

Impacts of the ecological footprint on sustainable development: Evidence from China

Xiuqing Li, Liming Xiao, Chao Tian, Bangzhu Zhu, Julien Chevallier

▶ To cite this version:

Xiuqing Li, Liming Xiao, Chao Tian, Bangzhu Zhu, Julien Chevallier. Impacts of the ecological footprint on sustainable development: Evidence from China. Journal of Cleaner Production, 2022, 352, pp.131472. 10.1016/j.jclepro.2022.131472. halshs-04250298

HAL Id: halshs-04250298 https://shs.hal.science/halshs-04250298

Submitted on 22 Jul2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

3

4

5 6

7

8

9 10

1

Impacts of the ecological footprint on sustainable development: Evidence from China

Xiuqing Li^a, Liming Xiao^a, Chao Tian^a, Bangzhu Zhu^{b,*}, and Julien Chevallier^{c*}

^a School of Economics and Management, Shanxi Normal University, Linfen 041000, China ^b School of Management, Jinan University, Guangzhou 510632, China

^c IPAG Business School (IPAG Lab), 184 boulevard Saint-Germain, 75006 Paris, and Université Paris

8 (LED), 2 rue de la Liberté, 93526 Saint-Denis cedex, France

Abstract:

11 Sustainable development emphasizes the sustainability of natural resources and the environment. Under 12 the background of resource scarcity and environmental constraints, it is of great significance to explore 13 the impacts of the ecological footprint on the resource-rich but unbalanced China's Yangtze River 14 Economic Belt from two perspectives of flow capital occupation and stock capital occupation. This 15 study uses a fixed-effect regression model to investigate the impacts of ecological footprint breadth and 16 depth on sustainable development by the panel data of 108 prefecture-level cities in China's Yangtze 17 River Economic Belt from 2006 to 2018. Further combining the panel threshold regression model 18 results, we identify ecological footprint breadth and depth as having inverted N-shaped and inverted 19 U-shaped relationships with sustainable development. Firstly, there is a double threshold effect between 20 ecological footprint breadth and sustainable development. Then, there is a single threshold effect 21 between ecological footprint depth and sustainable development. When ecological footprint breadth is 22 within the threshold of (0.2802, 0.7997), it is conducive to sustainable development. When ecological 23 footprint depth is less than 2.5404, it is conducive to sustainable development. Secondly, ecological 24 footprint breadth improves sustainable development of the Yangtze River Economic Belt by 25 rationalizing and advancing industrial structure. Ecological footprint depth achieves sustainable 26 development through rationalizing industrial structure. Thirdly, the mechanism of the ecological 27 footprint on sustainable development has regional heterogeneity. Finally, this paper proposes several 28 policy implications for achieving China's sustainable development.

29

30 Keywords: Ecological footprint breadth, Ecological footprint depth, Sustainable development, Panel

- 31 threshold regression, China's Yangtze River Economic Belt
- 32

* *Corresponding authors*. E-mail addresses: <u>wpzbz@126.com</u> (B. Zhu). +86 19951785958, and <u>Julien.chevallier@ipag.fr</u> (J. Chevallier)

33 **1. Introduction**

34 In the industrialization process, excessive exploitation and utilization of natural resources have led 35 to global environmental pollution and ecological destruction, thus posing a significant threat to human 36 survival and development (Mahmood et al., 2020). Environmental issues have become a major social 37 problem in developed and developing countries (Zhu et al., 2015; Korhonen et al., 2018; David et al., 38 2021). As the largest developing country with the largest population globally, China's sustainable 39 development has become a key force in achieving the global Sustainable Development Goals. For the 40 fundamental purpose of maintaining the healthy growth between ecosystem and human beings, the 41 overall coordinated development of economy, politics, society, and ecological environment is included 42 in sustainable development (Liu et al., 2021). On the one hand, the ecological environment is the 43 material basis of economic development, so protecting the ecological environment continuously 44 improves productivity (Hu et al., 2020). In this way, under the background of rapid economic growth 45 and increasingly prominent contradiction between supply and demand of resources, it is imperative to 46 effectively ease the development pressure and promote sustainable development.

47 On the other hand, natural resource capital is increasingly becoming the critical factor restricting 48 sustainable development. Natural resource capital refers to the natural resources provided by the 49 ecosystem, which is divided into flow capital and stock capital (Dong et al., 2019). Specifically, flow 50 capital refers to the accumulation of natural capital in a certain period, reflecting the changing trend. 51 Stock capital refers to the total amount of natural capital at a certain point. The ecological footprint is 52 regarded as the "footprint" retained by human economic activities in the ecological environment, 53 reflecting the occupation of natural resources by economic development. The breadth of ecological 54 footprint demonstrates the occupation of flow capital, and the depth of ecological footprint 55 demonstrates the occupation of stock capital (Long et al., 2020). As a result, it is realistic to consider the impact of natural resource utilization degree on sustainable development from the two dimensions 56 57 of ecological footprint breadth and ecological footprint depth.

58 Since sustainable development effectively alleviates the contradiction between an infinite demand 59 for human development and a limited natural resource (Bryan et al., 2018), it will become the new 60 direction of sustainable development of China's economy, especially the critical areas. At present, 61 China's Yangtze River Economic Belt has become an inland river economic belt with global influence. 62 It is the economic belt with the most vital economic strength and tremendous development potential in 63 China. By the end of 2020, the Yangtze River Economic Belt accounted for 43 percent of the country's 64 population and contributed nearly 40 percent of China's GDP and more than 80 percent of the country's 65 mineral reserves. So it is an important starting point to realize reasonable utilization of regional 66 resources and sustainable economic development. With urbanization and industrialization, resource and 67 energy consumption continues to increase, and China's Yangtze River Economic Belt is faced with a 68 serious ecological environment and uncoordinated development. In this context, sustainable 69 development is the central theme of China's economic growth in the new era and the latest direction of 70 the future. Therefore, exploring the path to promote the sustainable development of China's Yangtze 71 River Economic Belt is an urgent problem.

More and more scholars have explored sustainable development from a micro perspective (Liu et

⁷²

73 al., 2020; Shao et al., 2020). They have studied the factors that influence sustainable development from 74 the perspective of enterprises. The advantage is that it reveals a micro-enterprise's inner workings, thus 75 providing more targeted arguments for formulating relevant policies. However, its potential defect may 76 lie in the particularity of sample selection, which cannot reflect the prevailing law of sustainable 77 development. Scholars have also carried out regional and industrial explorations (Carla et al., 2011; 78 Simone et al., 2016; Li et al., 2021). It is worth pointing out that Chen et al. (2020) found in their 79 research that regional scale and resources are conducive to improving innovation ability and 80 competitiveness. Jeffrey (2001) found that the financial market improved capital allocation from the 81 industry perspective. The higher the level of financial development, the higher the investment in 82 growing industries.

83 Furthermore, as sustainable development has gradually become a new way to solve the 84 contradiction between economic development and environmental pollution, the environmental problem 85 has also become a hot research object of scholars. Liu et al. (2020) and Hou et al. (2021) studied the coordination degree among population, economy, space, and environment based on the coupling 86 87 coordination model. They found that the coupling coordination degree between ecological environment 88 and economic growth quality was low. As a primary condition for economic development and human 89 survival, resources and environment have become the focus of scholars increasingly, and the research 90 results show that resources and environment promote or hinder economic development (Sergei et al., 91 2019; Ran et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2020; Filippo et al., 2021). Because these studies are based on 92 different stages of resources and environment to explore their impact on economic development, it also 93 provides some ideas for the research design of this paper. In addition, the research on natural capital in 94 China's Yangtze River Economic Belt mainly focuses on land and water, forest land, grassland, wetland, 95 construction land, and the coordination degree of the carrying capacity of these natural capital and 96 ecological environment (Zhang et al., 2014; Qu et al., 2018; Tian et al., 2021). The results show that the 97 cultivated land area in the Yangtze River basin is decreasing, but the ecological environment in the 98 upper reaches is improving. In terms of ecological footprint, previous studies explored emissions from 99 the atmospheric, biospheric, lithospheric, and hydrospheric aspects of environmental degradations (Usman et al., 2020). Long et al. (2020) evaluated the sustainable development of four major island 100 101 regions in China based on improved ecological footprint. The above literature shows that the 102 considerable scarcity of natural capital has restricted sustainable human development.

103 Consequently, there has been a focus on the relationship between the ecological environment and 104 sustainable development. However, it is more about the coordination between the two, and the research 105 on its internal logic is mostly reflected in the theoretical level, with less empirical analysis. Then, will 106 the different degrees of natural resources utilization in the Yangtze River Economic Belt affect the local, 107 sustainable development? Will it have other effects in different regions? What are the possible 108 pathways of action? An in-depth discussion on these issues will provide a theoretical basis for local 109 governments to formulate and implement effective environmental policies, which has important 110 theoretical and practical significance for China to achieve sustainable development. However, there is 111 no further empirical research into the internal relationship between resources and economic 112 development.

