the first year of the reign of King Fäsilädäs (1632-1667). Publishing them here was an additional piece to be argued in this coedited dossier. As Beccari wrote in the introduction to the documents: «All [these letters] are characteristic, and of considerable importance, and can serve to give an idea of the temperament, culture and spirit of these three figures⁷⁷, who did so much for the mission [...], after countless rigours for the mission generously shed blood for the faith they preached»⁷⁸.

The second defence insists on the full and complete legitimacy of the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia. Documents I and II are from Ignatius of Loyola: the first, addressed to the Portuguese king João III regarding the responsibility of the patriarch and the two bishop coadjutors, was

written between 1551 and 1553⁷⁹; the second, consisting of instructions addressed to the patriarch João Nunes Barreto for the «reduction» of the kingdoms of Prester John to the union of the Church and the Catholic religion, was written between 1554 and 1555⁸⁰. These texts, the oldest on the Jesuit mission, are foundational in two ways: they were written on the initiative of the founder of the Society of Jesus, for whom the mission in Ethiopia was of prime importance, and foundational in the sense that they fixed the terms and programme that the missionaries were to implement. Finally, they emphasised the very specific links between the Society of Jesus and the Portuguese *padroado*, such as the appointment and choice by the king of the ecclesiastical hierarchy called to go on the terrain of the mission. The documents that follow, in the *saggio* III, are unpublished letters of the Ethiopian king Susneyos, attesting to the royal wish to submit himself to the Roman Church on condition of receiving European military assistance. Written in Ge'ez, followed by a Latin translation for the first, and Spanish and Portuguese for the others, the letters are proof of the involvement of the missionaries in the religious and political affairs of Ethiopia in the first third of the 17th century and of their investment in driving the founder's programme.

The selection of published documents allows Beccari to emphasise the extent to which the textual production of the Jesuits of the 16th and 17th centuries is at once very precise as regards Ethiopia's political and religious situation, a faithful rendering of the lived situations, and, subsequently, offers a counterpoint to other documents, which, unlike those of the Jesuits, show a great lack of knowledge of Ethiopia's political and religious situation. This is the goal of documents XIV to XVIII, letters written by the first Franciscan apostolic prefects, Father Antonio da Virgoletta and Father Antonio da Pescopagno, and addressed to the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, between 1639 and 1648⁸¹. Their inability to return to central Ethiopia, following the expulsion of the Jesuits from 1633 by the new sovereign, Fäsilädäs, and the closure of the kingdom to any individual claiming to be Catholic, prevented them from providing information other than that given by the few Ethiopians passing through Ottoman-dominated Suakin⁸². Beccari continued his anthology of documents (XIX) by publishing a letter of Matteo de Castro, a Minorite friar, bishop of Chrysopolis and apostolic vicar of Ethiopia, addressed to the Jesuit Parisiani, from Moka, on 20 August 1650. In the introduction to the document, he explains his choice: «The writing of Matteo de Castro [...] would not deserve, in the name of truth, to remain forgotten, as it has remained until now; so much is it filled with acerbic and vulgar invective against such a re-

spectable missionary, the father Parisiani, and against a religious order as a whole; but I wanted to publish it to show that Patriarch Mendez, when, in his letter to the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith and later in his *Historia*, he drew a less flattering portrait of said bishop, shows great moderation and did not take into account all he could have»⁸³. Beccari's selection of this letter was intentional and echoes the second part of this first volume, in which were presented the principal manuscripts, in particular that of Afonso Mendez, *Expeditionis aethyopicae Patriarchae Alphonsi Mendesii...* His book IV devotes many chapters (from 20 to 28) where Mendez narrates events from his point of view and refutes the main slanders contained in the *Monitorio* (?), written by Matteo de Castro to the Jesuit Parisiani⁸⁴. Without going into the detail of the controversy, what seems worthy of interest is the way in which Beccari returns to the stakes of the mid-17th century.