113 Therefore, this paper tries to contribute in the following aspects: (1) By studying the relationship 114 between ecological footprint and sustainable development, the importance of rational utilization of 115 resources is revealed. It provides a theoretical basis for local government to seek a win-win situation 116 between environmental protection and sustainable economic development. (2) Taking 108 117 prefecture-level cities in China's Yangtze River Economic Belt as research objects, the spatial panel 118 model is used to examine the impacts of ecological footprint breadth and ecological footprint depth 119 (hereafter referred to as footprint breadth and footprint depth) on sustainable development from the 120 perspective of natural resource utilization. The conclusions are consistent with scholars' analyses using 121 other regions or countries (Zhang et al., 2020; Filippo et al., 2021). It enriches relevant literature at the 122 margin and is conducive to proposing comprehensive and practical policy recommendations. (3) Based 123 on the data of prefecture-level cities, this study analyzes the potential mechanism of ecological 124 footprint affecting sustainable development, which is rarely covered by existing literature. This paper 125 focuses on how the ecological footprint affects sustainable development through the rationalization of 126 industrial structure and the advancement of industrial structure, and considers the different mechanisms 127 of the three regions in the east, the middle, and the west to reveal the profound relationship between the 128 ecological footprint and sustainable development, which provides a valuable supplement and 129 improvement for the existing literature.

The empirical results indicate that ecological footprints have different impacts on sustainable development. When footprint breadth is between 0.2802 and 0.7997, and footprint depth is less than 2.5404, both are beneficial to sustainable development. Moreover, the effects vary from region to region. Crucially, for the eastern region of China's Yangtze River Economic Belt, industrial structure advancing is the main path of ecological footprint affecting sustainable development, technological innovation level is mainly influenced path in the central region, and urbanization level is especially the path of the western region.

The remainder of this paper is structured as follows. Section 2 details the methodology. Section 3
provides variables and data. Section 4 contains the results. Section 5 concludes this study and proposes
policy implications.

140

141 **2. Methodology**

142 **2.1 Panel threshold regression analysis**

143 Generally speaking, the utilization of natural resources has different effects on sustainable 144 development. At the beginning of the development cycle, the exploitation and utilization of resources 145 positively affect the ecological environment and social economy (Wu et al., 2018). However, with the 146 rapid development of the economy, extensive growth leads to excessive consumption of natural 147 resources. Therefore, natural resources become rigid constraints on sustainable development (Patricia et 148 al., 2005; Ren et al., 2021). In addition, policy guidance and market selection "force" industrial 149 structure transformation (Tao et al., 2010; Lu et al., 2020). As a result, footprint breadth and depth 150 effects on sustainable development show nonlinear characteristics. Based on the above analysis, 151 referring to the spatial panel model in Jiang et al. (2021), the following panel regression model is built 152 as follows:

153
$$ESD_{it} = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 EF_{it} + \alpha_2 EF_{it}^2 + \alpha_3 EF_{it}^3 + \gamma X_{it} + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it}$$
(1)

where *ESD* is sustainable development. *EF* is the ecological footprint, divided into *EF*_{breadth} and *EF*_{depth}. X is control variables affecting sustainable development. *i* and *t* are region and time, respectively. μ_i is

156 regional fixation effect. \mathcal{E}_{ii} is the random disturbance term.

To further explore the threshold of the ecological footprint on sustainable development, the above panel regression model is expanded into multiple threshold panel regression models with footprint breadth ($EF_{breadth}$) and footprint depth (EF_{depth}) as threshold variables, referring to the threshold regression model proposed by Hansen (1999):

$$ESD_{it} = \beta_1 REC_{it} I (EF_{size} \le \eta_1) + \beta_2 REC_{it} I (\eta_1 < EF_{size} \le \eta_2) + \dots + \beta_{n+1} REC_{it} I (EF_{size} > \eta_n) + \gamma_j X_{itj} + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it}$$

$$(2)$$

161

$$ESD_{it} = \beta_1 REC_{it} I \left(EF_{depth} \le \eta_1 \right) + \beta_2 REC_{it} I \left(\eta_1 < EF_{depth} \le \eta_2 \right) + \dots + \beta_{n+1} REC_{it} I \left(EF_{depth} > \eta_n \right) + \gamma_j X_{itj} + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it}$$

$$(3)$$

163 where η_1 , η_2 , ..., η_n is the first, second and n-th threshold value respectively. $I(\cdot)$ is an indicator 164 function. $EF_{breadth}$ and EF_{depth} are threshold variables. The existence of the threshold effect depends on 165 the estimated parameters β_1 and β_2 whether there is a significant difference. If there is a 166 considerable difference, it indicates that the threshold effect exists; otherwise, it does not.

167

168 2.2 Mechanism test model

Referring to the mediating effect test method proposed by Zhao et al. (2010), this study explores how footprint breadth and footprint depth affect sustainable development. As an essential part of regulating resource allocation, industrial structure transformation integrates the elements of sustainable development so that it may play a bridge role between natural resource utilization and sustainable development. Therefore, this paper selects the rationalization of industrial structure (*RIS*) and advancement of industrial structure (*AIS*) as mediating variables. Based on Formula (1), the following test model is further structured:

$$ESD_{it} = i_1 + c_1 EF_{it} + c_2 EF_{it}^2 + c_3 EF_{it}^3 + \alpha_4 X_{it} + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it}$$

$$Z = i + a FF + a FF^{2} + a FF^{3} + cX + \theta + \delta$$
(5)

(4)

$$\Sigma_{it} - \iota_2 + u_1 L \Gamma_{it} + u_2 L \Gamma_{it} + u_3 L \Gamma_{it} + \zeta \Lambda_{it} + V_i + V_{it}$$
(5)

176

177

$$ESD_{it} = i_3 + c_1 EF_{it} + c_2 EF_{it}^2 + c_3 EF_{it}^3 + bZ_{it} + \gamma_3 X_{it} + \rho_i + \omega_{it}$$
(6)

179 where, *EF* refers to *EF*_{breadth} and *EF*_{depth}, respectively. Z is mediating variable, representing 180 rationalization of industrial structure (*RIS*) and advancement of industrial structure (*AIS*). Other 181 variables are the same as Formula (1).

182

183 2.3 The proposed integrated model for impacts of the ecological footprint on184 sustainable development

185 This study proposes a research framework to explore whether and how ecological footprint affects

sustainable development and their influencing mechanisms and regional heterogeneity. The proposedintegrated model consists of three parts, as shown in Fig. 1.

<u>Step 1:</u> Measurement. Sustainable development is measured comprehensively by an index system
 of six dimensions of economic development, innovation, coordination, green, openness, and sharing.
 The core explanatory variables include footprint breadth and footprint depth, and the explained variable
 includes the sustainable development level. The improved three-dimensional ecological footprint model
 measures the footprint breadth and depth refer to Yang et al. (2018) research.

193 <u>Step 2:</u> Robustness test. The fixed-effect model is used to investigate the impacts of the ecological 194 footprint on sustainable development. To ensure the reliability of regression results, the instrumental 195 variable method and replacement of explained variables are used to conduct a robustness test. In 196 addition, a multiple threshold regression model with footprint breadth and footprint depth as threshold 197 variables is structured to test the threshold effect.

198 <u>Step 3:</u> Mechanism and heterogeneity analysis. To explore the mechanism of the ecological 199 footprint on sustainable development, two mediating variables, rationalization of industrial structure 200 and advancement of industrial structure, are introduced into building the mediating effect models. 201 Furthermore, the heterogeneity is tested in different regions. The regressions of prefecture-level cities 202 in China's Yangtze River Economic Belt are carried out according to the eastern, central, and western 203 regions, respectively.

204

205



basis of regional sustainable development (Chen et al., 2021). So in this study, we define sustainabledevelopment as a certain speed of economic development coupled with efficient and high-quality

244 development results. Specifically, economic development needs to consider both the development

245 achievements and the economic risks that may affect development (Falahat et al., 2020). Innovation is 246 the primary driving force of sustainable urban development, and the improvement of innovation mainly 247 depends on the progress of talents and technology (Chen et al., 2020). Therefore, this paper selects 248 indicators from the input and output of innovation. Coordination is the inherent requirement of 249 sustainable urban development, including urban and rural coordination and regional coordination. 250 Green is the essential requirement of sustainable urban development. Therefore, we should hold the 251 concept of sustainable development and solve the problems of environmental damage and resource 252 waste caused by human activities. Openness is the key to the sustainable development of cities. With 253 the continuous development of globalization and digitalization, cities need to integrate into the global 254 governance system through external economic and cultural exchanges. Sharing is the cornerstone of 255 sustainable urban development and a necessary condition for improving people's quality of life and 256 happiness (Destek et al., 2020). In addition, concerning the selection of relevant indicators in existing 257 studies (Fang et al., 2014; Xu et al., 2020), we measure sustainable development levels of 108 258 prefecture-level cities in China's Yangtze River Economic Belt from six dimensions of economic 259 development, innovation, coordination, green, openness, and sharing, as shown in Table 1.

- 260
- 261 262
- 263

 Table 1. Sustainable development evaluation index system

Variable	Indicator	Definition
	Economic growth rate $(\%)$	(Current real GDP-Real GDP of the previous period)/Real GDP of
	Economic growin rate (%)	the last period
	Per capita welfare level(Ten	Paul CDP/The population of permanent residents
	thousand yuan)	Real OD17 The population of permanent residents
	Economic volatility (%)	(Real GDP growth rate that year-Real GDP growth over the
	Economic volatility (%)	previous year)/Real GDP growth from a year earlier
	Unemployment rate (%)	Urban unemployment rate
	R&D (Ten thousand yuan)	R&D capital stock
Sustainable	The growth rate of mobile	
development	Internet users (%)	Number of Internet subscribers/The total number of households
level	Number of patents granted by ten	
	thousand people	Number of patents granted/ The total population
	Number of students in institutions	
	of higher learning by 10,000	Total number of students in institutions of night learning/The total
	people(Ten thousand people)	population
	Linhan mural in some motio (0/)	Rural residents disposable income/Disposable income of urban
	Orban-rurai income rado (%)	residents
	Rationalization level of	Total rotail salar of consumer goods/CDD
	consumption structure (%)	Total fetall sales of consumer goods/GDP

Green coverage of built-up areas (%)	Green coverage area of built-up area/built-up area	
Per capita park green area(m ²)	Park green area/urban resident population	
Level of environmental	Household garbage harmless disposal rate	
governance (%)	Sewage treatment rate	
Percentage of actually utilized		
foreign capital in GDP (%)	Actual utilization of foreign capital/GDP	
The proportion of total imports	Total import and export/GDP	
and exports in GDP (%)	Total import and export/ODF	
Number of inbound foreign	The number of foreign tourists received that year	
tourists(Ten thousand people)	The number of foreign tourists received that year	
The number of buses owned by		
10,000 people	Number of buses/Number of permanent residents in towns	
Medical beds for 10,000 people	Total number of medical beds/Urban resident population	
Per capita funding for cultural	Expanditure for cultural undertakings/Urban resident population	
programs(Ten thousand yuan)	Expenditure for cultural undertakings/orban resident population	
Per capita investment in fixed	Total investment in fixed assats/Urban resident population	
assets(Ten thousand yuan)	rotar investment in fixed assets/orban resident population	

265 The evaluation index system in Table 1 measures the comprehensive index of sustainable 266 economic development of 108 prefecture-level cities in China's Yangtze River Economic Belt. The 267 weight assignment method commonly used in academia mainly includes subjective and objective 268 evaluations. The entropy method is one of the most common objective evaluation methods. Its basic 269 idea is to judge the importance of an index according to the degree of dispersion. If the dispersion 270 degree is larger, it indicates that the index has a more significant impact on the evaluation system, and 271 the index is given greater weight. Otherwise, the smaller the dispersion degree, the smaller the weight 272 (Zhao et al., 2020). The entropy method avoids the interference of human factors in the subjective 273 evaluation method and objectively reflects the importance of each index in the whole evaluation system. 274 The specific calculation steps are as follows: ① The data is processed dimensionless, and obtained 275 value is Z_i . Then, the index horizontal matrix is constructed and normalized to obtain the matrix R, $R = (r_{ij})_{n < n}$ @We quantify each index in the same degree and calculate the proportion of index *j* index 276 each prefecture-level city every year, namely P_{ij} , $P_{ij} = r_{ij} / \sum r_{ij}$. (3) We calculate the entropy of 277 index j, namely e_j , $e_j = -k \sum p_{ij} \ln p_{ij}$, $k = 1/\ln m$. (4) The difference coefficient a_j of j is 278 calculated, $a_j = 1 - e_j$. We calculate the weight of *j*. We calculate the sustainable development 279 index according to formula $g_i = \frac{a_i}{\sum a_i}$, by referring to the measurement method of the United Nations 280 281 Human Development Index (HDI).

282 The green total factor productivity reflects sustainable development in the robustness test. 283 Therefore, this paper uses the Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA) and Malmquist method to measure 284 urban green total factor productivity, replacing the original explained variable. Moreover, the labor 285 force (L), capital stock (K), and energy consumption (E) are the inputs. At the same time, the real gross 286 domestic product serves as the desired output, and CO₂ emissions from fossil-fuel energy consumption 287 as the unwanted output. L is the sum of the number of units employed, private and self-employed at the 288 end of the year in each prefecture-level city. K draws on the method of Dmitry and Alexander (2021) 289 and uses the perpetual inventory method to estimate capital stock over the years. Energy consumption 290 is given by fossil-fuel consumption, measured in tons of coal equivalent. Because no special 291 department exists to account for the urban energy consumption, the relevant data of urban fossil-fuel 292 consumption are not extensive.

In contrast, the urban household gas consumption and family consumption of liquefied petroleum gas are more complete data. The CO₂ emissions are measured by multiplying the quantity of the urban household gas consumption and family consumption of liquefied petroleum gas; detailed measuring methods and steps are presented in Li (2016). Data are obtained from China City Statistical Yearbook 2006-2019 and China Energy Statistical Yearbook 2006-2019. All data are converted into in constant price of 2000.

299

300 3.2 Explanatory (independent) variables

301 Ecological footprint, as a critical indicator of sustainable utilization of resources and the 302 environment, refers to the geographical space with biological production capacity that maintains the 303 necessary resources for human activities and consumes waste (Zahoor et al., 2020). The utilization of 304 resources can be studied from two aspects: the occupation of flow capital (denoted by footprint breadth) 305 and the consumption of stock capital (represented by footprint depth) (Yang et al., 2018; Xun et al., 306 2019; Long et al., 2020). The improved three-dimensional model considers footprint breadth and 307 footprint depth as two components of spatial cross-section and time axis to study the utilization of 308 natural capital (Bi et al., 2021). Based on the existing classical model, the improved three-dimensional 309 model realizes the classification and measurement of flow capital and stock capital by adding 310 dimension and further extends the regional scale of the existing three-dimensional model to the specific 311 biological productive land below the region. Therefore, the improved three-dimensional ecological 312 footprint model is adopted to measure footprint breadth and footprint depth.

313
$$EF_{breadth,region} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \min\{EF_i, BC_i\}$$
(7)

314
$$EF_{depth, region} = 1 + \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \max\left\{EF_i - BC_i, 0\right\}}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} BC_i}$$
(8)

$$EF_{3D,region} = EF_{breadth,region} \times EF_{depth,region}$$
(9)

316 where, $EF_{breadth, region}$ is footprint breadth. $EF_{depth, region}$ is footprint depth. $EF_{3D, region}$ is

three-dimensional ecological footprint. i is land type. $EF_i > BC_i$ are the ecological footprint and the biological capacity of different land types, respectively.

319 The improved three-dimensional ecological footprint model involves six land types: cultivated 320 land, woodland, grassland, and water land belonging to biological resource consumption, fossil fuel 321 land, and building land belonging to energy consumption. Considering the actual situation of 322 prefecture-level cities in China's Yangtze River Economic Belt and data availability, this paper selects 323 37 indicators corresponding to different land types to represent the six productive land types. The land 324 area data are mainly obtained from the Comprehensive Statistical Annual Report of Land and 325 Resources and the application service platform of land survey results sharing. Refer to the urban 326 environmental quality bulletin and water resources bulletin. We use relevant websites to obtain land 327 and water data. The output data of different land types are mainly derived from China Urban Statistical 328 Yearbook 2006-2019. In addition, the productivity of different land types varies greatly. To compare the 329 ecological footprint and carrying capacity of the six land types, the equilibrium factor and yield factor 330 corresponding to each land type are multiplied in the calculation. The yield factor is derived from Wang 331 et al.'s (2020) research, and the equilibrium factor is derived from the National Ecological Footprint 332 Account in 2018 (Maria et al., 2018). Then, combined with the principle of threshold variable selection, 333 footprint breadth and footprint depth are respectively taken as threshold variables to test whether they 334 have threshold effects on sustainable development and the possible threshold values.

335

336 3.3 Control variables

337 We consider control variables n addition to the core variables such as footprint breadth, footprint 338 depth, and sustainable development. Referred to the existing literature (Roger et al., 2021; Yu et al., 339 2021), this paper further introduces human capital level (hcl), market degree (market), and 340 infrastructure (infra) to control the impacts of the ecological footprint on sustainable development. The 341 reasons are as follows: The improvement of human capital enhances the acquisition and application of 342 knowledge, technology, and all kinds of information by innovation subjects, and this improves the 343 efficiency of innovation (Yu et al., 2021). Therefore, the level of human capital has an essential impact 344 on the quality of economic development. This paper uses the per capita education years to measure the 345 human capital level (hcl). The degree of marketization reflects the ability of the market to regulate the 346 allocation of resources. A higher degree of marketization is beneficial to weaken the distorting effect of 347 resource allocation and improve the economy's overall natural resource utilization efficiency. This 348 boosts green total factor productivity (Lu et al., 2020). In this paper, the proportion of the number of 349 private and self-employed persons in the total population represents the degree of marketization 350 (market). Infrastructure (Infra) plays an essential role in the sustainable development of China's 351 economy (Lin, 2016). It is generally measured by the per capita kilometers of each prefecture-level city. 352 The data are mainly obtained from the Statistical Yearbook of Chinese Cities 2006-2019.