When the Jesuits were expelled from Ethiopia, in 1633, the reasons had to be determined. Initially, the survivors of the mission, together with their leader, the patriarch Afonso Mendez, worked on this as soon as they reached Goa. The explanation provided by the Jesuit missionaries was the untenable political situation confronted by King Susneyos following his conversion to Catholicism (in 1622). Numerous uprisings of «vassals» had constrained the power of his successor, in the person of Fäsilädäs, to return to the «Alexandrine faith», as the principal Jesuits of the mission wrote in a document drafted by several hands (between 14 October and 11 December 1641) and attesting to the excellent «government» of Patriarch Mendez⁸⁵. This relatively short document, two pages in length, summarises the position defended by the missionaries, and is only one document among many (edited by Beccari in the third volume of the RÆSOI) repeating the reasons for their eviction to anyone who wished to hear. Their management of religious affairs was not in question.

In Rome, however, and from the point of view of the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith (created in 1622), the fact that the Jesuits had been the only order present on Ethiopian soil was, on the one hand, problematic. From the time of the congregation of 26 July 1627, the commission had campaigned for other orders, particularly the Franciscans, to be there. On the other hand, after the expulsion of the Jesuits from Ethiopia in 1633, since they had necessarily failed somewhere, by imposing the Latin rituals and customs on the Ethiopian church by «main force», sending representatives of another religious order, in particular the Franciscans (in the person of Antonio da Virgoletta and two other companions), would allow, first, the exploration of the possibility of a resumption of the Ethiopian mis-

sion, and, second, the remedying of the «damage» caused by the Jesuits. This decision was confirmed by the Congregation on 10 January 1634⁸⁶.

In returning to the stakes and controversies of the 17th century, between, on the one hand, the Jesuits linked to the Portuguese *padroado*, and, on the other hand, the wish of Propaganda Fide to take control of the Church's missionary activities, Beccari defends the activity carried out by his coreligionists, and the supporting documents insist both on their good management of religious affairs and on their infinitely superior knowledge to that of the following religious orders.

The publication of document XX (a copy of a letter from the Jesuit father Francesco Storer to Father Giovanni Calaça, rector of the college of Diu, from Gondar, Ethiopia, 1657)⁸⁷ underlines how, 25 years after the expulsion of the Jesuits from Ethiopia, once again, only the Society had managed to get one of its members into Ethiopia. Their skill, their precise understanding of the situation and the insistent demand of the patriarch Afonso Mendez, who remained in Goa, had led to the success of the enterprise. Having reached the court of Fäsilädäs (the «sworn enemy» of the Jesuits), by posing as an Armenian doctor, the Jesuit Storer was able to assess the religious situation in the very heart of the Ethiopian Christian kingdom.

Beccari's staging of this anthology of unpublished documents sought to take part in the debates of the late 19th and early 20th century when the question of the beatification of the Jesuit martyrs of Ethiopia was in competition with that of the Capuchin and Lazarist martyrs. As Martínez d'Alòs-Moner emphasises, in the second half of the 19th century Catholic missionaries (Capuchin and Lazarist) conducted important missions in Ethiopia. Supported by the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, once again, after almost two centuries' absence from Ethiopia, the Church regained its foothold and the Ethiopian space was this time shared between two Catholic orders other than the Jesuits. Two charismatic figures, Guiglelmo Massaja (1809-1889)⁸⁸ and Giustino De Jacobis (1800-1860)⁸⁹, enjoyed great popularity in Europe. Massaja, who in 1884 received the cardinal's purple from Pope Leo XIII (1878-1903), was encouraged by the latter to pen his own Ethiopian missionary experiences, known under the title *I miei 35 anni di missione nell'alta Etiopia* and published by the presses of the Propagation of the Faith between 1885 and 1895. As for the Lazarist Giustino De Jacobis, apostolic prefect of Ethiopia, who died in Ethiopia in 1860 following persecution, it marked the beginning of an important hagiographic production for the opening, from 1904, of a trial for his beatification⁹⁰.

It was evidently in echo of these events that Beccari's work of exhuming the texts on the Jesuit martyrs of the XVII century must be inscribed. The Society of Jesus and its general, Luis Martín, preoccupied with and interested in historiographic research, encouraged the uncovering of past memories of the Jesuits of Ethiopia⁹¹. At the same time, what Beccari's work of compilation and investigation revealed was the competition between the Catholic missionary orders over the Ethiopian space, the study of which would require a survey of the textual and historiographical production of the other two Catholic orders but which goes beyond the limits of this investigation.