353

354 **3.4 Mediator variables**

To reveal the internal mechanism of the ecological footprint on sustainable development, this paper explores its potential mediating effect from the perspective of urban industrial structure transformation. For mediator variables, the rationalization and advancement of the industrial structure are selected by referring to the research of Li et al. (2017). Industrial structure rationalization

359
$$RIS_{it} = 1 - \frac{1}{3} \sum_{i=1}^{3} \left| \frac{Y_{it}}{Y_t} - \frac{L_{it}}{L_t} \right|$$
, where Y is output. L is the number of people employed. $\frac{Y_{it}}{Y}$ is the

proportion of the added value of the three industries in the total output value. $\frac{L_{it}}{L}$ is the proportion of employment in the three industries in the total employment. Advancement of industrial structure $AIS_{it} = \sum_{i=1}^{3} i \frac{Y_{it}}{Y_t}$, where $\frac{Y_{it}}{Y_t}$ is the proportion of the added value of industry *i* in the year *t* in the total

363 output value. The data are obtained from China City Statistical Yearbook 2006-2019.

364 Table 2 reports the descriptive statistics for all the variables. It is found that the mean value of 365 sustainable development is 0.3633, the standard deviation is 0.0819, the minimum value is 0.0042, and the maximum value is 0.5398, which indicates the sustainable development level of China's Yangtze 366 367 River Economic Belt is still at a relatively low level. There are significant differences in the sustainable 368 development of different prefecture-level cities. The maximum footprint breadth is 0.5523. The 369 minimum footprint breadth is 0.0508. The maximum footprint depth is 36.7420, and the minimum 370 footprint depth is 2.3189. The above analysis means significant differences in the utilization of natural 371 resources among the prefecture-level cities. The above study provides an objective basis and entry 372 point for the follow-up research on the impacts of the ecological footprint on sustainable development. 373

374

 Table 2. Descriptive statistics

Variables	Variable declaration	Mean	SD	Min	Max
ESD	Sustainable development	0.3633	0.0819	0.0042	0.5398
EF_{depth}	Footprint depth	6.1912	3.9214	2.3189	36.7240
$EF_{breadth}$	Footprint breadth	0.3752	0.1081	0.0508	0.5532
hcl	Human capital level	9.7420	0.9741	5.9232	13.5614
market	Marketization degree	0.3245	0.1251	0.0677	0.8274
infra	Infrastructure	23.5443	14.6910	8.8534	58.2353
RIS	Rationalization of industrial structure	0.7449	0.0571	0.7010	0.9172
AIS	Advancement of Industrial structure	1.2983	0.6471	0.5880	4.0136

375

376

377 4. Results and discussion

378 **4.1 Baseline regression results**

To avoid the multicollinearity problem, all variables' correlation analyses were first carried out. It is found that the correlation coefficients are all within (-0.5, 0.5), indicating that there is no multicollinearity problem among the variables. The F-test results show that the fixed-effect is better than mixed OLS, and the Hausman test results show that the fixed-effect model is more effective than 383 the random-effect model in estimating parameters. So the fixed effect is used for regression. From 384 Model 1 to Model 4, control variables are gradually added, respectively, and the results are shown in 385 Table 3. It can be found that after the introduction of control variables, the regression coefficient of the 386 first-order item of footprint breadth is significantly negative at the level of 10%. The regression 387 coefficient of the square item is significantly positive at the level of 5%, and the regression coefficient 388 of the cubic item is significantly negative at the level of 5%. It shows that there is an inverted N-shaped 389 relationship between footprint breadth and sustainable development, which is "first decreased, then 390 increased and then decreased". In addition, regardless of whether the control variables are introduced, 391 the regression coefficient of the first term of footprint depth is significantly positive at the level of 1%. 392 The regression coefficient of the square term is significantly negative at the level of 1%, but the 393 regression coefficient of the cubic term does not pass the significance test. It shows an inverted 394 U-shaped relationship between footprint depth and sustainable development, which increases first and 395 then decreases.

396 Further from Model 4, it is found that sustainable development level will decrease by 0.2498% on 397 average when footprint breadth increases by 1%. However, with the continuous increase of footprint 398 breadth, when it is in the "Pareto optima" of natural resource utilization and sustainable development, 399 sustainable development level will increase by 0.4457% on average when footprint breadth increases 400 by 1%. However, when footprint breadth exceeds the second inflection point, sustainable development 401 level will decrease by 0.2635% on average when footprint breadth rises by 1%. On the other hand, 402 sustainable development level increases by 0.0101% when footprint depth increases by 1%. However, 403 when footprint depth exceeds the critical value, the sustainable development level will decrease by 404 0.0020% when it increases by 1%. The reason may be that, in the early stage of economic development, 405 the industrial supporting system is not perfect, the public service is not excellent. Faced with the dual 406 constraints of emission reduction pressure and economic development demands, local governments 407 choose industries with high pollution and high energy consumption to drive economic growth. The 408 transfer of polluting industries inhibits the technological innovation of enterprises. It aggravates the 409 deterioration of the environment in the undertaking areas and the massive consumption of resources, 410 which is not conducive to improving the environment and the quality of economic life growth. With the 411 continuous increase of footprint breadth, the input of factors is increasingly close to the optimal 412 combination ratio, thus stepping into the win-win stage of ecological environment and sustainable 413 development. When the flow capital is constantly used, the rigid constraints of resources will lead to 414 unreasonable industrial spatial layout, especially when the stock capital is excessively consumed and 415 close to or even exceeds the ecological carrying capacity, which is not conducive to sustainable 416 development.

In addition, in terms of control variables, the impacts of human capital, marketization degree, and infrastructure on sustainable development should not be ignored. Among them, the regression coefficient of human capital level is significantly positive at the level of 5%. This is because the increase in the proportion of high-quality talents is conducive to the efficient and sustainable development of all walks of life. The coefficients of marketization degree and infrastructure are both significantly positive at the level of 1%, indicating that marketization degree and infrastructure are also very important for sustainable development. This is because marketization is the internal driving force
of economic development. The higher the degree of marketization is, the better it is to solve the
problem of inefficient or ineffective resource allocation in economic development. In this way, it
effectively improves the efficiency of resource integration and market expansion and realizes
sustainable development (Lu et al., 2020). Infrastructure is the cornerstone of sustainable development.
Therefore, improving infrastructure construction is critical to promoting sustainable development (Lin,
2016).

Table 3. Baseline regression results

Variables	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4
FF	-0.2437	-0.24380*	-0.2437*	-0.2498*
EFbreadth	(0.1879)	(0.1880)	(0.1884)	(0.1890)
FF ²	0.4332*	0.4331*	0.4333*	0.4457**
EFbreadth	(0.2562)	(0.2557)	(0.2568)	(0.2568)
FF 3	-0.2116**	-0.2117*	-0.2119*	-0.2635**
EFbreadth	(0.2073)	(0.2052)	(0.2097)	(0.2139)
EE	0.0125***	0.0122***	0.0121***	0.0101***
EF _{depth}	(0.0019)	(0.0016)	(0.0015)	(0.0011)
	-0.0017**	-0.0017***	-0.0017***	-0.0020***
EFdepth	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	(0.0007)	(0.0008)
E E 3	-0.0066	-0.0072	0.0216	-0.0547
L F depth	(0.0047)	(0.0055)	(0.083)	(0.077)
hal		0.0055**	0.0053*	0.0054**
nci		(0.0013)	(0.0012)	(0.0013)
markat			0.0138**	0.0138***
παικεί			(0.0061)	(0.0062)
infra				0.0172^{***}
ingra				(0.0074)
Constant	0.0226***	0.1045***	0.1131***	0.0762^{***}
Constant	(0.0102)	(0.0824)	(0.0889)	(0.0371)
City effect	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Year effect	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Ν	1404	1404	1404	1404
R^2	0.1346	0.1346	0.1349	0.1377

Note: *, ** and *** indicate significant at the level of 10%, 5% and 1%, respectively. Standard errors are in parentheses, the same as below.

4.2 Robustness test

Firstly, we use the instrumental variable method (IVs) to solve the endogeneity problem.

437 According to the correlation and exogenous conditions that the effective instrumental variable needs to 438 meet, this study selects the footprint breadth lagging one period as the instrumental variable IV_1 . 439 Meanwhile, the activities of prefecture-level cities are easily influenced by the same activities in their 440 surrounding areas (Liu et al., 2017). The mean footprint depths of other cities in the eastern, central, 441 and western regions are calculated. They are used as the instrumental variable IV_2 for the local 442 footprint depth to solve the resulting bias caused by endogeneity.

443 The results of the under-recognition test (P-value of LM statistic is 0.04) and the weak 444 instrumental variable test (F statistic of Wald test is 37.14) both indicate that the above IV_s are effective. 445 Further, 2SLS is used for regression, and results are shown in Table 4. Model 5 and Model 6 are the 446 first and second stages, respectively. For IV₁, the inverted N-shaped relationship between footprint 447 breadth and sustainable development is still credible. For IV_2 , the regression coefficient of model 5 is 448 positive at the level of 1%, indicating a significant correlation between IV₂ and footprint depth. In 449 model 6, the first-order regression coefficient of ecological footprint depth is significantly positive at 450 the level of 1%. Still, the regression coefficient of its square term is significantly negative, indicating 451 that the inverted U-shaped relationship between the footprint depth and sustainable development is still 452 credible. Therefore, the results of the endogeneity test are consistent with the baseline regression results. 453 This shows that the results of baseline regression are robust.

454 Secondly, to further ensure the robustness of the research results, green total factor productivity of 455 cities is used to replace the explained variables for testing. In addition, urban economic activities are 456 usually constrained by the technological frontier. To reveal the dynamic changes of green total factor 457 productivity, DEA-Malmquist is adopted to measure it by referring to Tang et al.'s (2017) research 458 ideas. The regression results are shown in Table 4. Model 7 controls the year, and model 8 controls the 459 year and city. The fixed effect regression results show that the relationship between footprint breadth 460 and sustainable development is "suppression-promotion-suppression". The relationship between 461 footprint depth and sustainable development is "promotion-suppression". Again, this proves that the 462 conclusions of this paper are robust.

463

464

Variables	Model 5	Model 6	Model 7	Model 8
		-0.2413*	-0.2124**	-0.2230**
EF _{breadth}		(0.1152)	(0.1672)	(0.1871)
FF ²		0.4104**	0.3531*	0.4047^{**}
EF _b readth		(0.1347)	(0.2106)	(0.2138)
FF ³		-0.2119**	-0.1821*	-0.2209*
EFbreadth		(0.0972)	(0.1952)	(0.2133)
	0.3710^{*}			
IV_1	(0.1904)			
C C		0.0108***	0.0072^{**}	0.0108^{**}
EF _{depth}		(0.0044)	(0.0011)	(0.0024)
FF ²		-0.0007***	-0.0021***	-0.0035***
EF _{depth}		(0.0008)	(0.0005)	(0.0008)
XX 7	0.1301***			
IV_2	(0.0172)			
Control variables	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
City effect	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Year effect	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Ν	1404	1404	1404	1404
R^2	0.1374	0.1379	0.1102	0.1105

 Table 4. Robustness test results

468 **4.3 Threshold effect analysis**

The previous fixed effect results show that footprint breadth and sustainable development present an inverted N-shaped relationship, and footprint depth and sustainable development present an inverted U-shaped relationship. However, the inflection points of their effects on sustainable development are still not clear. Therefore, this study uses the panel threshold effect model to explore further the threshold values of footprint breadth and footprint depth on sustainable development.

Firstly, we determined the threshold number and threshold value. Table 5 reports the test results of the panel threshold model. From Table 5, the F-statistic of footprint breadth rejects the original hypothesis at the significance level of 10% successively. This indicates that there is a double threshold effect on sustainable development. The F statistic of footprint depth significantly rejects the original hypothesis at the significance level of 10%, indicating a single threshold effect on sustainable development.

480

481

482

483

484

486

Table 5. Panel threshold model test results

Thread-old			Critical values for different levels of		
Threshold	Hypothesis testing	F statistic	significance		
variables			90%	95%	99%
	H ₀ : There's no threshold	14 12*	0 152	15.722	21.426
	H_1 : There's a threshold	14.13	9.153		21.420
$EF_{breadth}$	H_0 : There's a threshold	17 42*	15 429	18.026	22 714
	H ₁ : There are two thresholds	17.12	15.129		22.711
	H ₀ : There are two thresholds	10.60	17.336	19.051	22 522
	H ₁ : There are three thresholds	19.00			23.322
	H ₀ : There's no threshold	21 44*	20 417	21 792	24 220
	H_1 : There's a threshold	21.44	20.417	21.782	24.559
FF	H_0 : There's a threshold	20.07	19 482	21.446	26 725
ΕΓ depth	H ₁ : There are two thresholds	20.07	19.402		20.725
	H ₀ : There are two thresholds	22.32	22.421	25.711	29 641
	H ₁ : There are three thresholds	22.32			27.041

487

According to the above test results, the double threshold effect model of footprint breadth on sustainable development and the single threshold model of footprint depth on sustainable development are respectively structured to analyze, as shown in Table 6. The estimated values of double threshold variables for footprint breadth are 0.2802 and 0.7997, respectively. The single threshold value for footprint depth is 2.5404.

493 494

 Table 6. Threshold estimation results and confidence interval

Threshold variables	The value of the threshold estimate	95% confidence interval
$EF_{breadth}$ the first threshold	0.2802^{*}	[0.2761, 0.2842]
$EF_{breadth}$ the second threshold	0.7997^{*}	[0.7883, 0.7998]
EF_{depth} the threshold value	2.5404**	[1.9722, 2.7641]

⁴⁹⁵

496 Secondly, after determining the threshold value, the threshold effect regression is carried out, the 497 results are shown in Table 7. The impact of footprint breadth on sustainable development is a nonlinear 498 relationship. With the increase of footprint breadth, sustainable development presents an inverted 499 N-shaped trend of "down-up-down". The thresholds are 0.2802 and 0.7997, respectively. The estimation 500 coefficient is significantly negative when footprint breadth is less than 0.2802 (-0.2531). When 501 footprint breadth is between 0.2802 and 0.7997, the estimated coefficient is significantly positive 502 at the significance level of 10% (0.3042). Furthermore, when footprint breadth greater than 0.7997, the 503 estimated coefficient is significantly negative (-0.2191). In addition, footprint depth and sustainable 504 development show an inverted U-shaped relationship of "promotion-suppression". The threshold value 505 is 2.5404. When footprint depth is less than 2.5404, the regression coefficient is significantly positive at 506 the significance level of 5% (0.0214). The regression coefficient is significantly negative when the 507 footprint depth is greater than 2.5404 (-0.0038). This is because China's Yangtze River Economic Belt 508 has prominent regional characteristics, and natural resources are unevenly distributed. Under the 509 constraints of resources and environment, the continuous increase of footprint breadth and footprint 510 depth will ultimately be not conducive to sustainable development. At present, some cities in China's 511 Yangtze River Economic Belt (some cities in Yunnan, Guizhou, and Sichuan) realize the rational use of 512 natural capital, which promotes their sustainable development. This further indicates that it is necessary 513 to explore the impact of an ecological footprint on sustainable development.

- 514
- 515

Table 7. Panel threshold parameter estimation results

Variables	Model 9	Model 10
Constant	0.0527**(2.0172)	0.0612**(2.1337)
labor	0.0062**(2.0196)	0.0074**(1.944)
market	0.0023**(1.7815)	0.0024**(1.783)
infra	0.0184**(1.922)	0.0201**(2.0542)
$REC(EF_{breadth} < \gamma_1)$	-0.2531*(-3.074)	
$\textit{REC}(\gamma_1 \leq \textit{EF}_{breadth} < \gamma_2)$	0.3042*(3.098)	
$REC(EF_{breadth} > \gamma_2)$	-0.2191**(-1.9643)	
$REC(EF_{depth} \leq \gamma)$		0.0214**(2.1208)
$REC(EF_{depth} > \gamma)$		-0.0038**(-1.825)
R^2	0.1391	0.1387

516 517 Note: ***, ** and * denote passing significance test at the level of 1%, 5% and 10%, respectively; The corresponding values in parentheses are T values.

518

519 **4.4 Heterogeneity analysis**

520 The Yangtze River Economic Belt consists of three eastern, central, and western China regions. 521 There are significant differences among the three regions in population concentration, industrial 522 structure, science, technology, education, and natural resources. Therefore, the impact of the ecological 523 footprint on sustainable development may be heterogeneous. Table 8 reports the regression results for 524 different regions. Model 11, model 12, and model 13 are the regression results of the eastern, central, 525 and western regions, respectively. It can be found that the impact of footprint breadth on sustainable 526 development in Eastern China is an inverted N-shaped of "restraint-promotion-restraint". The effect of 527 footprint depth on sustainable development presents an inverted U-shaped curve of "promotion-suppression". For the central region, the impact of footprint breadth on sustainable 528 529 development is also an inverted N-shaped.

530 On the contrary, the impact of footprint depth shows an N-shaped relationship of 531 "promotion-inhibition-promotion". For the western region, the impact of footprint breadth on 532 sustainable development shows an inverted U-shaped relationship of "promoting - inhibiting", and 533 footprint depth only has a significant promoting effect on sustainable development. The reason may be 534 that the central and western regions of China's Yangtze River Economic Belt are rich in natural 535 resources and occupy a large area of arable land. Therefore, the rational utilization of resources is 536 conducive to the sustainable development of some cities in western China.

537

538

Table 8 Regression results by regions

Variables	Model 11	Model 12	Model 13
$EF_{breadth}$	-0.2993** (0.2041)	-0.2488* (0.2018)	-0.2416 (0.2015)
$EF_{breadth}^2$	0.3723* (0.3180)	0.4409** (0.3905)	0.4432** (0.3912)
$EF_{breadth}^3$	-0.1537* (0.1481)	-0.2599* (0.2339)	-0.2704** (0.2290)
EF_{depth}	0.0104* (0.0104)	0.0119** (0.0125)	0.0127** (0.0140)
EF_{depth}^2	-0.0023** (0.0011)	-0.0019* (0.0009)	-0.0012 (0.0009)
EF_{depth}^3	0.0052 (0.0070)	0.0001* (0.0027)	-0.0020 (0.0034)
labor	0.0072*** (0.0053)	0.0068** (0.0049)	0.0049** (0.0045)
market	0.0143** (0.0097)	0.0135** (0.0089)	0.0133* (0.0086)
infra	0.0344** (0.0214)	0.0306** (0.0178)	0.0166* (0.0104)
Constant	0.0422** (0.0470)	0.0325** (0.0400)	0.0179** (0.0283)
R^2	0.1197	0.1203	0.1202

539

540 **4.5 Mechanism test results**

The baseline regression results show that when the footprint breadth is between 0.2802 and 0.7997, and footprint depth is less than 2.5404, ecological footprint significantly promotes sustainable development. The rationalization of industrial structure (*RIS*) and the advancement of the industrial structure (*AIS*) are selected as mediating variables to investigate their mechanisms further.