The third series of arguments in this documentary set, published in the third part of Volume I, deal with questions related to geography. Documents V, VI, VII and IX are chapters on the different historical works of the 17th-century Jesuits. The first is a chapter from the *Treatise* by Barradas (number V), titled «The seaports of this kingdom [Tigre], in particular Massua [Massawa]». In the introduction Beccari bluntly writes: «I thought to provide as a document the chapter in which he deals with Massawa, not because it is the most important, but because, after the Italian occupation of the port and the surrounding region, it seemed to me that it would have a certain appeal in the present»⁹². These are presented as both ancient and European narratives, and therefore as offering a state of knowledge to Italy, occupying these spaces at the start of the 20th century. Document IX⁹³, a chapter from Mendez's *Expeditionis aethyopicae Patriarchae Alphonsi Mendesii*, raised the same concern as Barradas's chapter. The passage of the expedition of Patriarch Mendez through the Danakil region (northeastern Ethiopia, south of the port of Massawa), and its geographic and ethnographic description, would be of interest in this documentary compilation, especially as it was the only expedition to have passed through these places, spaces now occupied by the Italian colony of Eritrea.

On the other hand, documents VI⁹⁴ and VII⁹⁵, consisting of a facsimile of the map drawn up by Manuel de Almeida in the 17th century, together with a contemporary map from 1903, and the chapter from Almeida's manuscript on the sources of the Nile (which is added to that of Páez), fitted into the debate around geography and the place occupied by the Jesuits in the field of cartographic knowledge. Beccari considered it essential to publish the map in the first volume of the collection, considering «this map of great importance for the history of geography, as that which was the first traced by a European hand on these places, and upon which all others leaned on for a century»⁹⁶. Beccari highlighted the foundational quality of the map, and saw its importance for the debates related to geographical questions.

The choices made by Beccari in Volume I of the *RÆSOI*, the excerpts from the various works of 17th-century missionaries, the diverse and varied documents covering the period from the 16th to the 18th century, all related to a very specific intention. It was about historically rewriting the role played by the Jesuits in Ethiopia in the 16th and 17th century, making visible a documentation that had remained unpublished and claiming, within the Catholic world of the late 19th and early 20th century, the action of the Jesuits compared to the other orders – the Franciscans, the Capuchins and the Lazarists⁹⁷...

At the end of this inquiry into the trajectory of Camillo Beccari, the focus on the production of the *RÆSOI* invites us to take a step sideways and to no longer see, read and use this collection simply as an assemblage of reservoirs of facts, but rather to see it «like a monument whose series of successive architectural reworkings produces its final structure»⁹⁸. The itinerary of Beccari's career, with its many occupations, allows us to glimpse how and why he embarked on such a venture, and the particularity of this «specialist» in holiness, little remarked thus far, invites a more critical reading of the sources that he edited at a sustained rate.

[Translation by Alfred LeMaitre]

HERVÉ PENNEC
Institut des mondes africains
CNRS/IRD/EHESS/Paris 1/EPHE/AMU
herve.pennec@univ-amu.fr

Note al testo

* The expression «holiness specialist» is from Pierre-Antoine Fabre.

¹ The bibliography on the subject is considerable, and I will limit myself to citing the principal recent titles: FELDE BEIENE, *La politica Cattolica di Seltan Sägäd I (1607-1632) e la missione della Compagnia di Gesù in Etiopia: Precedenti, evoluzione e problematiche 1589-1632*, (ODI) 1983; H. PENNEC, *Des jésuites au royaume du prêtre Jean*, Paris 2003; L. COHEN S...T, *The missionary strategies of the Jesuits in Ethiopia (1555-1632)*, Wiesbaden 2009; A. MARTÍNEZ D'ALÒS-MONER, *Envoys of a human god: The Jesuit mission to Christian Ethiopia, 1557-1632*, Leiden 2015.

² A. DILLMANN, *Catalogus codicum manuscriptorum bibliothecae boldeiane oxoniensis. Pars VII codices Aethiopiici*, Oxford 1848; A. D'ABBADIE, *Catalogue raisonné des manuscrits éthiopiens appartenant à Antoine d'Abbadie*, Paris 1859; H. ZOTENBERG, *Catalogues des manuscrits éthiopiens (gbeez et ambarique) de la Bibliothèque Nationale*, Paris 1877; W. WRIGHT, *Catalogue of the Ethiopian manuscripts in the British Museum acquired since the year 1847*, London 1877; L. GOLDSCHMIDT, *Die Abyssinischen Handschriften der Stadtbibliothek zu Frankfurt am Main (Rüppel'sche Sammlung). Nebst Anhängen und Auszügen verzeichnet und beschrieben*, Berlin 1897; for an exhaustive inventory of libraries and Ethiopian manuscripts, see C. BOSCH-TEISSÉ,

M.-L. DERAT, A. WION, *Inventaire des bibliothèques et des catalogues des manuscrits éthiopiens*, in «Menestrel» (2017), <http://www.menestrel.fr/spip.php?rubrique694&lang=fr>.

³ As Bertrand Hirsch emphasises, the distinction between historical chronicle and religious texts is far from obvious, both «this game, habitual in Ethiopian chronicles, between the detailed account of the years of the reign of a king and the permanent convocation of models emanating most often from religious literature». Bertrand Hirsch, *De Joseph Halévy à Flavius Josèphe*, «Annales d'Éthiopie», 16 (2000), p. 376.

⁴ G. BOURDÉ, H. MARTIN, *Les écoles historiques*, Paris 1997, p. 181.

⁵ Entry of K. BENDANA, A. MESSAOUDI, *Journal asiatique*, in F. POUILLON (ed.), *Dictionnaire des orientalistes de langue française*, Paris 2012, pp. 526-7.

⁶ Jules François Célestin Perruchon (1853-1907) was a French philologist and specialist in Ge'ez; he studied the language under the direction of Joseph Halévy at the École Pratique des Hautes Études (EPHE) at the Sorbonne; for his various works, A. WION, *Jules François Célestin Perruchon*, in S. UHLIG, A. BAUSI (eds), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 4, Wiesbaden 2010, pp. 134-5.

⁷ René Basset (1855-1924), «professor of Arabic and Berber, director of the Faculty of Letters of Algiers. After a first year in which he followed, conjointly, lectures in philology, Greek antiquities and history at the EPHE, he decides to devote himself specially to Oriental languages by following teaching in Arabic (but also Hebrew, Syriac, Ethiopian and Ancient Egyptian) [...] Graduate in letters, he is admitted to Société Asiatique, which publishes in its *Journal* a first work on a Berber text («Poème de çabi en dialecte chelha», May-June 1879). Recommended by Michel Bréal, he was in charge in 1880 of the complementary Arabic language course at the l'École supérieure des lettres, which had just been established in Algiers. [...] Nevertheless he did not abandon Ethiopian studies (*Études sur l'histoire d'Éthiopie*, Paris 1881-1882), on which was based his principal thesis (*Étude sur l'histoire comparée du Yémen et de l'Éthiopie, depuis Jésus Christ jusqu'à Mohammed, d'après les sources grecques et orientales*; the work remains unfinished»; see the entry on A. MESSAOUDI, *Les arabisants et la France coloniale 1780-1930, Annexes*, Lyon 2015, <http://books.openedition.org/enseditions/3730>.

⁸ William Eliot Conzelman was a student of Joseph Halévy, and translated and composed an introduction for his degree from the EPHE, the *Chronique de Galawdéwos*, Paris 1895.

⁹ Ignazio Guidi (1844-1935), an Italian scholar who was professor of Semitic languages at the University of Rome from 1876 to 1919. From 1885 he held the chair of *Storia e lingue d'Abissinia* at the same university. For a list of his works, see L. RICCI, *Ignazio Guidi*, in S. UHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 2, Wiesbaden 2005, pp. 908-9.

¹⁰ Francesco Béguinot (1879-1953), an Italian Orientalist who, under the direction of Ignazio Guidi, studied Semitic languages and acquired a solid competence in Ge'ez and Arabic. In 1901, he made an important contribution to Ethiopian studies in the form of an annotated translation of the «short chronicles» already published by René Basset in 1881; see G. LUSINI, *Francesco Béguinot*, in S. UHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 1, Wiesbaden 2003, pp. 521-2.