545 According to the mediating effect analysis method proposed by Zhao et al. (2010), the Bootstrap 546 proposed by Preacher and Hayes (2004) is used to test the mediating effect. The sample size is 5000. 547 The mediating effect test results are shown in Table 9. Model 14 and Model 15 are the influences of 548 independent variables and mediating variables on the dependent variable. Model 16 offers the effects of 549 independent variables on the dependent variable after controlling the mediating variables. From Table 9, 550 the interaction terms between footprint breadth and rationalization of industrial structure and the 551 interaction items between footprint depth and rationalization of industrial structure promote sustainable development significantly. The interaction terms between footprint breadth and advancement of 552 553 industrial structure promote sustainable development.

554 Furthermore, both footprint breadth and footprint depth significantly promote sustainable 555 development after controlling industrial structure rationalization and industrial structure advancement.

According to the principle of mediating effect, this indicates that the rationalization and advancement 556 557 of industrial structure play a mediating role between footprint breadth and sustainable development. 558 Rationalization of the industrial structure plays a mediating role between footprint depth and 559 sustainable development. The results are consistent with the theoretical expectation. With the increase 560 of flow capital occupation, factors input and output tend to rationalize, the degree of mutual 561 coordination among industries increases, and the unreasonable industrial structure is adjusted. However, 562 when the flow of capital consumption further increases and cannot meet local economic development 563 needs, it needs to consume the stock capital. This will accelerate the evolution of the industrial 564 structure from the primary industry to the second and third industries. The industrial structure is 565 constantly optimized (that is, the advancement of the industrial structure). The advancement of the 566 industrial structure and the rationalization of industrial structure respectively examine the industrial 567 added value and the coordination degree among industries. Therefore, it will promote regional 568 sustainable development. Thus, the industrial structure transformation is an important carrier and key 569 link for rational utilization of resources to boost the sustainable development of China's Yangtze River 570 Economic Belt.

571



Table 9. Mediating effect test results

Variables	Model 14	Model 15	Model 16
EF _{breadth}	0.0200^{*}		
$EF_{breadth}^2$ × RIS	0.0178**		
$EF_{breadth}^3$ × RIS	0.0136*		
$EF_{depth} \times RIS$	0.0120**		
$EF_{depth}^2 \times RIS$	0.0011*		
$EF_{breadth} imes AIS$		0.0224*	
$EF_{breadth}^2$ × AIS		0.0222**	
$EF_{breadth}^3$ × AIS		0.0183*	
$EF_{depth} \times AIS$		0.0211	
$EF_{depth}^2 \times AIS$		0.0014	
$EF_{breadth}$			-0.2177*
$EF_{breadth}^2$			0.4701**
$EF_{breadth}^3$			-0.2643**
EF_{depth}			0.1066***
EF_{depth}^2			-0.0016***

Control	Vac	Vac	Ves
variables	105	105	105
Ν	1404	1404	1404
R^2	0.1355	0.1374	0.1374

573	Note: *, ** and *** are significant at the level of 10%, 5% and 1%, respectively. Standard errors
574	are in parentheses.

576 Furthermore, the influence paths of the eastern, central, and western regions are considered. The 577 environmental effect of industrial structure adjustment in Eastern China is better than that in central and 578 Western China (Milligan and Michelle, 2018). Therefore, the advancement of industrial structure (AIS) 579 is selected as a mediating variable in the eastern region. In the overall economic development of China, 580 the central region has the geographical advantage of connecting the east and the west. It has developed 581 rapidly in recent years and has become a new highlight of regional innovation and development 582 (Shunsuke and Shinji, 2009; Wang et al., 2019). Therefore, technological innovation level (TIL) is 583 selected as a mediating variable in the central region. TIL is the number of patent applications. In 584 recent years, the level of urbanization in western China has been dramatically improved, but there is 585 still much room for development (Zheng and Patrick, 2019). Therefore, we take urbanization level 586 (URB) as a mediating variable in western China. URB is the urban resident population / total 587 population. Model 17 and Model 18 are the eastern mediating effect regression results. Model 19 and 588 Model 20 are the regression results of the central region mediating effect. Models 21 and Model 22 are 589 the regression results of the western mediating effect. From Table 10, footprint breadth and depth in the 590 eastern region improve sustainable development by advancing the industrial structure. For the central 591 region, footprint breadth and depth affect technological innovation and improve sustainable 592 development. For the western region, footprint breadth and depth improve the region's sustainable 593 development by influencing urbanization. It can be found that the influence paths of the ecological 594 footprint on sustainable development are different in different regions.

595 596

Table 10. Mediating effect test results by regions

Variables	Model 17	Model 18	Variables	Model 19	Model 20	Variables	Model 21	Model 22
$EF_{breadth}$ × AIS	0.0413**		EF _{breadth} × TIL	0.0277*		EF _{breadth} × URB	0.0104*	
$EF_{breadth}^2$ × AIS	0.0392*		EF ² _{breadth} × TIL	0.0049*		$EF_{breadth}^2$ × URB	0.0047*	
$EF_{breadth}^3$ × AIS	0.0377*		EF ³ _{breadth} × TIL	0.0063		$EF_{breadth}^3 \times URB$	0.0125	
EF_{depth} $ imes$ AIS	0.0510**		EF _{depth} × TIL	0.0188**		EF_{depth} $ imes$ URB	0.0322**	
EF_{depth}^2 × AIS	0.0334*		EF ² × TIL	0.0070^{*}		$EF_{depth}^2 imes URB$	0.0190	
$EF_{breadth}$		-0.2172**			-0.3246*			-0.2620
$EF_{breadth}^2$		0.2744**			0.3025**			0.0437**
$EF_{breadth}^3$		-0.1160*			-0.4466*			-0.1742**
EF_{depth}		0.0154^{*}			0.0219**			0.0332**
EF_{depth}^2		-0.0202*			-0.0343			-0.0042
Control variables	Yes	Yes	Control variables	Yes	Yes	Control variables	Yes	Yes
N	325	325	Ν	676	676	Ν	403	403
R^2	0.1310	0.1313	R^2	0.1322	0.1323	R^2	0.1316	0.1316

599 5. Conclusions and policy implications

This paper links natural resource utilization to sustainable development, selects 108 600 601 prefecture-level cities in China's Yangtze River Economic Belt as the research objects and uses spatial econometric models to examine the impacts of footprint breadth and depth on sustainable development. 602 603 Based on baseline regression, the threshold values and the possible effect paths are further discussed 604 using the threshold regression model and mediating effect model, and regional heterogeneity is also 605 considered. The main conclusions are as follows: firstly, the impacts of footprint breadth and footprint 606 depth on sustainable development are shown as inverted N-shaped and inverted U-shaped, respectively. The IVs and substitution of explained variables show that the conclusions are still robust. Footprint 607 608 breadth has a double threshold effect on sustainable development, and footprint depth has a single threshold effect. Secondly, the impacts of footprint breadth and depth on sustainable development show 609 610 regional heterogeneity. Specifically, the eastern region is consistent with the Yangtze River Economic 611 Belt as a whole, and the impacts of footprint breadth and footprint depth on sustainable development show an inverted N-shaped and an inverted U-shaped, respectively. The central region's relationship 612 613 between footprint breadth and sustainable development shows an inverted N-shaped, while footprint depth shows an N-shaped relationship. In the western region, footprint breadth has an inverted 614

U-shaped effect on sustainable development, while footprint depth only significantly impacts
sustainable development. Thirdly, the mechanism test results show that footprint breadth improves
sustainable development by promoting the rationalization and advancement of industrial structure.
Footprint depth improves the sustainable development level by promoting the rationalization of
industrial structure.

Moreover, the mechanisms also have regional heterogeneity. Specifically, the advancement of industrial structure, technological innovation, and urbanization are the main mechanisms of the eastern, central, and western regions, respectively. Based on this paper's main conclusions, some relevant policy implications are suggested as follows:

Firstly, scientifically and rationally coordinate the relationship between the utilization of natural resources and sustainable development. The results show that the ecological footprint and sustainable development level of China's Yangtze River Economic Belt show regional differences. Rich resources and low population density have higher footprint breadth, while footprint depth is the opposite. Therefore, On the one hand, we should take a correct view of this imbalance in development because it is closely related to the development conditions such as regional resource factor endowment. Local governments should adapt their environmental policies to local conditions.