¹¹ Carlo Conti Rossini (1872-1949), an Italian Ethiopianist who had a career in the Italian colonial administration in Eritrea and as a «field» linguist, which led him to publish numerous Ethiopian manuscripts; see L. RICCI, *Carlo Conti Rossini*, in S. UHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 1, Wiesbaden 2003, pp. 791-2.

¹² See the entry by M. KLEINER, *Dillmann, Christian Friedrich August*, in S. UHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 2, Wiesbaden 2005, pp. 160-1.

¹³ See the entry by P. MARRASSINI, *Kebrä nägäst*, in S. UHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 3, Wiesbaden 2007, pp. 364-8.

¹⁴ See Chapter 1 in H. PENNEC, *Historiographie, productions de savoirs missionnaires, terrains, archéologie: Éthiopie XVIe-XXIe siècle*, Paris 2019, pp. 35-69, <https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-02196962>.

¹⁵ See article by A. BAUSI, *Philology, research in*, in S. UHLIG, A. BAUSI (eds.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopia*, 4, Wiesbaden 2010, pp. 142-4.

¹⁶ See A. CHEKROUN, *Le Futuh al-Habasha: Ecriture de l'histoire, guerre et société dans le Bar Sa'ad ad-din (Ethiopie, XVI^e siècle)*, doctoral thesis, University of Paris 1, 2013, dir. B. HIRSCH; for example, the work of R. BASSET, *Histoire de la conquête de l'Abyssinie (XVI^e siècle) par Chibab el-Din Ahmed Ben Abd el-Qâder surnommé l'Arab Faqih*, Paris 1897, 2 vols.

¹⁷ C. BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi di opere e documenti inediti riguardanti la storia di Etiopia durante i secoli XVI, XVII, XVIII*, in *Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales inediti a saeculo XVI ad XIX*, 1, Rome, 1903, p. IV.

¹⁸ *Ivi*, p. III.

¹⁹ O. RAGGIO, A. TORRE, *Prefazione*, in E. GRENDI (a cura di), *In altri termini, Etnografia e storia di una società di antico regime* (MIB) in 2004, pp. 5-37; A. TORRE, *Production of Locality in the Early Modern and Modern Age: Locales (Microhistories)*, London-New York 2019, pp. 1-14.

²⁰ C. GINZBURG, *Signes, Traces, Pistes - Racines d'un paradigme de l'indice*, in «Le Débat», 6 (1980), pp. 3-44.

²¹ A. TORRE, «Faire Communauté: Confréries et localité dans une vallée du Piémont (XVII^e-XVIII^e siècle)», in «Annales, Histoire et sciences sociales», 1 (2007), p. 101-7.

²² M. ZANFREDINI, *Beccari, Camillo*, in J.M. DOMÍNGUEZ (S.J.) and C.E. O'NEILL (S.J.) (eds.), *Diccionario histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, 1, Madrid 2001, p. 381; *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, 7, Roma 1965, p. 432; O. RAINERI, *Beccari, Camillo*, in S. D'HLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, 1 (W) sbaden 2003, p. 513.

²³ *Ibid.*

²⁴ ZANFREDINI, *Beccari cit.*, p. 381.

²⁵ C. BECCARI, *Brevi notizie intorno alla vita e alle virtù di Maria Polverosi vedova Beccari*, Rome 1910, 18 pages.

²⁶ All the factual information is taken from this booklet.

²⁷ ZANFREDINI, *Beccari cit.*, p. 381.

²⁸ L. COHEN SHABOT, *Almeida, Apolinar de*, in S. D'HLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, 1 (20) p. 207.

²⁹ ZANFREDINI, *Beccari cit.*, p. 381.

³⁰ L. COHEN SHABOT, A. MARTÍNEZ D'ALÒS-MONER, *The Jesuit Mission in Ethiopia (16th-17th Centuries): An Analytical Bibliography*, in «Aethiopica», 9 (2006), pp. 190-212.

³¹ In 1633, while the majority of the Jesuits were expelled, eight of them remained hidden in order to minister to the Ethiopian converts to Catholicism. The last two, fathers Luis de Cardeira (1585-1640) and Bruno Bruni (1590-1640) were publicly executed in northern Ethiopia, south of Adwa, on 12 April 1640. See F. MKENDA, *Jesuit Involvement in Africa, 1548-2017*, in I.G. Županov (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits* (Oxford Handbooks Online), Oxford 2018; on this question of the martyrs, see also MARTÍNEZ D'ALÒS-MONER, *Envoyés cit.*, pp. 332-4.

³² C. BECCARI, *Stato presente delle Cause di Beatificazione dei servi di Dio appartenenti alla C. di Gesù*, Roma 1909, p. 8.

³³ Copy consulted at the Academia das Ciências (*Fonds Esteves Pereira*, shelf no. 13. 20. 9). Beccari is not the author of these texts, but his name and his position as postulator general are mentioned many times.

³⁴ PENNEC, *Des jésuites cit.*, pp. 227-32; ELDE BEIENE, *La politica Cattolica cit.* pp. 236-42.

³⁵ This competition between orders became more complex with the presence of Propaganda Fide, claiming and criticising the actions of the Jesuits in Ethiopia to the papacy (Archivio della Congregazione de Propaganda Fide, série Congressi Missioni Miscellanea, vol. III, f. 203-241v (on Ethiopia f. 236-39), J. METZLER, *Orientalion, programme et premières décisions (1622-1649)*, in *Sacrae Congregationis de Propaganda Fide memoria rerum, 350 ans*

au service des missions, 1622-1972, I/1 1622-1700, Rome-Freiburg-Wien, 1971, pp. 146-96.

36 BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., pp. 73-4.

37 For the Ge'ez he turned to the Orientalist Ignacio Guidi. (Ivi, p. VI).

38 Ivi, p. 3.

39 Ivi, p. VI.

40 Ivi, p. V.

41 P.-A. FABRE, *Pour une histoire spirituelle des savoirs dans l'espace du monde moderne: Esquisse d'un point de vue*, in C. DE CASTELNAU-L'ESTOILE, M.-L. COPETE, A. MALDAVSKY, I. G. ŽUPANOV (dir.) *Missions d'évangélisation et circulation des savoirs, XVIe-XVIIIe siècle*, Madrid 2011, p. 447; see also P.-A. FABRE, A. ROMANO, *Les jésuites dans le monde moderne: Nouvelles approches*, in «Revue de synthèse», 2-3 (1999), pp. 247-60.

42 See the chapter by M. MORALES, *The Restoration of the Society of Jesus and the Vagaries of writing*, in I.G. ŽUPANOV (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits* (Oxford Handbooks Online), Oxford 2018, 2019.

43 For the history of this collection, see the article by J.-F. GILMONT (S.J.), *Histoire et contenu des Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu*, in «Lettres du Bas-Canada», 14 (1960), pp. 133-53.

44 MORALES, *The Restoration* cit., p. 965.

45 «Civiltà Cattolica», 1 (1903), p. 84 (cited in P. TACCHI VENTURI (S.J.), *Pietro Paez. Apostolo dell'Abissinia al principio del sec. XVII*, in «Civiltà Cattolica», 3 (1905), p. 560.

46 The case of the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia and publication of unpublished documents is one example among many others. See, for example, the Brazilian mission and the unpublished documents studied so convincingly by J.-C. LABORIE in *Mangeurs d'homme et mangeurs d'âme: Une correspondance missionnaire au XVIe siècle, la lettre jésuite du Brésil, 1549-1568*, Paris 2003, pp. 454-73.

47 J.-B. CHABOT, *Histoire de l'Éthiopie. Premier article [Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales inediti a saeculo XVI ad saeculum XIX, curante C. Beccari S. I], quinze vol. in 4°*, Rome, C. de Luigi, 1903-1917, in «Journal des savants», 16 (1918), pp. 83-92.

48 BAHRU ZEWEDE *History of Modern Ethiopia, 1855-1974*, London-Athens-Addis Abeba 1991, pp. 72-6; N. CABANCA, *Outre-mer: Histoire de l'expansion coloniale italienne*, Grenoble 2014, pp. 69-99.