631 Moreover, the social division of labor and the industrial gradient formed by the reasonable 632 regional differences stimulate economic and social development to a certain extent. On the other hand, 633 more importantly, it is necessary to establish and improve the legal system of environmental protection 634 through macro-control, include resource consumption, ecological benefit, and other indicators into the 635 local government performance evaluation system, and accelerate the improvement of the ecological 636 compensation mechanism of the Yangtze Economic Belt. They improve environmental standards and 637 strengthen law enforcement force industrial transformation and upgrading. Enterprises should increase 638 their investment in green technology research and development through taxation and subsidies. By 639 speeding up innovation in energy conservation and environmental protection technologies, enhancing 640 the supply of clean energy, and speeding up the cultivation of talents for green scientific and 641 technological innovation, a favorable environment for scientific and technological innovation will be 642 created to facilitate sustainable development of the Yangtze Economic Belt.

643 Secondly, the spatial layout should be optimized, and the industrial structure should be adjusted. 644 The empirical results show that footprint breadth and depth promote sustainable development in a 645 specific range, and industrial structure transformation is critical. Footprint breadth depends on resource 646 endowment and land use mode. Since resource endowment is not easy to change, it is necessary to 647 adjust land use mode to improve the utilization efficiency of flow capital. In addition, the footprint 648 breadth of China's Yangtze River Economic Belt is still at a low level and shows a decreasing trend 649 year by year. Therefore, it is necessary to improve the degree of intensive land use and realize the 650 coordination between natural resource utilization and resource renewal by optimizing the spatial layout 651 of the industry. The increasing scale of construction land should be controlled and efficiently used.

Further, the stock capital consumption of all prefecture-level cities is serious, especially in the eastern delta region. Therefore, cities in the Eastern region must strengthen the protection of cultivated land, improve resource utilization efficiency, implement the transformation of old and new driving

forces, promote green energy development, and reduce fossil energy consumption. For the central cities, 655 656 it is necessary to enable the sustainable development of urbanization and promote the rational flow of 657 various production factors. Control fossil energy consumption and vigorously develop new energy 658 sources such as hydropower. The industrial structure should be adjusted reasonably to reduce the 659 proportion of secondary industry. For western cities, it is necessary to improve resource utilization 660 efficiency, protect the arable land area to improve the supply capacity, adjust the industrial structure 661 reasonably, reduce the proportion of the secondary industry, and reduce the pressure on resources and 662 the environment.

663 Our work has limitations. Especially, this paper mainly investigates the mediating effect of 664 industrial structure when examining the mechanism of footprint breadth and footprint depth on 665 sustainable development. In fact, in addition to rationalization and advancement of industrial structure, 666 there are other possible paths. In addition, since this study chooses cities as the research object, 667 sustainable development includes urban sustainability and inter-enterprise, inter-regional, and 668 inter-national sustainability. There still exists some room for further research. For example, following 669 recent literature, the dynamic effect and spatial spillover effect can also be taken into consideration to 670 discuss this topic from a new perspective.

671 672

673 Acknowledgments

We express our gratitude to the National Natural Science Foundation of China (71974077, and
72074120), and National Social Science Foundation of China (17BJY038), Shanxi Province
Philosophy and Social Science Planning Key Project (2020ZD015), and the Science and Technology
Innovation Program of Shanxi Normal University (2020XSY004) for funding supports.

678

679 **References**

- Bi, M. L., Yao, C. Y., Xie, G. D., Liu, J. Y., Qin, K. Y., 2021. Improvement and application of the
 three-dimensional ecological footprint model. Ecological Indicators, 125, 107480.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2021.107480.
- Bryan, B. A., Gao, L., Ye, Y. Q., Sun, X. F., Connor, J. D., Crossman, N. D., Mark, S., Wu, J. G., He, C.
 Y., Yu, D. Y., Liu, Z. F., Ang, L., Huang, Q. X., Ren, H., Deng, X. Z., Zheng, H., Niu, J. M., Han,
 G. D., Hou, X. Y., 2018. China's response to a national land-system sustainability emergency.
 Nature, 559(7713). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-018-0280-2.
- Carla, O., Carlos, H. A., 2011. A multi-objective multi-sectoral economy-energy-environment model:
 Application to Portugal. Energy, 36(5), 2856-2866. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2011.02.028.
- Chen, J., Wang, L. J., Li, Y. Y., 2020. Natural resources, urbanization and regional innovation
 capabilities. Resources Policy, 66, 101643. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2020.101643.
- 691 Chen, W. D., Si, W., Chen, Z. M., 2020. How technological innovations affect urban eco-efficiency in
 692 China: A prefecture-level panel data analysis. Journal of Cleaner Production, 270, 122479.
 693 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.122479.
- 694 Chen, Y., Tian, W. T., Zhou, Q., Shi, T., 2021. Spatiotemporal and driving forces of Ecological Carrying
 695 Capacity for high-quality development of 286 cities in China. Journal of Cleaner Production, 293,
 696 126186. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2021.126186.
- David, C., Elisa, D., Melanie, K., 2021. Air pollution in an urban world: A global view on density,
 cities and emissions. Ecological Economics, 189. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2021.107153.
- 699 Destek, M. A., Sinha, A., 2020. Renewable, non-renewable energy consumption, economic growth, 700 trade openness and ecological footprint: Evidence from organisation for economic Co-operation 701 and development countries. Journal of Cleaner Production, 242, 118537. 702 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118537.
- 703 Dmitry, L., Alexander, N., 2021. Investment, Capital Stock, and Replacement Cost of Assets when
 704 Economic Depreciation is Non-Geometric. Journal of Financial Economics.
 705 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfineco.2021.05.021.
- Dong, H. W., Li, P., Feng, Z. M., Yang, Y. Z., You, Z., Li, Q., 2019. Natural capital utilization on an international tourism island based on a three-dimensional ecological footprint model: A case study
 of Hainan Province, China. Ecological Indicators, 104, 479-488.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2019.04.031.
- Falahat, M., Lee, Y. Y., Ramayah T, Soto-Acosta, P., 2020. Modelling the effects of institutional support and international knowledge on competitive capabilities and international performance:
 Evidence from an emerging economy. Journal of International Management, 26(4), 100779.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intman.2020.100779.
- Fang, C. L., Ma, H. T., Wang, Z. B., Li, G. D., 2014. The sustainable development of innovative cities
 in China: Comprehensive assessment and future configuration. Journal of Geographical Sciences,
 24(6), 1095-1114. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11442-014-1141-z.

- Filippo, B., Fulvio, F., Luigi, G., 2021. The value of carbon emission reduction induced by Renewable
 Energy Sources in the Italian power market. Ecological Economics, 189, 107149.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2021.107149.
- Hansen, B. E., 1999. Threshold Effects in Non-Dynamic Panels: Estimation, Testing, and Inference.
 Journal of Econometrics, 93(2), 345-368. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-4076 (99)00025-1.
- Hou, C., Chen, H., Long, R., 2021. Coupling and coordination of China's economy, ecological
 environment and health from a green production perspective. International journal of
 Environmental Science and Technology, 2. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-021-03329-8.
- Jeffrey, W., 2001. Financial markets and the allocation of capital. Journal of Financial Economics,
 58(1), 187-214. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-405X (00)00070-2.
- Jiang, Q. H., Khattak, S. I., Rahman, Z. U., 2021. Measuring the simultaneous effects of electricity
 consumption and production on carbon dioxide emissions (CO₂e) in China: New evidence from an
 EKC-based assessment. Energy, 229, 120616. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2021.120616.
- Korhonen, J., Honkasalo, A., Seppl, J., 2018. Circular Economy: The Concept and its Limitations.
 Ecological Economics, 143, 37-46. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2017.06.041.
- Li, B., Wu, S. S., 2016. Effects of local and civil environmental regulation on green total factor
 productivity in China: A spatial Durbin econometric analysis. Journal of Cleaner Production, 2016,
 153, 342-353. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.10.042.
- Li, W. W., Wang, W. P., Wang, Y., Qin, Y. B., 2017. Industrial structure, technological progress and
 CO₂ emissions in China: Analysis based on the STIRPAT framework. Natural Hazards.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11069-017-2932-1.
- Li, Y. R., Zhang, X. C., Cao, Z., Liu, Z. J., Lu, Z., Liu, Y. S., 2021. Towards the progress of ecological
 restoration and economic development inChina's Loess Plateau and strategy for more sustainable
 development. Science of the Total Environment, 756(10), 143676.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.143676.
- Lin, Y.T., 2016. Travel costs and urban specialization patterns: Evidence fromChina's high speed
 railway system. Journal of Urban Economics, 98, 98-123.
 https.//doi.org/10.1016/j.jue.2016.11.002.
- Liu, H. L., Ling, D. 2020. Value Chain Reconstruction and Sustainable Development of Green
 Manufacturing Industry. Sustainable Computing: Informatics and Systems, 28, 100418.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.suscom.2020.100418.
- Liu, M. D., Tan, R. P., Zhang B., 2021. The costs of "blue sk": Environmental regulation, technology
 upgrading, and labor demand in China. Journal of Development Economics, 150(4), 102610.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2020.102610.
- Liu, Y., Yang, L. Y., Jiang, W., 2020. Coupling coordination and spatiotemporal dynamic evolution
 between social economy and water environmental quality A case study from Nansi Lake
 catchment, China. Ecological Indicators, 119(5), 106870.
 https.//doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2020.106870.
- Liu, Y. Z., Martinez, J., Wu, A. M., 2017. Fiscal decentralization, equalization, and intra-provincial
 inequality in China. International Tax & Public Finance, 24(2), 248-281.