49 M. DE GIUSEPPE, *Orizzonti missionari, coloniali, terzomondisti*, in A. MELLONI (ed.), *Cristiani d'Italia*, Roma 2011 [online].

50 C. BECCARI (ed.), *Il Tigré descritto da un missionario gesuita del secolo XVII*, Seconda edizione con illustrazioni e nuove note, Rome 1912, pp. 13-14. A wider investigation of the financing granted would show the position the Jesuit order was able to occupy in this editorial arrangement.

51 A. MARTÍNEZ D'ALÓS-MONER, *Colonialism and Memory: The Portuguese and Jesuit activities in Ethiopia through the Colonial-looking Glass*, in «Studies of the Department of African languages and cultures», 41 (2007), pp. 73-91; *Europe and Ethiopia's Isolation: The Ethio-Jesuit Paradigm revised (17th cent.)*, in L. GERHARDT, H. MÄHLE, J. ORENBRÜGGE, W. WEISSE (eds.), *Umbrüche in afrikanischen Gesellschaften und ihre Bewältigung Beiträge aus dem Sonderforschungsbereich 520*, Hamburg 2007, pp. 223-33.

52 MARTÍNEZ D'ALÓS-MONER, *Colonialism* cit., p. 82.

53 Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (hereafter ARSI), Roma, Ms. Goa 42.

54 ARSI, Rome, Ms. Goa 43.

55 The full title is *Historia de Ethiopia a alta ou Abassia, imperio do Abexim, cujo Rey vulgarmente hé chamado Preste Joam. Trata da natureza da terra, e da gente que a povoa dos Reys, que nella ouve; da Fe que tiveram, e tem; e do muito, que os Padres da Companhia de Jesus*

trabalharam polos reduzir a verdadeira, e sancta Fe da Igreja Romana. Composta pelo padre Manoel d'Almeida da Companhia de Jesus, natural de Viseu.

⁵⁶ ARSI, Roma, Ms. Goa 44.

⁵⁷ I. BOAVIDA, *Barradas, Manoel*, in  hlig (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, 1, , pp. 483-4.

⁵⁸ C. BECCARI (ed.), *Il Tigré descritto da un missionario gesuita del secolo XVII*, Istituto coloniale italiano, Roma 1909.

⁵⁹ BECCARI (ed.), *Il Tigré descritto* cit., Seconda edizione, p. xiv.

⁶⁰ In his Italian version Beccari used quotation marks to indicate references to Barradas's original text.

⁶¹ When an English version of Barradas's *Tratado segundo do reino de Tygre* appeared in 1996, this time in complete form (*Tractatus Tres Historico-Geographici (1634): A Seventeenth Century Historical and Geographical Account of Tigray, Ethiopia* (E. FILLEUL (trans.) and R. PANKHURST (ed.), Wiesbaden 1996, the editor pointed out that Beccari had proposed, at the beginning of the 20th century, two reshuffled Italian editions but did not make the slightest commentary (p. XVII).

⁶² An allusion probably to the expression of the historian and politician Gaetano Salvemini, who, in 1911, denounced Italian expansionism in Libya considered as a «sandbox».

⁶³ BECCARI (ed.), *Il Tigré descritto* cit., 1912, pp. x-xi.

⁶⁴ Ivi, p. 176.

⁶⁵ Ivi, p. ix.

⁶⁶ MARTÍNEZ D'ALÓS-MONER, *Colonialism* cit., p. 79.

⁶⁷ The very stimulating reflections by Jean-Claude Laborie on the Jesuit Serafim Leite, and his work on the Jesuits of Brazil, have much inspired my own reflections on the work of Beccari (LABORIE, *Mangeurs* cit., pp. 454-73).

⁶⁸ Cited by MORALES, *The Restoration* cit. pp. 963-5.

⁶⁹ Ivi, p. 965.

⁷⁰ BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., p. 226. It is in these terms that he finished the presentation of the various documents of the second part of the first volume of the collection in a final note.

⁷¹ This idea, developed by J.-C. Laborie, on the work of Serafim Leite (*Monumenta Brasiliae*, 1956-1960), tallies perfectly with that of Beccari (LABORIE, *Mangeurs* cit., p. 455).

⁷² TELES, *Historia geral* cit.

⁷³ C. BECCARI (ed.), *Paez, Pedro, "Historia Aethiopiae"*, in *Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales inediti a saeculo XVI ad XIX*, 2, Roma 1905, p. IV.

⁷⁴ List of accounts and articles published between 1904 and 1905 by TACCHI VENTURI, *Pietro Paez* cit., p. 560.

⁷⁵ L. BOUVAT, *Nouvelles et mélanges*, in «Journal Asiatique», 4 (1904), pp. 359-61.

⁷⁶ BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., pp. 229-499.

⁷⁷ In this subset of documents there is also a letter signed by Pedro Páez, the *saggio* X.

⁷⁸ BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., p. 345.

⁷⁹ Ivi, pp. 229-30.

⁸⁰ Ivi, pp. 237-54; MHSI, *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu, Epistolæ Mixtæ Sancti Ignatii de Loyola, Epistolæ et Instructiones*, 8, Madrid 1908, pp. 680-90. For a detailed study of the various manuscripts, see PENNEC, *Des jésuites* cit., pp. 58-71.

⁸¹ BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., pp. 373-96.

⁸² Ivi, p. 373.

83 Ivi, p. 397.

84 Ivi, pp. 108-15.

85 C. BECCARI (ed.), *Missionis Eversio (1633-1672)*, in *Rerum Aethiopicarum Scriptores Occidentales inediti a saeculo XVI ad XIX*, 13, Roma 1913, pp. 208-9. The signatories were Antonio Fernandes senior, Jeronimo Lobo, João de Sousa, Francisco Carvalho and Manuel de Almeida.

86 Acta vol. 4 (1626-1627) f. 260rv; Acta vol. 8 (1632-1633) f. 317r; Acta vol. 10 (1634-1635) f. 4v-5r, cited in M.C. DA NEMBRO, *Martirio ed espulsione in Etiopia*, in *Sacrae Congregationis de Propaganda Fide memoria rerum, 350 ans au service des missions, 1622-1972*, I/1 1 1622-1700, Rome-Freiburg-Wien 1971, pp. 627-8.

87 BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., pp. 403-11.

88 On the character, the recent work by M. FORNO (*Tra Africa e Occidente: Il cardinal Massaja e la missione cattolica in Etiopia nella coscienza e nella politica europee*, Urbino 2009) emphasises the extent to which, since the 1960s, an abundant literature has been produced on Massaja, notably in 1984 with the republication of his memoirs (A. ROSO (ed.), *Memorie storiche del Vicariato apostolico dei Galla: 1845-1880*, 6 vols, Città del Vaticano 1984); in 1990 the Capuchin Order organised a colloquium devoted to their mission in Ethiopia and published *Atti del Convegno sul Card. G. Massaja all'Antoniano di Roma 24 febbraio 1990*: Guglielmo Massaja, vicario apostolico dei Galla (Etiopia), Rome 1990.

89 D. CRUMMEY, *Jacobis, Giustino De*, in S. OHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, 3 (2006), pp. 264-5; A. MARTÍNEZ D'ALÒS-MONER, *Lazarus*, in S. OHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, 3 (2006), pp. 526-7; L. CECI, *Chiesa e questione coloniale. Guerra e missione nell'impresa d'Etiopia*, *Italia contemporanea*, 233 (2003), pp. 618-36.

90 MARTÍNEZ D'ALÒS-MONER, *Colonialism* cit., p. 77.

91 Ivi, pp. 77-8.

92 BECCARI (ed.), *Notizia e Saggi* cit., p. 293.

93 Ivi, pp. 333-43.

94 Ivi, pp. 303-9.

95 Ivi, pp. 311-18.

96 Ivi, p. 303.

97 For more on the struggles and tensions between the various orders and congregations at the end of the 19th century, see G. GIUSEPPE, *Orizzonti* cit. [online].

98 J. BAZIN, *La production d'un récit historique*, in *Des clous dans la Joconde: L'anthropologie autremet*, Toulouse 2008, p. 272.