- Long, X. Y., Yu, H. J., Sun, M. X., Wang, X. C., Jiří, J. K., Xie, W., Wang, C. D., Li, W. Q., Wang, Y. T.,
 2020. Sustainability evaluation based on the Three-dimensional Ecological Footprint and Human
 Development Index: A case study on the four island regions in China. Journal of Environmental
 Management, 265. https.//doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.110509.
- Lu, X. H., Jiang, X., Gong, M. Q., 2020. How land transfer marketization influence on green total
 factor productivity from the approach of industrial structure? Evidence from China. Land Use
 Policy, 95, 104610. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2020.104610.
- 765 Mahmood, A., Jiang, P., Abdul M., Muhammad, U., Zeeshan, K., Sulaman, M., 2020. The dynamic 766 impact of natural resources, technological innovations and economic growth on ecological 767 An advanced panel data estimation. Resources 69. footprint: Policy, 768 https://doi.org/10.16/j.resourpol.2020.101817.
- Maria, S. M., Alessandro, G., Luca, C., Valentina, N., David, L., Federico, M. P., Simone, B., Nadia, M.,
 2018. Exploring ecosystem services assessment through Ecological Footprint accounting.
 Ecosystem Services, 30, 228-235. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2018.01.010.
- Milligan, B., Michelle, O., 2018. Global Governance of Resources and Implications for Resource
 Efficiency in Europe. Ecological Economics, 155, 46-58.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2018.01.007.
- Patricia, E., Satish, J., 2005. Ecological Economics: Principles and Applications. Ecological Economics,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2005.08.005.
- Preacher, K. J., Hayes, A. F., 2004. SPSS and SAS procedures for estimating indirect effects in simple
 mediation models. Behavior Research Methods Instruments & Computers, 36(4), 717-731.
 https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03206553.
- Qu, S., Wang, L. C., Lin, A., Zhu, H. J., Yuan, M. X., 2018. What drives the vegetation restoration in
 Yangtze River basin, China: Climate change or anthropogenic factors? Ecological Indicators, 90,
 438-450. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.03.029.
- Ran, Q. Y., Zhang, J. N., Hao, Y., 2020. Does environmental decentralization exacerbateChina's carbon
 emissions? Evidence based on dynamic threshold effect analysis. Science of the Total
 Environment, 721, 137656. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.137656.
- Ren, W. H., Ji, J. Y., 2021. How do environmental regulation and technological innovation affect the
 sustainable development of marine economy: New evidence fromChina's coastal provinces and
 cities. Marine Policy, 128. https://doi.org/10.1016/10.1016/j.marpol.2021.104468.
- Roger, C., Anabel, S., Richard, J. H., Hermine, M., Jacopo. A. B., Marta, O., Annelies, B., Bernadette,
 K., Nicu, C. T., 2021. Guiding cities under increased droughts: The limits to sustainable urban
 futures. Ecological Economics, 189. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2021.107140.
- Sergei, S., Nina, B., Andreas, L., Robert, F., 2019. Economic benefits from plant species diversity in
 intensively managed grasslands. Ecological Economics, 168.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2019.106488.
- Shao, S., Hu, Z. G., Cao, J. H.Yang, L. L., Guan, D. B., 2020. Environmental Regulation and
 Enterprise Innovation: A Review. Business Strategy and the Environment, 29(7).

⁷⁵⁷ https://doi.org/10.1007/s10797-016-9416-1.

- 797 https://doi.org/10.1002/bse.2446.
- Shunsuke, M., Shinji, K., 2009. Environmental performance and returns to pollution abatement in
 China. Ecological Economics, 68(6), 1643-1651. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2008.04.005.
- Simone, B., Luca, C., Federico. M., 2016. The input-state-output model and related indicators to
 investigate the relationships among environment, society and economy. Ecological Modelling,
 84-88. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2014.10.015.
- Tang, D. C., Tang, J. X., Xiao, Z., Ma, T. Y., Brandon, J., 2017. Environmental regulation efficiency
 and total factor productivity—Effect analysis based on Chinese data from 2003 to 2013.
 Ecological Indicators, 73, 312-318. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2016.08.040.
- Tao, Z. N., Geoffrey, H., Kieran, D., 2010. An economic analysis of Midwestern US criteria pollutant
 emissions trends from 1970 to 2000. Ecological Economics, 69(8), 1666-1674.
 https.//doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2010.03.016.
- Tian, P., Wu, H. Q., Yang, T. T., Jiang, F. L., Zhang, W. J., Zhu, Z. L., Yue, Q. M., Liu, M. X., Xu, X. Y.,
 2021. Evaluation of urban water ecological civilization: A case study of three urban
 agglomerations in the Yangtze River Economic Belt, China. Ecological Indicators, 123.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2021.107351.
- Usman, O., Akadiri, S. S., Adeshola, I., 2020. Role of renewable energy and globalization on ecological
 footprint in the USA: implications for environmental sustainability. Environmental Science and
 Pollution Research, 27(24), 30681-30693. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-09170-9.
- Wang, H., Huang, J. J., Zhou, H., Deng, C. B., Fang, C. L., 2020. Analysis of sustainable utilization of
 water resources based on the improved water resources ecological footprint model: A case study of
 Hubei Province, China. Journal of Environmental Management, 262.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.110331.
- Wang, J. Y., Wei, X. M., Guo, Q., 2018. A three-dimensional evaluation model for regional carrying
 capacity of ecological environment to social economic development: Model development and a
 case study in China. Ecological Indicators. 89, 348-355.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.02.005.
- Wang, Z. H., Sun, Y. F., Wang, B., 2019. How does the new-type urbanisation affect CO₂ emissions in
 China? An empirical analysis from the perspective of technological progress. Energy Economics,
 80, 917-927. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eneco.2019.02.017.
- Wu, H. T., Ren, S. Y., Yan, G. Y., Hao, Y., 2020. DoesChina's outward direct investment improve green
 total factor productivity in the"Belt and Roa" countries? Evidence from dynamic threshold panel
 model analysis. Journal of Environmental Management, 275.
 https.//doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.111295.
- Xu, Z. C., Sophia, N., Chen, X.Z., Zhang, J., Li, Y. J., Thomas, D., Wang, J. Y., Julie, A., Fan, F.,
 Huang, B. R., Li, S. X., Wu, S. H., Anna, H., Tang, Y., Hong, D. Q., Li, Y. K., Liu, J. G., 2020.
 Assessing progress towards sustainable development over space and time. Nature. 577(7788),
 74-78. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-019-1846-3.
- Xun, F. F., Hu, Y. C., 2019. Evaluation of ecological sustainability based on a revised three-dimensional
 ecological footprint model in Shandong Province, China. Science of the Total Environment, 649,

- 837 582-591. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.08.116.
- Yang, Y., Hu, D., 2018. Natural capital utilization based on a three-dimensional ecological footprint
 model: A case study in northern Shaanxi, China. Ecological Indicators, 87, 178-188.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2017.12.010.
- Yu, M. Z., Deng, X., 2021. The Inheritance of Marketization Level and Regional Human Capital
 Accumulation: Evidence from China. Finance Research Letters, 2, 102268.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.frl.2021.102268.
- 844 Zahoor, A., Muhammad, M. A., Muhammad, N. M., Kishwar, N., 2020. Moving towards a sustainable 845 environment: The dynamic linkage between natural resources, human capital, urbanization, 846 economic growth, and ecological footprint in China. Policy, Resources 67. 847 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2020.101677.
- Zhang, C., Anadon, L. D., 2014. A multi-regional input–output analysis of domestic virtual water trade
 and provincial water footprint in China. Ecological Economics, 100(2), 159-172.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2014.02.006.
- Zhang, Z. X., Li, Y., 2020. Coupling coordination and spatiotemporal dynamic evolution between
 urbanization and geological hazards–A case study from China. Science of the Total Environment,
 728, 138825. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138825.
- Wu, S. M., Li, L., Li, S. T., 2018. Natural resource abundance, natural resource-oriented industry
 dependence, and economic growth: Evidence from the provincial level in China. Resources,
 Conservation and Recycling. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2018.08.012.
- Zhao, D. F., Li, C. B., Wang, Q. Q., Yuan, J. H., 2020. Comprehensive evaluation of national electric
 power development based on cloud model and entropy method and TOPSIS: A case study in 11
 countries. Journal of Cleaner Production, 277, 123190.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.123190.
- Zhao, X. S., John, G., Chen, Q.M., 2010. Reconsidering Baron and Kenny: Myths and Truths about
 Mediation Analysis. Journal of Consumer Research, 37(2), 197-206.
 https://doi.org/10.1086/651257.
- Zheng, W., Patrick, P. P., 2019. Economic growth, urbanization and energy consumption A provincial
 level analysis of China. Energy Economics, 80. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.eneco.2019.01.004.
- Zhu, B. Z., Wang, K. F., Julien, C., Wang, P., Wei, Y. M., 2015. Can China achieve its carbon intensity
 target by 2020while sustaining economic growth? Ecological Economics, 119, 209-216.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2015.08.015.